

The Sankhya Darshana

Translation and Commentary by John Wells

Copyright 2009

Chapter One

The Author's Exposition

अथ त्रिविधदुःखात्यन्तनिवृत्तिरत्यन्तपुरुषार्थः । न दृष्टात्तत्सिद्धिर्निवृत्तेऽप्यनुवृत्तिदर्श-
नात् । प्रात्याहिकक्षुत्प्रतीकरवत्प्रतीकरचेष्टनात्पुरुषार्थत्वम् । सर्वासम्भवात्सम्भवेऽपि
सत्तासम्भवाद्धेयः प्रमाणकुषलैः । उत्कर्षादपि मोक्षस्य सर्वोत्कर्षश्रुतेः । अविशेषश्चो-
भयोः । न स्वभावतो बद्धस्य मोक्षसाधनोपदेशविधिः । स्वभावस्यानपायित्वादननुष्ठान-
लक्षणमप्रामाण्यम् । नाशक्योपदेशविधिरुपदिष्टेऽप्यनुपदेशः ।

1.1 *atha* now **trividha-duḥkha-atyanta-nivṛtīḥ** threefold – suffering – ultimate – turning back, cessation **atyanta-puruṣa-arthaḥ** ultimate – human being, person – aim, purpose, desire, interest, meaning **1.2** *na* not **dr̥ṣṭāt** (abl. through) that which is seen, taught, known, learned, learned knowledge **tat-siddhiḥ** that – accomplishing **nivṛtte** (loc. upon, after) turned back **api** even **anuvṛtti-darśanāt** (abl. known from) returning – observing, seeing

1.3 *prātyāhika-kṣut-pratikāra-vat* (vati like) daily – hunger – counteracting **tat-pratikāra-ceṣṭanāt** (abl. through) of that – counteracting – making an effort, doing **puruṣa-artha-tvam** person – purpose – state of being **1.4** *sarva-asambhavāt* (abl. since) for everyone – not possible **sambhave_ api** (loc. with api; even though) possible **sattā-asambhavāt** (abl. because) its being true, that it is true – impossible **heyāḥ** rejected **pramāṇa-kuśalaiḥ** (inst. by) standard of truth, formal proof – experts, authorities

1.5 *utkarṣāt* (abl. out of) the best **api** even **mokṣasya** (gen.) of liberation **sarva-utkarṣa-śruteḥ** (abl. known from) (over) all – superiority – scripture **1.6** *aviśeṣaḥ* undistinguished, common **ca** indeed **ubhayoḥ** in both cases **1.7** *na* not **svabhāvataḥ** from the natural state **baddhasya** (gen. of) bound **mokṣa-sādhanā-upadeśa-vidhiḥ** liberation – bringing about – teaching – vedi instruction

1.8 *svabhāvasya* (gen. of) one's natural state **anapāyitvāt** (abl. because) not-going-away-ness, persistence **ananuṣṭhāna-lakṣaṇam** non-observance, neglect – characterized by **aprāmāṇyam** lack of having proof, not credible

1.9 *na* no **a-śakya-upadeśa-vidhiḥ** not – able to be done – teaching – Vedic instruction **upadiṣṭe** (loc. if) taught **api** even **an-upadeśaḥ** not – teaching

(The author says:) **1.1 Now, the ultimate purpose (see VD 1.1) of a human being (puruṣa) is the ultimate cessation of threefold suffering. 1.2 That it cannot be accomplished through what is *learned* (dṛṣṭa), is known from seeing it return even after it is turned back.**

(The opponent says:) **1.3 The state that is the purpose of a human being comes about through what is *done* (ritual karmas) to counteract that (suffering), like counteracting daily hunger, 1.4 (so) it (your thesis) is rejected by (us) authorities in formal proof, because of the impossibility of its being true; since, though possible, it is not possible for everyone.**

(The author:) **1.5 It is known from the scripture on the superiority of liberation over all, even out of the best of those (efforts), 1.6 that indeed in both cases (what is learned and what is done) it is just a common thing. 1.7 That (liberation) does not arise from the natural state of one who is bound (but) there is Vedic instruction (see VD 1.2, 9.18) teaching the bringing about of liberation.**

(The opponent:) **1.8 Something characterized by non-observance (of karmas) lacks proof, because there would be persistence of that natural state (of bondage).**

(The author:) **1.9 Well, that Vedic instruction does not teach something that can't be done. Even if such a thing were taught, it would not be that (Vedic) teaching.**

शुक्लपटवद्वीजवच्चेत् । शक्त्युद्भवानुद्भवाभ्यां नाशक्त्युपदेशः । न कालयोगतो व्यापिनो
नित्यस्य सर्वसम्बन्धात् । न देशयोगतोऽप्यस्मात् । नावस्थातो देहधर्मत्वात्तस्याः ।
असङ्गोऽयं पुरुष इति । न कर्मणान्यधर्मत्वादतिप्रसक्तेश्च । विचित्रभोगानुपपत्तिरन्य-
धर्मत्वे । प्रकृतिनिबन्धनाच्चेन्न तस्या अपि पारतन्त्र्यम् ।

1.10 śukla-paṭavat (like the) white – cloth **bijavat** (like the) seed **cet** if (you say, you think) then

1.11 śakti-udbhava-anudbhavābhyām (abl. because, for) power, ability – manifest – unmanifest **na** not **aśakya-upadeśaḥ** impracticable, incapable of being done – teaching **1.12 na** no **kāla-yogatas** (tasil through) a time period – connection with **vyāpinaḥ** (abl. since) all-pervading **nityasya** (gen. point of view;

for) the eternal **sarva-sambandhāt** (abl. because) all – (with sarva) "common to" **1.13 na** no **deśa-yogatas** (tasil through) connection with place **api_ asmāt** (ind.) for the same reason **1.14 na** no **avasthātas** (tasil through) life circumstance (fem.) **deha-dharma-tvāt** (abl. since) body – role – being **tasyāḥ** (abl. known from; fem. referring to avasthā) that **1.15 asaṅgaḥ** unattached, unconnected **ayam** this **puruṣaḥ** human being, person **iti** "called", used to frame a quote or definition **1.16 na** not **karmanā** (inst. through) action **anya-dharmatvāt** (abl. because) the other – role – being **ati-prasakteḥ** (abl. by) excessive – attachment, clinging **ca** even **1.17 vicitra-bhoga-anupapattiḥ** (f.) manifold, diverse – enjoyment – inapplicability **anya-dharmatve** (loc. where it concerns) other – role **1.18 prakṛti-nibandhanāt** (abl. through) nature (fem.) – dependence on (ifc) – **cet** even if (you think) / **na** it is not **tasyāḥ** (abl. from; fem. referring to prakṛti) that **api** indeed **pāra-tantryam** something other – dependence

(The author continues:) **1.10 Even if you think it is like a white cloth, (or) like a seed, then (the reply is this):**

1.11 It is not a teaching of something that can't be done, for there is manifestation and non-manifestation of the ability (in a person). 1.12 For an eternal being, it (the bondage 1.8) is not through connection with any time period because, since he is all-pervading, he is common to all (times), 1.13 nor is it through connection with any place, for the same reason. 1.14 It (bondage) is not through life circumstance, since (only) the role of the body is known from that. 1.15 The one we call "the human being" (in 1.1) is this unattached one. 1.16 Not through karma (is he attached), even by excessive clinging, because of that being the dharma of the other thing (the body). 1.17 Enjoyment (or not) of the diverse (world), where it concerns the dharma of the other thing, would (also) be inapplicable. 1.18 Even if you think it (his attachment) is through dependence on nature, it is not, (since) from that (nature) there would (also) be dependence on something other than him.

The word "ability" in sutra 1.11 refers to liberation, He is saying that this liberation is not a permanent state but a constant opportunity, and that the bondage and one's liberation from it are not dependent on time, place, life circumstance (caste), karmas (religious rites), or any worldly enjoyment as a supposed reward for faithfully practicing them.

Chapter Two

The Connection

न नित्यशुद्धबुद्धमुक्तस्वभावस्य तद्योगस्तद्योगादृते ॥ displaced text ॥ नानादिविषयोप-
रागनिमित्तकोऽप्यस्य। न बाह्याभ्यन्तरयोरुपरज्योपरञ्जकभावोऽपि देशव्यवधानाच्छ्रु-
स्थपाटलिपुत्रस्थयोरिव। द्वयोरेकदेशलब्धोपरागान्न व्यवस्था। अदृष्टवशाच्चेत्। न द्वयो-
रेककालायोगादुपकार्योपकारकभावः ॥ displaced text ॥ युगपज्जायमानयोर्न कार्यकार-
णभावः। पूर्वापाय उत्तरायोगात्। तद्भावे तदयोगादुभयव्यभिचारादपि न ।

2.1 (1.19) **na** no more **nitya-śuddha-buddha – mukta-svabhāvasya** (gen. of, for) forever – pure – consciousness – freed – natural state (*This compound, which is the opponent's response to "nityasya" in sutra 1.12, is tat-puruṣa, not itaretara dvandva. The term "mukta-svabhāvasya", referring back to "svabhāvasya" in 1.8, is similar to words like "muktabandhana" and "muktaroṣa". MW*) **tat-yogaḥ** to that – connection **tat-yogāt_ṛte** (abl. w/ṛte) to that – relation, connection – without (*Sutras 1.20-26 have been restored to their original place in Chapter Four.*)

2.2 (1.27) **na** not **anādi-viśaya-uparāga-nimittakaḥ** preexisting (having no beginning) – sphere (objects of the senses and mind) – influencing – caused by **api** yet **asya** (gen. of, for) him (*recalls the genitive compound in 2.1.*) **2.3** (1.28) **na** no **bāhya-abhyantarayoḥ** (loc. dual; "between the two") outer – inner **uparajya-uparañjaka-bhāvaḥ** influenced – influencer – state of being, relationship **api** indeed, in fact **deśa-vyavadhānāt** (abl. because) place – separateness **śrugna-stha-pāṭaliputra-sthayoḥ** (loc. between) living in Śrughna (Srughna MW) – living in Pāṭaliputra **iva** like **2.4** (1.29) **dvayoḥ** (gen/loc. dual) between two things **eka-deśa-labdha-uparāgāt** (abl. inferred from) same – place – found – influence **na** no such **vyavasthā** respective difference. **2.5** (1.30) **adr̥ṣṭa-vaśāt** (abl. through) unknown – authority, will **cet** if (you think) ... well then **2.6** (1.31) **na** no **dvayoḥ** (gen/loc. dual) between the two **eka – kāla-ayogāt** (abl. because) a unique or singular thing, a certain thing – time period – disjunction **upakārya-upakāraka-bhāvaḥ** receiving help – bestowing help – relationship (*Sutras 1.32-37 on the ceremony for a son, etc. have been moved to their original place in Chapter Fifteen.*) **2.7** (1.38) **yugapad-jāyamānayoḥ** (loc. dual; of two things) linked by time (not "simultaneous") – coming into existence **na** there cannot be **kārya-kāraṇa-bhāvaḥ** effect – cause – relationship **2.8** (1.39) **pūrva-apāye** (loc. when,

upon the) former – passing away **uttara-ayogāt** (abl. from) latter – disjunction (*The words "former" and "latter" here refer to the word order in 2.7 and not to the relative priority and posteriority of cause and effect.*) **2.9** (1.40) **tat-bhāve** (loc. upon) that – coming into existence **tat-ayogāt** (abl. from) that – disjunction **ubhaya-vyabhicārāt** (abl. because) in both cases – false reasoning **api** (or) even **na** there is no (none)

(The opponent:) **2.1 For one who is freed from his natural state (of bondage), his consciousness pure forever, without any more connection to that (karma 1.16, nature 1.18), there would be no more connection to (all) that (diverse world 1.17).**

(The author:) **2.2 Yet that (connection) for this (freed) one is *not* caused by that (karma) influencing him in the sphere of the preexisting (world). 2.3 In fact, there is no relationship of influenced and influencer between that outer thing (life circumstance 1.14) and that inner thing (karma 1.16), because of the separateness of *place*, like that between someone living in Śrughna and someone living in Pāṭaliputra, 2.4 (i.e.,) there is no such respective difference (of influenced vs. influencer) because any such influence between two things would be found in the same place. 2.5 If you think that it (the connection) is through an unknown authority (a bestower); 2.6 well, there is no relationship of receiving and bestowing between the two (the human being and nature), because of a certain disjunction in *time*: 2.7 that there cannot be a relationship of effect and cause where there are two things coming into existence linked by time, 2.8 whether from the disjunction of the latter (the cause) upon the passing away of the former (the effect) (material cause), 2.9 or even from the disjunction of that (latter, cause) upon the coming into existence of that (former, effect) (instrumental cause); because of false reasoning in both cases, there is none (no relation of effect and cause)**

पूर्वभावमात्रे न नियमः। न विज्ञानमात्रं बाह्यप्रतीतेः ॥ displaced text ॥ न गतिविशेषात्।
निष्क्रियस्य तदसम्भवात्। मूर्त्तत्वाद्धटादिवत्समानधर्मापत्तावपसिद्धान्तः। गतिश्रुतिरप्यु-
पाधियोगादाकाशवत्। न कर्मणाप्यतद्धर्मत्वात्। अतिप्रसक्तिरन्यधर्मत्वे। निर्गुणादिश्रुति-
विरोधश्चेति ।

2.10 (1.41) **pūrva-bhāva-mātre** (loc. regarding) former – existing – alone **na** no **niyamaḥ** rule **2.11** (1.42) **na** no **viññāna-mātram** knowing – on its own **bāhya-pratīteḥ** (abl. because) from the external – following as a necessary result (1.43-47 on emptiness has been restored to its original place in Chapter Sixteen.)

2.12 (1.48) **na** not **gati-viśeṣāt** (abl. through) going, migration – a certain kind **2.13** (1.49) **niṣkriyasya** (gen. on the part of) the actionless **tat-asambhavāt** (abl. because) that – incompatible **2.14** (1.50) **mūrt(t)atvāt** (abl. because) in material form – being, would be **ghaṭa-ādivat** (vati like) pot – etc. **samāna-dharma-āpattau** (loc. where) same, like – role – becoming, taking on **apasiddhāntaḥ** contrary to what is established **2.15** (1.51) **gati-śrutiḥ** motion – scripture **api** rather **upādhi-yogāt** (abl. coming from) representation – relation to **ākāśavat** (vati "it (he) is like") the ether **2.16** (1.52) **na** not **karmaṇā** (inst. through) action **api** either **a-tat-dharmatvāt** (abl. because of) not – his (puruṣa's) – being the inherent nature, role **2.17** (1.53) **atiprasaktiḥ** excessive attachment **anya-dharmatve** (loc. in) other – role – being **2.18** (1.54) **nirguṇa-ādi-śruti-virodhaḥ** without qualities – etc. – scripture – inconsistent with **ca** and **iti** said

(The opponent:) **2.10** There is no rule regarding the former (the effect, the human being) existing on his own. **2.11** There is no knowing on its own, because it follows from the external.

(The author:) **2.12** It (the connection 2.1) is not through a certain (trans)migration (re-incarnation) **2.13** on the part of the actionless one (the human being), because he is incompatible with that. **2.14** It is contrary to what is established, because he would be in material form, where he would take on the same dharma (as the material), like a pot, etc. **2.15** He is like the ether (not a pot), the scripture on migration coming rather from his relation to a *representation* (see 7.13-14). **2.16** It is not through karma either, because of its not being his dharma. **2.17** Excessive attachment lies in being the dharma of the other (the body 1.16-17, 3.3), **2.18** and it is inconsistent with the scripture on the one who is without qualities, etc. Thus it is said.

Chapter Three

The Principles

तद्योगोऽप्यविवेकान्न समानत्वम् ॥ विपर्ययाद्बन्धः ॥ नियतकारणात्तदुच्छित्तिर्ध्वान्तवत्।
 प्रधानाविवेकादन्याविवेकस्य तद्धाने हानम्। वाङ्मात्रं न तु तत्त्वं चित्तस्थितेः। युक्तितो-
 ऽपि न बाध्यते दिङ्मूढवदपरोक्षादृते। अचाक्षुषाणामनुमानेन बोधो धूमादिभिरिव वह्नेः।
 सत्त्वरजस्तमसां साम्यावस्था प्रकृतिः प्रकृतेर्महान्महतोऽहंकारोऽहंकारात्पञ्च तन्मात्रा-
 ण्युभयमिन्द्रियं तन्मात्रेभ्यः स्थूलभूतानि पुरुष इति ॥ पञ्चविंशतिर्गणः ॥ स्थूलात्पञ्चतन्मा-
 त्रस्य। बाह्याभ्यन्तराभ्यां तैश्चाहंकारस्य। तेनान्तःकरणस्य ततः प्रकृतेः।

3.1 (1.55) **tat-yogaḥ** his – connection (of bondage) **api** rather **avivekāṭ** non-distinguishing (abl. arising from) **na** not **samānatvam** the same **3.2** (1.56) [*viparyayāt bandhaḥ; For it is the opposite. It is bondage.*] **niyata-kāraṇāt** (abl. through) checked – cause **tat-ucchittiḥ** of it – cutting apart, dispelling **dhvāntavat** (vati "like") darkness **3.3** (1.57) **pradhāna-avivekāṭ** (abl. arising from) principal – not distinguishing **anya-avivekasya** (gen. for) other (*this still refers to the body; see 1.14-16, 2.17*) – non-distinguishing **tat-hāne** (loc. when) that – rid of **hānam** riddance **3.4** (1.58) **vāc-mātram** speech – merely **na** not **tu** but **tattvam** reality **citta-sthiteḥ** (abl. because) thought – abides in, is in the domain of **3.5** (1.59) **yuktitaḥ** by reasoning **api** even though **na** not **bādhyate** to be conquered **diṅmūḍhavat** (vati like) directions (diś) – confusion **aparokṣāt_rte** (abl. w/ṛte; "without") direct seeing or awareness (*an interesting quadruple negation "not without non-invisibility"*) **3.6** (1.60) **acākṣuṣāṇām** (gen. of) things not physically seen **anumānena** (inst. by means of) inference **bodhaḥ** knowing **dhūma-ādibhiḥ** (inst. by means of) smoke – etc. **iva** like **vahneḥ** (gen. of) fire **3.7** (1.61) **sattva-rajas-tamasām** (gen. pl. of) satva (sattva) – rajas – tamas **sāmya-avasthā** equilibrium – state **prakṛtiḥ** prime originator / **prakṛteḥ** (abl. from) **mahān** the great (consciousness) / **mahataḥ** (abl. arising out of) **ahaṅkāraḥ** personal identity, personal consciousness / **ahaṅkārāt** (abl. arising out of) **pañca-tanmātrāṇi** five subtle elements or sensations (literally, "the measure of it") **ubhayam** both **indriyam** (power) / **tanmātrebhyaḥ** (abl. arising out of) sensations **sthūla-bhūtāni** gross – elements **puruṣaḥ** human being **iti** thus [*pañcaviṃśatiḥ gaṇaḥ; It is a group of twenty-five.*] (*I doubt this is authentic.*

"*Puruṣaḥ iti*" is a fitting end for this important sutra and the number twenty-five is both incorrect and superfluous, a typical teacher's note.) **3.8** (1.62) **sthūlāt** (abl. from) the gross **pañca-tanmātrasya** (gen. abbr. (*ref=anumān- 3.6*) that of) five – subtle elements, sensations (1.63) **bāhya-abhyantarābhyām** (abl. dual; from) the outer – the inner **taīḥ** (inst. pl. along with) those **ca** and **ahankārasya** (gen. abbr. (*ref=anumān- 3.6*) that of) personal identity **3.9** (1.64) **tena** (instr.) by that means **antaḥ-karaṇasya** (gen. abbr. (*ref=anumān- 3.6*) that of) internal, inner – creator (1.65) **tataḥ** (tasil abl.) from which **prakṛteḥ** (gen. abbr. (*ref=anumān- 3.6*) that of) prime originator

(The author speaks without opposition in this chapter.)

3.1 The connection (bondage) on his part (see 2.1-2) **arises rather from not distinguishing (aviveka), which is not the same (as the other possibilities).**
3.2 Like darkness, the dispelling of it is through the cause being checked.
3.3 It is from not distinguishing the principal thing (prakṛti vs. puruṣa 3.13-14) that there arises the notion that one would be rid of non-distinguishing on the part of that other (the body 2.17) when he is rid of that (connection), 3.4 which is mere talk, but not the reality, because that (notion) is in the domain of thought. 3.5 Even though that (non-distinguishing) is not to be conquered by reasoning, like confusion over directions, without direct awareness, 3.6 there is knowing through inference of things that aren't physically seen, like that of fire by smoke and so on. 3.7 (Our thesis is:) 'Prime originator' means a state of equilibrium of truth, passion, and dullness; from the (concept of a) prime originator (we know) it is the great (consciousness) (see 3.13); out of the great (consciousness) arises a personal consciousness; out of the personal consciousness there arise the five sensations; (and) out of the sensations there arise the gross elements. Thus (is known) the human being. 3.8 (Our inference is:) that of the five sensations, from (seeing) the gross, (see VD 1.4-8, etc.), and that of a personal identity, from (recognizing) the outer and the inner (powers, the indriyas) along with those (five). 3.9 By that means, there is that (inference) of an inner creator (the great consciousness) (see VD 8.15), from which there is that (inference) of (its being) the prime originator.

संहतपरार्थत्वात्पुरुषस्य। मूले मूलाभावादमूलं मूलम्। पारम्पर्येऽप्येकत्र परिनिष्ठेति

संज्ञामात्रम्। समानः प्रकृतेर्द्वयोः। अधिकारित्रैविध्यान्न नियमः। महदाख्यमाद्यं कार्यं

तन्मनः। चरमोऽहंकारः। तत्कार्यत्वमुत्तरेषाम्। आद्यहेतुता तद्वारा पारम्पर्येऽप्यणुवत्।
पूर्वभावित्वे द्वयोरेकतरस्य हानेऽन्यतरयोगः।

3.10 (1.66) **samhata-para-artha-tvāt** (abl. because) aggregate – separate, apart – for the benefit – being **puruṣasya** (gen. abbr. (*ref=anumān- 3.6*) that of) human being **3.11** (1.67) **mūle** (loc. there, to) a foundation **mūla-abhāvāt** (abl. because) foundation – no such thing **amūlam** without foundation **mūlam** **3.12** (1.68) **pāramparye** (loc. in) a continuous series **api** really **ekatra** in one place **pariniṣṭhā** (f. nom. s.) limit **iti** said to be, given **saṁjñā-mātram** name – merely, just **3.13** (1.69) **samānaḥ** (with gen.) equal **prakṛteḥ** (gen. of) prime originator, nature **dvayoḥ** (loc. in regard to) those two (1.70) **adhikāri** the one of authority **traividhyāt** (abl. by) threefoldness **na** not **niyamaḥ** ruled **3.14** (1.71) **mahat-ākhyam** great – called ādyam first **kāryam** effect **tat-manaḥ** his – mind **3.15** (1.72) **caramaḥ** the outer thing **ahamkāraḥ** the personal identity **3.16** (1.73) **tat-kāryatvam** his – effect – being **uttareṣām** (gen. belonging to) those subsequent things **3.17** (1.74) **ādya-hetu-tā** the first – a reason, a basis for knowing – being **tat-dvārā** (inst. by) (of) them – means **pāramparye** (loc. within) series **api** but **aṇuvat** (vati like) atomic **3.18** (1.75) **pūrvabhāvitve** (loc. in relation to) the preceding state of being **dvayoḥ** (loc. as for) the two, the pair **ekatarasya** (gen. of) one of them **hāne** (loc. where) leaving off, quitting **anyatara-yogaḥ** the other – association, relevance

3.10 Because of that aggregate being for the benefit of something apart from it, there is that (inference) of (its being) the human spirit, **3.11** (but) because there is no such thing as a foundation to a foundation, our foundation (mahat) is without any (further) foundation. **3.12** It ("foundation") is really just the name given to the limit at that one place in the series. **3.13** The one of authority (mahat) is not ruled by that threefoldness (prakṛti), (being), in regard to those two (mahat and prakṛti), the equal of that prime originator. **3.14** Called "mahat" (see 3.7 and Vaisheshika 4.4, 7.5), he is the first (the principal), his mind (just) an effect, **3.15** the personal identity (just) the outer thing. **3.16** Being his effect belongs to those subsequent things (the powers 3.7), **3.17** that are like the atomic though within the series, being a basis for knowing the first (mahat) by means of them, (see VD 1.12-13) **3.18** (but) as for those two (sets of powers 3.7) in relation to the state preceding them (mahat), upon quitting of the one (that pair) there is (still) association with the other (the state of being mahat).

Chapter Four

Two Views of Reality

परिच्छिन्नं न सर्वोपादानम्। तदुत्पत्तिश्चुतेश्च। नावस्तुनो वस्तुसिद्धिः ॥ (restored) नावि-
द्यातोऽप्यवस्तुना बन्धायोगात्। वस्तुत्वे सिद्धान्तहानिः। विजातीयद्वैतापत्तिश्च। विरुद्धो-
भयरूपा चेत्। न तादृक्पदार्थाप्रतीतिः ॥ अबाधाददुष्टकारणजन्यत्वाच्च नावस्तुत्वम्।

4.1 (1.76) **paricchinnam** disjunct, separate **na** not **sarva-upādānam** all this – included, accepted as the self **4.2** (1.77) **tat-utpatti-śruteḥ** (abl. according to) of it – origin – scripture **ca** indeed **4.3** (1.78) **na** not **avastunaḥ** (abl. from) unreal **vastu-siddhiḥ** real – establishment, bringing about **4.4** (1.20) **na** not **avidyātaḥ_āpi** (tasil resulting from) lack of higher knowledge - in fact **avastunā** (instr. coming about by means of) something unreal **bandha-ayogāt** (abl. because) bondage – non-fit **4.5** (1.21) **vastutve** (n. loc. if it were considered) being reality **siddhānta-hāniḥ** established doctrine(s) – rejection **4.6** (1.22) **vijāṭīya-dvaita-āpattiḥ** other tribes or schools – dualism – falling, descent into **ca** and **4.7** (1.23) **viruddha-ubhaya-rūpā** (f.) opposite(s) – both – form **cet** if (you say) **4.8** (1.24) **na** it is not **tadṛś-padārtha-apratīteḥ** (abl. because) such a thing – word meaning – unintelligible

4.9 (1.79) **abādhāt** (abl. because) not excluded **aduṣṭa-kāraṇa-janya-tvāt** (abl. known from) uncorrupted, innocent – source, cause – arising from – the state **ca** and / **na** not (*not cana*) **avastutvam** unreality, something unreal

(The opponent:) **4.1** It is separate, not accepted unto oneself, **4.2** according to the scripture on the origin of it. **4.3** There is no bringing about something real from something unreal. **4.4** It does not come about by means of something unreal because that doesn't fit with bondage. In fact, that (notion) results from a lack of higher knowledge. **4.5** If that were considered to be reality, there would be rejection of those established doctrines (scripture 4.2). **4.6** and descent into the dualism of other schools. **4.7** If you say it *is* such a (dual) form, consisting of both of these opposites together (real and unreal), **4.8** well it is not, because the meaning of such words is unintelligible.

(The author:) **4.9** Because there is no such exclusion (of dualism), and because there *is* that state arising from innocence of the cause (of bondage), this is not something unreal.

॥ (restored text) न वयं षट्पदार्थवादिनो वैशेषिकादिवत्। अनियतत्वेऽपि नायौक्तिकस्य संग्रहोऽन्यथा बालोन्मत्तादिसमत्वम्॥ भावे तद्योगेन तत्सिद्धिरभावे तदभावात्कुतस्तरां तत्सिद्धिः। न कर्मण उपादानायोगात्। नानुश्रविकादपि तत्सिद्धिः साध्यत्वेनावृत्तियोगादपुरुषार्थत्वम्। तत्र प्राप्तविवेकस्यानावृत्तिश्रुतिः। दुःखाद्दुःखं जलाभिषेकवन्न जाड्यविमोक्तः। काम्येऽकाम्येऽपि साध्यत्वाविशेषात्। निजमुक्तस्य बन्धध्वंसमात्रं परं न समानत्वम्।

4.10 (1.25) **na** not **vayam** we **ṣaṭ-pada-artha-vādināḥ** (plural) six – words – meaning – advocates **vaiśeṣika-ādi-vat** (vati "like") Vaisheshika – etc. **4.11** (1.26) **aniyatatve** (loc. if) not fixed or established – being **api** even **na** nor **ayauktikasya** (gen. of) unfitting, unworkable / **saṅgrahaḥ** congregation **anyathā** otherwise **bāla-unmatta-ādi-sama-tvam** child-like, simple, naive – overcome with fantasy, crazy, enraptured – etc. – equal to – being **4.12** (1.80) **bhāve** (loc. if) something exists **tat-yogena** (inst. through) that **tat-siddhiḥ** it – bringing (brought) about **abhāve** (loc. if) non-existence (of that) **tat-abhāvāt** (abl. through) of it – non-existence **kutastarām** (intensified form of kutas) how is it ever? **tat-siddhiḥ** it, anything – brought about **4.13** (1.81) **na** it is not (*a separate assertion in answer to the question*) **karmaṇaḥ** (abl. comes through) righteous action **upādānatva-ayogāt** (abl. because) inclusiveness – unsuitable, doesn't fit, doesn't work

4.14 (1.82) **na_anuśravikāt_api** not even through Vedic tradition **tat-siddhiḥ** it – achieving **sādhyatvena** (inst. with) anything that is practiced **āvṛtti-yogāt** (abl. because) relapse **a-puruṣa-artha-tvam** not – human being – purpose **4.15** (1.83) **tatra** (loc.) in that **prāpta-vivekasya** attained – discrimination **anāvṛtti-śrutiḥ** non-relapse – scripture **4.16** (1.84) **duḥkhāt** (abl. because) suffering **duḥkham** suffering (*A pair like this means "it is because it is", something self-perpetuating.*) **jalābhiṣekavat** (vatup neuter nom. sing. "having") water – sprinkling **na** no **jādyā-vimokaḥ** coldness – relief from **4.17** (1.85) **kāmye akāmye api** whether optional or obligatory rites **sādhyatva-aviśeṣāt** (abl. because) something that is practiced – not distinctive, common **4.18** (1.86) **nijamuktasya** (gen. point of view; for) within himself – liberated **bandha-dhvaṁsamātram** bonds – fallen to dust – completely, simply **param** it is supreme / **na** there is no **samānatvam** the having in common

(The opponent:) **4.10 We (teachers) are not advocates of the meaning of the six words, like Vaisheshika and the others, 4.11 nor of any such unworkable thing, even if it isn't so established (as Vaisheshika, (i.e., the author's teaching)). Otherwise we are just another congregation equal to those naive enraptured ones and others (like them). 4.12 If a thing exists, it is brought about through that (something that exists), (so) if that doesn't exist, how is anything ever brought about through the non-existence of it? 4.13 It is not. It is through karma, because (your) inclusiveness just doesn't work.**

(The author:) **4.14 That (karma) is not the purpose of a human being, not even achieving it through the Vedic tradition, because there is relapse with anything that is practiced; 4.15 (but) in that (tradition) there is scripture on the non-relapse of one who has attained distinguishing. 4.16 There is suffering just because there is suffering, and there is no relief from such coldness (in) having a sprinkling of water (in the rite), 4.17 because that is just a common practice, whether personal or obligatory. 4.18 For one who is liberated within himself, his bonds simply fallen to dust, that is supreme. He does not have that (suffering) in common (with you).**

Chapter Five

The Opponent's Proof

द्वयोरैकतरस्य वाप्यसंनिकृष्टार्थपरिच्छित्तिः प्रमा तत्साधकतमं यत्तत् त्रिविधं प्रमाणं
तत्सिद्धौ सर्वसिद्धेर्नाधिक्यसिद्धिः । यत्संबद्धं सत्तदाकारोल्लेखि विज्ञानं तत्प्रत्यक्षम् ।
योगिनामबाह्यप्रत्यक्षत्वान्न दोषः । लीनवस्तुलब्धातिशयसम्बन्धाद्वादोषः । ईश्वरासिद्धेः ।
मुक्तबद्धयोरन्यतराभावान्न तत्सिद्धिः । उभयथाप्यसत्करत्वम् । मुक्तात्मनः प्रशंसा उपासा
सिद्धस्य वा । तत्संनिधानादधिष्ठातृत्वं मणिवत् । विशेषकार्येष्वपि जीवानाम् । सिद्धरूप-
बोद्धृत्वाद्वाक्यार्थोपदेशः । अन्तःकरणस्य तदुज्ज्वलितत्वाल्लोहवदधिष्ठातृत्वम् ।

5.1 (1.87) dvayoḥ (loc. in relation to) the two **ekatarasya** (gen. that of) the one **vā** alternatively to **api** indeed, surely **a-saṁ-ni-kṛṣṭa – artha – paricchittiḥ** not-drawn-in-together – thing – accurate defining (*the excess being "trimmed all around"*) **pramā** proof / **tat-sādhakatamam** (superl.) it – most effective in accomplishing **yat tat** which – that **trividham** threefold **pramāṇam** standard of

proof **5.2** (1.88) **tat-siddhau** (loc. given) this – proof **sarva-siddheḥ** (abl. since) all – proof **na** no **adhikya-siddhiḥ** excess – proof **5.3** (1.89) **yat** which **sambaddham** in contact **sat-tat-ākāra-ullekhi-vijñānam** something real – external appearance – (ullekhi) marking out, drawing, delineating – recognizing **tat-pratyakṣam** of it – sense perception **5.4** (1.90) **yoginām** (gen. on the part of) yogis **abāhya-pratyakṣatvāt** (abl. just because) non-external – perception – theirs being **na** no **doṣaḥ** fault **5.5** (1.91) **līna-vastu-labdha-atīśaya-sambandhāt** (abl. from) clinging – reality – acquired – superiority – contact **vā** nor **adoṣaḥ** lack of fault **5.6** (1.92) **īśvara-asiddheḥ** (abl. because of) supreme one, lord, governor – lack of proof (1.93) **mukta-baddhayoḥ** (loc. dual; in) liberated – bound **anyatara-abhāvāt** (abl. because of) either one – absence, non-existence **na** no **tat-siddhiḥ** that – proving

5.7 (1.94) **ubhayathā** in both ways, in both cases **api** in fact, really **asatkaratvam** lack of production of truth (1.95) **mukta-ātmanaḥ** (gen. of) liberated – individual **praśaṁsā** praising **upāsā** paying homage **siddhasya** (gen. of) accomplished **vā** or **5.8** (1.96) **tat-samnidhānāt** (abl. through) (of) it – direct presence **adhiṣṭhātṛtvam** governorship **maṇivat** like a crystal (1.97) **viśeṣa-kāryeṣu** (loc. pl.) different – things to be done, religious actions, worship **api** (with loc.) though **jīvanām** (gen. pl. belong to) individual living souls **5.9** (1.98) **siddha-rūpa-bodhṛtvāt** (abl. coming from) proved, established – form – being the knower **vākya-ārtha-upadeśaḥ** assertion – meaning – teaching, learning (1.99) **antaḥ-karaṇasya** (gen. of) inner creator **tat-ujjvalitatvāt** (abl. known from) its – luminance **lohavat** (vati like) iron, metal **adhiṣṭhātṛtvam** governorship

(The opponent:) **5.1** Alternatively to (your) 'one in relation to the two' (one mahat vs. the two sets of indriyas see 3.18), it is surely *proof* that defines a thing from what is not drawn in together (as the definition), the threefold standard of proof being the most effective in producing it. **5.2** Given this proof, since it is the proof of all, there is no superfluous proof. **5.3** That which is in contact, which is recognition by delineating the external appearance of a real thing, is *perception* of it. **5.4** There is no fault on the part of yogis just because of theirs being a non-external perception, **5.5** nor is there a lack of fault just because such contact (perception) might belong to those who have acquired superiority clinging to (physical) reality, **5.6** (but) because of the lack of any such proof of (your) supreme governor (mahat), in the liberated or the bound, since it is not existent in either one, there is no proving that.

(The author:) **5.7 Really either way there is a lack of production of truth, whether it is the praising of a liberated individual (yogi) or paying homage to the accomplished (and bound). 5.8 Though the kinds of worship are different, they belong to those living individuals, (but) governorship is known through its direct presence, like a crystal. 5.9 Learning the meaning of an assertion comes from being the knower of the essential form (rūpa) of what is being established, (i.e.,) that the governorship of the inner creator is known by its (self-) luminant form, like (molten) metal.**

प्रतिबन्धदृशः प्रतिबद्धज्ञानमनुमानम्। आप्तोपदेशः शब्दः। उभयसिद्धिः प्रमाणात्तदुप-
देशः। सामान्यतो दृष्टादुभयसिद्धिः। चिदवसानो भोगः। अकर्तुरपि फलोपभोगोऽन्ना-
द्यवत्। अविवेकाद्वा तत्सिद्धेः कर्तुः फलावगमः। नोभयं च तत्त्वाख्याने। विषयोऽवि-
षयोऽप्यतिदूरादेर्हानोपादानाभ्यामिन्द्रियस्य। सौक्ष्म्यात्तदनुपलब्धिः।

5.10 (1.100) **pratibandha-dṛśaḥ** (abl. from) connection – appearance **pratibaddha-jñānam** connected (following logically MW) – understanding **anumānam** inference **5.11** (1.101) **āpta-upadeśaḥ** a trusted authority – instruction **śabdaḥ** testimony **5.12** (1.102) **ubhaya-siddhiḥ** (nom. s.) both – establishing **pramāṇāt** (abl. by) evidence, means of proof **tat-upadeśaḥ** his – instruction **5.13** (1.103) **sāmānyataḥ** (tasil, ind.) in the same way **dṛṣṭāt** (abl. by) learned knowledge **ubhaya-siddhiḥ** both – establishing **5.14** (1.104) **cit-avasānaḥ** intelligence – stopping point **bhogāḥ** sensory experience (1.105) **akartuḥ** (gen. belonging to) not the creator **api** in fact **phala-upabhogaḥ** fruit – sensory experience **anna-adyavat** (vati "like") food – and the rest

5.15 (1.106) **avivekāṭ** (ind.) not distinguishing **vā** even **tat-siddheḥ** (abl. since) such – establishing **kartuḥ** (gen. belonging to) the creator **phala-avagamaḥ** fruit – direct conception **5.16** (1.107) **na** not **ubhayam** (n. nom. s.) the two **ca** as well **tattva-ākhyāne** (loc. having to do with) true – testimony **5.17** (1.108) **viśayaḥ** the sphere **aviśayaḥ** outside the sphere **api** and even **atidūra-ādeḥ** (abl. because of) very distant – etc. **hāna-upādānābhyām** (inst. dual; "through") rejecting – accepting **indriyasya** (gen. belonging to) the powers of sense and action **5.18** (1.109) **saukṣmyāt** (abl. because) smallness, triviality, insignificance **tat-an-upalabdhiḥ** (nom. f.) of those – no such – comprehension

(The opponent:) **5.10 Inference is understanding what follows logically from the appearance of a connection. 5.11 Testimony is instruction by a trusted authority, 5.12 his instruction establishing both by a means of proof, 5.13 and in the same way establishing both by learned knowledge. 5.14 Sensory experience (perception) is the *end point* of intellect. Sensory experience of any fruit, like food, etc., belongs, in fact, to something that is *not* the creator of it.**

(The author:) **5.15 Even not distinguishing, direct conception of the fruit *does* belong to its creator, since *that* is what establishes such (sensory experience), 5.16 not those two having to do with true testimony as well. 5.17 Belonging to the powers, either through rejecting or accepting, there is the sphere (of perceived objects), and even that which is outside the sphere because of being very distant, etc. (e.g., hidden or small), 5.18 (but) there is no such direct conception of *those* (distant etc.) things, because of their triviality.**

Chapter Six

The Author's Proof

कार्यदर्शानात्तदुपलब्धेः वादिविप्रतिपत्तेस्तदसिद्धिरिति चेत्। तथाप्येकतरदृष्ट्यैकतरसिद्धेर्ना-
पलापः। त्रिविधविरोधापत्तेश्च। नासदुत्पादो नृशृङ्गवत्। उपादाननियमात्। सर्वत्र सर्वदा
सर्वसम्भवात्। शक्तस्य शक्यकरणात्। कारणभावाच्च।

6.1 (1.110) **kārya-darśanāt** (abl. coming from) effect – seeing **tat-upalabdheḥ** (abl. because) those (see 5.18) – comprehension **6.2** (1.111) **vādi-vipratipatteḥ** (abl. according to) teacher, authority – opposing view **tat-asiddhiḥ** such – no establishing **iti** (a quote) **cet** to the objection

6.3 (1.112) **tathā** in that case **api** surely **ekatara-dṛṣṭyā** (inst. established by) in one – seeing, mental beholding or comprehension **ekatara-siddheḥ** (abl. by) another's, someone else's – proof **na** no **apalāpaḥ** denial **6.4** (1.113) **trividha-virodha-āpatteḥ** (abl. by) threefold – contradiction, inconsistency – occurrence **ca** even **6.5** (1.114) **na** not **asat-utpādaḥ** untrue – coming forth **nṛ-śṛṅgavat** (vati like) man – horn(s) **6.6** (1.115) **upādāna-niyamāt** (abl. because) accepting – definition **6.7** (1.116) **sarvatra** in every place **sarvadā** at all times **sarva-sambhavāt** (abl. because) (of) all – make-up, material source **6.8** (1.117) **śaktasya** (gen. of) powered, made possible **śakya-karaṇāt** (abl. because) powerer, enabler **6.9** (1.118) **kāraṇa-bhāvāt** (abl. because) cause – the very existence **ca** and

(The author:) **6.1 To the objection that because there is a (certain) comprehension of those things that comes through seeing the effect** (see Vaisheshika 3.4, etc.), **6.2 according to the opposing view of authorities there is no establishing such (a direct conception 5.15).**

6.3 ... well surely in that case what is established by direct seeing in the one (person), cannot be denied by someone else's proof, 6.4 even by the occurrence of inconsistency with the threefold (standard of proof). 6.5 Whatever (experience) comes forth, it is not something untrue, like horns on a man, 6.6 because that (direct seeing) is the definition of accepting: 6.7 because in every place, at all times, it is the source of all, 6.8 because it is the enabler (empowerer) of all that is possible, 6.9 and because it is the very existence of cause.

The impossible "man-horn" image derives from a traditional illustration of proof that uses the example of a cow, with horns being one of the proofs.

न भावे भावयोगश्चेत्। नाभिव्यक्तिनिबन्धनौ व्यवहाराव्यवहारौ। नाशः कारणलयः।
 पारम्पर्यतोऽन्वेषणाद्विजाङ्कुरवत्। उत्पत्तिवद्वादोषः। हेतुमदनित्यमव्यापि सक्रियमने-
 कमाश्रितं लिङ्गम्। आज्ञस्यादभेदतो वा गुणसामान्यादेस्तत्सिद्धिः प्रधानव्यपदेशाद्वा।
 त्रिगुणाचेतनत्वादि द्वयोः प्रीत्यप्रीतिविषादाद्यैर्गुणानामन्योन्यं वैधर्म्यम्। लघ्वादिदर्मेः
 साधर्म्यं वैधर्म्यं गुणानाम्। उभयान्यत्वात्कार्यत्वं महदादेर्घटादिवत्। परिमाणात्।
 समन्वयात्। शक्तितश्चेति।

6.10 (1.119) **na** not **bhāve** (loc. in) existence **bhāva-yogaḥ** true, genuine – connection **cet** if ... well then

6.11 (1.120) **na** not (so) **abhivyakti-nibandhanau** (nom. dual) manifestation – binding **vyavahāra-avyavahārau** behaving – not behaving (1.121) **nāśaḥ** extinction **kāraṇa-layaḥ** cause – dissolution **6.12** (1.122) **pāramparyataḥ** (tasil "through") series **anveṣaṇā** (from anviṣ, anu+iṣ, "to impel") seeking after **bīja-aṅkuravat** (vati like) seed – sprout **6.13** (1.123) **utpattivat** (vati like, w/neg "any more than") production **vā** (or, alternatively) **adoṣaḥ** without fault, valid (1.124) **hetumat** having cause, being caused (by reason or motive) **anityam** non-eternal **avyāpi** non-comprehensive **sakriyam** having action, active **anekam** non-singular, manifold **āsritam** dependent, attached to **liṅgam** indicator **6.14** (1.125) **āñjasyāt**

(abl. adverbial) obviously **abhedatas** (tasil stemming from) equivalence **vā** either **guṇa-sāmānyādeḥ** (abl. through) qualities – similarity – etc. **tat-siddhiḥ** of that – proof **pradhāna-vyapadeśāt** (abl. through) principal – designation **vā** or **6.15** (1.126) **triguṇa-acetanatva-ādi** (f. nom. s.) consisting of the three guṇas – non-sentient – being – and the rest **dvayoḥ** (gen. belonging to) both **6.16** (1.127) **prīti-aprīti-viśāda-ādyaiḥ** (inst. pl. by) satisfaction, contentment – discontent – lethargy – etc. **guṇānām** (gen. pl. of) guṇas **anyonyam** mutual relation to each other **vaidharmyam** inconsistency, essential difference (†128) **laghu-ādi-dharmaiḥ** (inst. pl. through) light – etc. – properties **sādharmyam** consistency, essential similarity **vaidharmyam** difference **ca** and **guṇānām** (gen. pl. of) guṇas (*Like the author of Vaisheshika, this author uses sādharmya, vaidharmya, and dharma together. See VD 1.1-3.*) **6.17** (1.129) **ubhaya-anyatvāt** (abl. because) both – other – being **kāryatvam** being product **mahat-ādeḥ** (gen. of) mahat – and the rest **ghaṭa-ādi-vat** (vati "like") jar, pot – etc. **6.18** (1.130) "**parimāṇāt**" (abl. from) measuring (†131) **samanvayāt** (abl. from) series (†132) **śaktiṭaḥ** (tasil) in consequence of power **ca** and **iti** called (*These last three may have been separated by an ancient copyist to be more consistent with 1.116-18.*)

(The author continues:) **6.10** If you say "that is not the true connection in one's existence," ...

6.11 ... well, it is not (a matter of) manifesting and binding (by) behaving or not behaving, extinction (being) dissolution into the cause. **6.12** Through the series there is a seeking, like seed and sprout. **6.13** That (seeking) is not wrong, any more than the alternative of production, (both) caused, non-eternal, non-comprehensive, active, manifold, dependent, the indicator. **6.14** Stemming obviously from that equivalence (of the two models) the proof of it is either through the similarity of those qualities and others, or through the designation of a principal. **6.15** The state of non-sentience consisting of the three guṇas and the rest belongs to both (models). **6.16** (In one) there is the mutual relation of the guṇas to each other, their essential difference by contentment (*sattva*), discontent (*rajas*), lethargy (*tamas*), and so on; and (in the other) there is the essential similarity and difference (in objects) through the guṇas' properties of (being) light and so on, **6.17** because of both being something other, being a *product* of mahat and the rest, like pots and so on, **6.18** coming from measuring, arising out of the series, and resulting from that power (6.8). Thus it is said.

The various qualities listed in 6.13, are shared by the world of the production model and the world of the "becoming evident" model, but they exempt the human spirit in that both worlds have the following characteristics:

- caused vs. his being eternal 1.12 and 2.1;
- non-eternal vs. eternal 1.12;
- non-comprehensive vs. all-pervading, common to all things 1.12;
- with action vs. without action 2.13;
- manifold vs. inapplicability of diverse experience 1.17;
- dependent vs. not dependent 1.18
- the indicator vs. without guṇas 2.18.

In addition to the fact that the manifest and the produced share these qualities, both views designate a principal. The author's principal in the series is the great intellect designated as mahat, the inner creator, whereas the opponent with his production model designates nature as principal. From here on, the meaning of the word "principal" depends on which of the two views is being presented.

The manifest or the produced, either way you look at it, consists of that which is born of the three guṇas but not sentient like the great intellect. The difference between the two views in terms of the three guṇas (sattva, rajas, and tamas) is that in the one they are fundamental qualities of human consciousness, and in the other they are fundamental qualities or attributes of objects. In the liberating view, pleasure as blissful contentment is sattva; displeasure or discontent, which is the need to change, is rajas; and depression or lethargy is tamas, resistant to both pleasure and change. These are qualities of awareness as opposed to the qualities of *objects* in sutra 6.16; light vs. heavy, bright vs. dark, hot vs. cold, and so on.

Both halves of this chapter begin with an "if ... then" clause and end with the author's own threefold proof, stated first in terms of the source and then in terms of the object or product; so sutra 6.18 is the complement to sutras 6.7-9, with measuring preexisting objects (see also 11.8) being in the outward direction, and accepting the causal role of the self being inward; development through the series being outward, and the source being inward; and the outer world that is in consequence of power, being the counterpart to the inner empowerer.

Chapter Seven

The Container

तद्धाने प्रकृतिः पुरुषो वा तयोरन्यत्वे तुच्छत्वम्। कार्यात्कारणानुमानं तत्साहित्यात्।
अव्यक्तं त्रिगुणाल्लिङ्गात् तत्कार्यतस्तत्सिद्धेर्नापलापः। सामान्येन विवादाभावाद्धर्मवन्न
साधनम्। शरीरादिव्यतिरिक्तः पुमान्। संहतपरार्थत्वात्। त्रिगुणादिविपर्ययात्। अधि-
ष्ठानाच्चेति। भोक्तृभावात्। कैवल्यार्थं प्रवृत्तेः। जडप्रकाशायोगात्प्रकाशः।

7.1 (1.133) **tat-dhāne** (loc. as for) that – container / **prakṛtiḥ** nature **puruṣaḥ** human being **vā** or (1-134) **tayoḥ** (loc. between, of) the two **anyatve** (loc. if) the other, the latter **tucchatvam** vanity 7.2 (1.135) **kāryāt** (abl. from) effect **kāraṇa-anumānam** cause – inference **tat-sāhityāt** (abl. known by) between them – association 7.3 (1.136) **avyaktam** (something) unmanifest **triguṇāt** (abl. produced from) the three guṇas **liṅgāt** (abl. known by) indicator (1-137) **tat-kāryatas** (tasil through) its – effect **tat-siddheḥ** (gen. of) that – establishment, proof **na** no **apalāpaḥ** denial

7.4 (1.138) **sāmānyena** (ind) in general **vivāda-abhāvāt** (abl. just because) dispute – absence **dharmavat** (vati like it is with) dharma **na** not **sādhnam** leading towards establishing something 7.5 (1.139) **śarīra-ādi-vyatiriktaḥ** the body – etc. – separate, distinct from **pumān** (n. s. of pums) person (1-140) **sāmhata-para-arthatvāt** (abl. since) aggregate – apart – being for the benefit of 7.6 (1.141) **triguṇa-ādi-viparyayāt** (abl. adv.) the three guṇas – etc. – as opposed to 7.7 (1.142) **adhiṣṭhānāt** (abl. because) governor **ca** and **iti** it is said 7.8 (1.143) **bhoktr-bhāvāt** (abl. known from) enjoyer – existence (1-144) **kaivalya-artham** (abl. because) exclusivity, being the only one – meaning **pravṛtteḥ** (abl. from) progressing through life **ca** and 7.9 (1.145) **jaḍa-prakāśa-ayogāt** (abl. out of) dull, inanimate – bright – separation **prakāśaḥ** the bright one

(The opponent:) 7.1 As for the container of (all) that, whether it is nature or a human being, if (you think) it is the latter of the two (the human being), that is just vanity. 7.2 Inference of a cause from its effect is known by that (particular) association between them. 7.3 No one denies that the proof of that (human soul) is known by its effect, (i.e.,) an unmanifest entity (known) through its (perceptible) indicator (body) produced from the three guṇas.

(The author:) **7.4 It does not go towards establishing something just because there is a general absence of dispute, like it is with dharma. 7.5 This person is distinct from his body and the rest, because of that aggregate (body) being for the benefit of something apart from it; 7.6 and, it is said (VD), because that (person) is opposite (in concept) to the three guṇas, etc. (VD 7.4), 7.7 and because he is the governor (mahat VD Ch. 4). 7.8 The meaning of his being the only one is known from his existence as the enjoyer and from his progress through life. 7.9 He is the bright one out of that separation (being "apart" 7.5) between dull and bright (intellect).**

निर्गुणत्वान्न चिद्धर्मा। श्रुत्या सिद्धस्य नापलापस्तत्प्रत्यक्षवाधात्। सुषुप्त्याद्यसाक्षत्वम्।
जन्मादिव्यवस्थातः पुरुषबहुत्वम्। उपाधिभेदेऽप्येकस्य नानायोग आकाशस्येव घटा-
दिभिः। उपाधिभिद्यते न तु तद्वान्। एवमेकत्वेन परिवर्तमानस्य न विरुद्धधर्माध्यासः।
अन्यधर्मत्वेऽपि नारोपात्तसिद्धिरेकत्वात्। नाद्वैतश्रुतिविरोधो। जातिपरत्वात्। विदित-
बन्धकारणस्य दृष्ट्या तद्रूपम्।

7.10 (1.146) *nir-guṇa-tvāt* (ind.) without – qualities – being **na** no such *cit-dharmā* intellect – role **7.11** (1.147) *śrutyā* (inst. by) scripture *siddhasya* (gen. of) established **na** no *apalāpaḥ* denial *tat-pratyakṣa-bādhāt* (abl. because) (of) it – immediate – excluded (*see also 18.2*) **7.12** (1.148) *suṣupti-ādi-asākṣitvam* deep sleep – etc. – no state of witnessing (1.149) *janman-ādi-vyavasthātaḥ* (tasil by reason of) birth, life – etc. – respective difference *puruṣa-bahutvam* persons, souls – multiplicity

7.13 (1.150) *upādhi-bhede* (loc.) substitute, representation – splitting, division *api* (loc. w/api even though) *ekasya* (gen. of) the one *nānāyogaḥ* manifoldness *ākāśasya* (gen. of) the ether *iva* like *ghaṭa-ādibhiḥ* (inst. with) jars – and the like **7.14** (1.151) *upādhiḥ* representation *bhidyate* that is divided **na** not **tu** but *tadvān* that which has (contains) it **7.15** (1.152) *evam* in just that way *ekatvena* (inst. with, accompanied by) oneness *parivartamānasya* (*A.pres.part. √parivṛt*) (gen. of, for) going around, living life **na** no *viruddha-dharma-adhyāsaḥ* inconsistent notion – role – unfit imposition **7.16** (1.153) *anya-dharma-tve_**api* (loc. w/api even though) something other – role – may be **na** not *aropāt* (abl. through) (*√rup*) absence of confusion (*consistent with vivāda-abhāvāt 7.4, but could also be read as "na āropāt" (fr. caus.√ruh: causing to grow>planting>fixing>imposing: "by imposition" of a fixed dharma.)*) *tat-siddhiḥ* it – establishing *ekatvāt* (abl. because)

oneness 7.17 (1.154) **na** not **advaita-śruti-virodhaḥ** non-duality – scripture – contradiction **jāti-paratvāt** (abl. by) individual lives – different – there being 7.18 (1.155) **vidita-bandha-kāraṇasya** (gen. point of view) known – bondage – cause **dr̥ṣṭyā** (inst. by) seeing, direct cognition **tat-rūpam** his – form, nature

(The opponent:) 7.10 **There is no such role (dharma) for intellect** (see "where intelligence stops" 5.14), **being without the guṇas.** 7.11 **There is no denying of that which is established by scripture, (just) because direct perception of it is excluded;** 7.12 (e.g.,) **there is no such witnessing in deep sleep and so on, (and) there is a multiplicity of human beings by reason of the respective difference by birth, and so on.**

(The author:) 7.13 **Though there is division in the representation, a manifoldness of the one, like that of the ether with jars and the like,** 7.14 **it is the representation that is divided, but not the one who has it (mahat).** 7.15 **In just that way, for one proceeding with his life along with that oneness, there is no imposing any dharma contrary to that.** 7.16 **Even if there is some other dharma, arising from the oneness, it is not established by your (simple) absence of confusion about it.** 7.17 **There is no contradiction of that scripture on non-duality by the existence of other births.** 7.18 **For one to whom the cause of bondage is known, his form is apprehended through direct cognition.**

The author's statement that there is no proof through the mere absence of doubt is again, twice in the same chapter, a response to the opponent's statement that there can be no denial of his view (see 7.3). He objects to the opponent's proof by the general absence of doubt, just as the opponent objects to his "immediate comprehension" without proof. The author says that the one creative intelligence is not divided, that the many people seen in one's environment are representations of oneself, which mirror one's own qualities even more closely than the other created objects do. The traditional analogy of clay pots and space (ether) illustrates that even though the empty pots seem to divide space into separate parts, space remains whole and unbroken whether the pots are present or not.

Chapter Eight

The Ways of Misunderstanding

नान्ध्यादृष्ट्या चक्षुष्मतामनुपलम्भः। वामदेवादिर्मुक्तो नाद्वैतम् अनादावद्य यावदभावद्भवि-
ष्यदप्येवम्। इदानीमिव सर्वत्र नात्यन्तोच्छेदः व्यावृत्तोभयरूपः साक्षात्सम्बन्धात्साक्षि-
त्वम्। नित्यमुक्तत्वम्। औदासीन्यं चेति। उपरागात्कर्तृत्वं चित्सांनिध्यात् (चित्सांनि-
ध्यत्)। (The repetition is artificial.)

8.1 (1.156) **na** not **andha-ādrṣṭyā** (inst. "by the example of", like; *see also* 11.16 with inst.) blind – seeing **caṅṣuṣmatām** (gen. on the part of) those who have sight **anupalambhaḥ** lack of recognition **8.2** (1.157) **vāmadeva-ādih** vāmadeva – and others **muktaḥ** liberated **na** there is no **advaitam** non-duality **8.3** (1.158) **anādau** (loc. in) the preexisting **adya-yāvat** today – as much as ever **abhāvāt** (abl. ind.) that being absent **bhaviṣyat** the future **api_ evam** most definitely so **8.4** (1.159a) **idānīm** at this moment **iva** like, as **sarvatra** everywhere, in every case

8.5 (1.159b) **na** not **atyanta-ucchedaḥ** ultimate, final – cutting short (1.160) **vyāvṛtta-ubhaya-rūpaḥ** turned away from, free from, rid of – both – form **8.6** (1.161) **sākṣāt** (ind.) right before one's eyes, clearly **sambandhāt** (abl. because) connection **sākṣitvam** state of witnessing **8.7** (1.162) **nitya-muktatvam** forever – freed – state of **8.8** (1.163) **audāsīnyam** indifference **ca** and **iti** as you say **8.9** (1.164) **uparāgāt** (abl. because) influence **kartṛtvam** being the doer or creator **cit-sāmnidhyāt** (abl. from) intellect – proximity, presence, attendance

(The opponent:) **8.1** It is not just a matter of lack of recognition of it (the one form 7.18) on the part of those who should be able to see, like the blind and the sighted. **8.2** (By the example of) Vāmadeva and others being liberated, there is no such non-duality. **8.3** That (non-duality) being absent, in the preexisting (world) it is as much today as ever (time); and the future, most definitely so. **8.4** As it is at this moment (here), it is everywhere. (place)

(The author:) **8.5** His form being free from both of those (time and place) is not a matter of a final cutoff (sleep or death). **8.6** Clearly, because there is (still) a connection, it is a state of *witnessing*, **8.7** and the state of having being freed forever (2.1), **8.8** is just the "indifference," (nature (see 8.11)) as you say. **8.9** Being the creator arises out of influence from the presence of intellect.

विमुक्तमोक्षार्थं स्वार्थं वा प्रधानस्य। विरक्तस्य तत्सिद्धेः। न श्रवणमात्रात्तत्सिद्धिरनादि-
वासनाया बलवत्त्वात्। बहुभृत्यवद्वा प्रत्येकम्। प्रकृतिवास्तवे च पुरुषस्याध्याससिद्धिः।
कार्यतस्तत्सिद्धेः। चेतनोद्देशान्नियमः कण्टकमोक्षवत्। अन्ययोगेऽपि तत्सिद्धिर्नाञ्जस्ये-
नायोदाहवत्। रागविरागयोर्योगः। सृष्टिः। महदादिक्रमेण पञ्चभूतानाम्। आत्मार्थत्वा-
त्सृष्टेर्नैषामात्मार्थ आरम्भः। दिक्कालावाकाशादिभ्यः।

8.10 (2.1) **vimukta-mokṣa-artham** final release – liberation – for the sake of **svārtham** for one's own sake **vā** or **pradhānasya** (gen. belonging to) the principal **8.11** (2.2) **viraktasya** (gen. belonging to) the indifferent one **tat-siddheḥ** (abl. because) that establishment **8.12** (2.3a) **na** no **śravaṇa-mātrāt** (abl. from) hearing – mere **tat-siddhiḥ** of it – establishing (*This is the end of sutra 8.12, the perfect complement to 8.11.*)

8.13 (2.3b) **anādi-vāsanāyāḥ** (f.gen. of) the preexisting – imagined notion **bala-vattvāt** (abl. coming from) strength – having, being possessed of (2.4) **bahu-bhṛtyavat** (vati like) multitude, host – dependent(s) **vā** or, "and respectively" **pratyekam** individuals one by one (2.5) **prakṛti-vāstave** (loc. (of vāstava) where) of nature – the reality **ca** and **puruṣasya** (gen. of) person, human being **adhyāsa-siddhiḥ** by unfit imposition – establishing (*The terms "vā" and "ca", indicating the two alternatives to the first term in 8.13, are both found seated between the terms with which they are associated in their respective clauses.*) **8.14** (2.6) **kāryatas** (tasil adverbial; in that way, as) a product **tat-siddheḥ** (abl. known by) that – establishing (2.7) **cetana-uddeśāt** (abl. from) the aware – example **niyamah** defining (it) **kaṇṭaka-mokṣavat** (vati like, as if) thorns – liberation (2.8) **anya-yoge** (loc. in) (something) other – relation to **api** and **tat-siddhiḥ** it – proving **na** not **āñjasyena** (inst.) through directness, honesty, straightforwardness **ayodāhavat** (vati like) glowing of molten metal **8.15** (2.9) **rāga-virāgayoḥ** (gen. of) passion – dispassion **yogaḥ** connection, joining **8.16** **śṛṣṭiḥ** creation (2.10) **mahat-ādikrameṇa** (inst. through) mahat – beginning with – series **pañca-bhūtānām** (gen. pl. belonging to) five – gross elements (*see 3.7*) **8.17** (2.11) **ātma-artha-tvāt** (abl. arising out of) one's own – intention **śṛṣṭeḥ** (abl. because) creation **na eṣām** (gen. belonging to) these / **ātma-arthe** (loc. if) one's own – for the benefit **ārambhaḥ** undertaking, beginning, origination **8.18** (2.12) **dik-kālau** (nom. dual) dimension – time **ākāśa-ādibhyaḥ** (abl. arising out of) those beginning with the ether

(The opponent:) **8.10** That which is for the sake of the liberation of *final* release (8.5), or that which is for one's own sake, belongs to (our) principal (nature), **8.11** because the establishing of it belongs to that indifferent one. **8.12** There is no establishing of it from mere hearing.

(The author:) **8.13** That (belief) comes from being possessed of the strength of the imagined notion (*vāsanā*) of 1.) a preexisting (world), or 2.) individuals one by one, like a host of dependents, and 3.) that this establishing of a human being where in reality there is nature, is an unfitting imposition; **8.14** which is known by establishing that (first) as a product, defining (the second) from the example of the aware (the liberated, e.g., *Vāmadeva*) as if it (liberation) were like liberation from thorns, and establishing that (third) in relation to something other (than soul), not through directness (of perception) like the glowing of molten metal. **8.15** Our Yoga (connection) is of passion *and* dispassion. **8.16** There *is* creation of the five gross elements, through the series, beginning with *mahat*, **8.17** (but) it does not belong to these, because this creation arises out of one's own intention (and) the origination of it is for one's own sake. **8.18** (Even) dimension and time arise out of those (essential constituents) that begin with the ether. (see VD 1.4-5 commentary).

Chapter Nine

Mind

अद्यवसायो बुद्धिः। तत्कार्यं धर्मादिः। महदुपरागाद्विपरीतम्। अभिमानोऽहंकारः। एका-
दशपञ्चतन्मात्रं तत्कार्यम्। सात्त्विकमेकादशकं प्रवर्तते वैकृतादहंकारात्। कर्मन्द्रियबुद्धी-
न्द्रियैरान्तरमेकादशकम्। आहङ्कारिकत्वश्रुतेर्न भौतिकानि।

9.1 (2.13) **adhyavasāyaḥ** determination, ascertainment, discernment **buddhiḥ** intellect **9.2** (2.14) **tat-kāryam** by that – to be done **dharma-ādiḥ** beginning with one's duty, sense of right, responsibility **9.3** (2.15) **mahat-uparāgāt** (abl. of comparison) mahat – influencing (role) **viparītam** w/abl. opposite of **9.4** (2.16) **abhimānaḥ** conceit, vanity, self-interest **ahaṁkāraḥ** personal identity

9.5 (2.17) **ekādaśa-pāñca-tanmātram** (*samāhāra dvandva compound, a complex*) eleven – five – subtle elements, sensations **tat-kāryam** (of) that – effect **9.6** (2.18) **sātvikam** of or related to sattva **ekādaśakam** eleventh **9.7 pravartate** it proceeds **vaikṛtāt** (ind.) modified **ahaṁkārat** (abl. out of) the personal identity

9.8 (2.19) **karma-indriya-buddhi-indriyaiḥ** (inst. pl. included with them) action – powers – intellect, discerning – powers **āntaram** internal **ekādaśakam** eleventh
9.9 (2.20) **āhaṅkārikatva-śruteḥ** (abl. for there is) being of the personal identity – scripture **na** not **bhautikāni** (ika having or consisting of) gross elements

(The opponent:) **9.1** Intellect is (just) discernment. **9.2** Whatever is effected by that (intellect), it begins with one's dharma, **9.3** which is just the opposite of the influencing of (your) 'mahat'. **9.4** The personal identity is (just) that self-interest (through dharma).

(The author:) **9.5** What is effected by that (intellect) is the complex of the eleven with the five sensations. (the eleven = ten indriyas + mind) **9.6** The eleventh (mind) is of sattva. **9.7** It proceeds out of the personal identity modified. **9.8** The eleventh is internal, included with the powers of action and the powers of discerning, **9.9** which do not consist of the gross elements, for there is scripture on their being of the personal identity.

देवतालयश्रुतिर्नारम्भकस्य। तदुत्पत्तिश्रुतेर्विनाशदर्शनाच्च। अतीन्द्रियमिन्द्रियं भ्रान्तानामधिष्ठाने। शक्तिभेदेऽपि भेदसिद्धौ नैकत्वम्। न कल्पनाविरोधः प्रमाणदृष्टस्य। उभयात्मकं मनः। गुणपरिणामभेदान्नानात्वमवस्थावत्। रूपादिरसमलान्त उभयोः।

9.10 (2.21) **devatā-laya-śrutiḥ** powers of sense as gods – dissolution – scripture **na** not **ārambhakasya** (gen. belonging to) originator **9.11** (2.22) **tat-utpatti-śruteḥ** (abl. known through) them – production – scripture **9.12** **vināśa-darśanāt** (abl. known by) destruction – seeing **ca** and **9.13** (2.23) **aṅdriyam** superior – power **indriyam** power **bhrāntānām** (gen. of, over) wandering, confused, (unliberated) **adhiṣṭhāne** (loc. where) rule (2-24) **śakti-bhede** (loc. where) powers, abilities – division **api** indeed **9.14** **bheda-siddhau** (loc. if) partition – establishing **na** no **ekatvam** oneness

9.15 (2.25) **na kalpana-avirodhaḥ** imagined to be true – no inconsistency **pramāṇa-drṣṭasya** (gen. for) measure of truth – learned knowledge **9.16** (2.26) **ubhaya-ātmakam** both – consisting of, including **manaḥ** mind (*this word is the referent for all the genitive-case terms in the following text.*) **9.17** (2.27) **guṇa-pariṇāma-bhedāt** (abl. through) quality – transformation – difference, various **nānātvam** variety, manifoldness, diversity **avasthāvat** (vati as) life circumstance. **9.18** (2.28) **rūpa-ādi-rasa-mala-antaḥ** beauty – to start – taste – dirt – to end **ubhayoḥ** (loc. dual; in) both

(The opponent:) **9.10 There is scripture on dissolution (of those gross elements) into the devatā (gods); they do not belong to (your) originator. 9.11 It is known through scripture on the production of them, 9.12 and by seeing the destruction. 9.13 Their power (see 9.7) is a superior power, where there is rule over the confused (people), where there is indeed a partition according to ability, 9.14 (and) if we establish any such partition, there can be no oneness.**

(The author:) **9.15 For one whose measure of truth is that learned knowledge, there is no inconsistency with what is imagined (gods, superior powers). 9.16 Mind includes both (super and ordinary). 9.17 Through the various transformations of the guṇas there is diversity, (appearing) as circumstance. 9.18 In both it ranges from beauty to taste to dirt.**

The expression "rūpa-ādi-rasa-mala-anta" means literally, "beginning with beauty (form) and taste and ending with or extending to dirt (smell)" and it refers to the "guṇas" of Vaisheshika, rupa-rasa-gandha-sparśa (VD 1.5). The author says that both the beauty and the dirt of life are experienced by the living liberated person, so life experience is not due to circumstance earned through karma.

Chapter Ten

Mind and the Powers

द्रष्टृत्वादिरात्मनः करणत्वमिन्द्रियाणाम्। त्रयाणां स्वालक्षण्यम्। सामान्यकरणवृत्तिः प्राणाद्या वायवः पञ्च। क्रमशोऽक्रमशश्चेन्द्रियवृत्तिः। वृत्तयः पञ्चतय्यः क्लिष्टाक्लिष्टाः। तन्निवृत्तावुपशान्तोपरागः स्वस्थः। कुसुमवच्च मणिः। पुरुषार्थं करणोद्भवोऽप्यदृष्टोद्भासात्। धेनुवद्वत्साय। करणं त्रयोदशविधमवान्तरभेदात्। इन्द्रियेषु साधकतमत्वगुणयोगात्कुठारवत्। द्वयोः प्रधानं मनो लोकवद्भृत्यवर्गेषु। अव्यभिचारात्। तथाशेषसंस्काराधारत्वात् स्मृत्यानुमानाच्च।

10.1 (2.29) draṣṭṛtva-ādih the being a witness – etc. **ātmanaḥ** (gen. that of *ref.=manas 9.16*) individual **kaṛaṇa-tvam** being one who acts **indriyāṇām** (gen. that of) powers (2.30) **trayāṇām** (gen. that of) the three **svālakṣaṇyam** state of having an identifying personal quality (2.31) **sāmānya-kaṛaṇa-vṛttiḥ** being universal or common, shared with other members of a group – doing, acting – manner of functioning, mode, way

10.2 *prāṇa-adyāḥ* (gen. that of) breath – etc. *vāyavaḥ* the airs **10.3** (2.32) *kramaśaḥ* (kramaśas) serial *akramaśaḥ* non-serial **ca** and, as well as *indriya-vṛttiḥ* powers of sense – way of functioning **10.4** (2.33) *vṛttayaḥ* (nom. pl.) ways *pañcatayaḥ* (pañcat + ayac samkhyārthaka) fivefold *kliṣṭa-akliṣṭāḥ* (from *kliś*) afflicted or not afflicted **10.5** (2.34) *tat-nivṛttau* (loc. when) of those – cessation *upaśānta-uparāgaḥ* pacified – coloring, influence *sva-sthaḥ* self – abiding (2.35) *kusumavat* (vatup having) flower **ca** and *maṇiḥ* crystal **10.6** (2.36) *puruṣa-artham* human being – interest *karaṇa-udbhavaḥ* producer, agent – origin, generation *api* thus *adr̥ṣṭa-ullāsāt* unseen – appearing, becoming visible (2.37) *dhenuvat* (vati like) cow's (milk) *vatsāya* (dative for the sake of) calf **10.7** (2.38) *karaṇam* creation *trayodaśa-vidham* thirteenfold *avāntara-bhedāt* (abl. through) intermediate – division, subdivision, set **10.8** (2.39) *indriyeṣu* (loc. among) indriyas, powers of sense *sādhaka-tama-tva-guṇa-yogāt* (abl. because) effective – most – being – quality (2.40) *kuṭhāravat* (vati like) axe *dvayoḥ* (loc. dual; among) the two *pradhānam* the head, the chief *manaḥ* mind *lokavat* (vati as) the world *bhṛtya-vargeṣu* (loc. among) dependents – company (2.41) *avyabhicārāt* (abl. (indeclinable MW) adverbial) unfailing, with absolute necessity **10.9** (2.42) *tathā* that way, thus *aśeṣa-saṃskāra-ādhāra-tvāt* (abl. because of) without exception, entire – mental constructs – foundation – its being (2.43) *smṛtyā* (inst. with, including) remembering, memory *anumānāt* (abl. known through) inference **ca** as well

(The opponent:) **10.1** That (mind) of an individual soul, is the being a witness (of creation), etc. That (mind) of his (karma) indriyas is his being one who acts. That (mind) of the three (forms of Brahman), is his (particular) way of acting, shared with his peers, thus having an identifying personal quality.

(The author:) **10.2** That (mind) of breath and the others is the five airs, **10.3** (and) the way of functioning of those powers is serial as well as non-serial, **10.4** The ways are fivefold, whether they are afflicted or not afflicted (dirt or beauty 9.18). **10.5** When there is cessation of those (ways), their coloring influence is pacified and there is (a state of) abiding in oneself, and this (self) is the (metaphorical) crystal having a flower (as its color). **10.6** Like the cow's milk for the sake of the calf, the generation by an agent in the interest of the human being is through the becoming visible of the unseen, **10.7** a thirteenfold creation through the intermediate set. **10.8** Unfailing among its company of dependents, appearing as the world, is mind, which is the head of those two (sets of powers) like (the head of) an axe, because of its quality of being the

most effective among the powers. 10.9 It is thus because of its being the foundation of all (mental) constructs without exception, including memory (YD 1.6) and (those) known through inference (YD 1.4) as well.

The opponent argues with the author's statement in 8.5-9 concerning the human being as the witness and nature's creation through the presence of intellect, and the author replies by reinforcing his thesis of the serial nature of creation starting with intellect. The serial mode is that in which one thing proceeds from the next, and the non-serial mode is that of the groups of five that do not have any such relationship of prior and posterior between them as production or containment, but instead manifest and dissolve by conjunction and disjunction.

सम्भवेन्न स्वतः। आपेक्षिको गुणप्रधानभावः। क्रियाविशेषात्। तत्कर्माजितत्वात्तदर्थम-
भिचेष्टा लोकवत्। समानकर्मयोगे बुद्धेः प्राधान्यं लोकवत् (लोकवत्) (The repetition is
artificial.)। अविशेषाद्विशेषारम्भः। तस्माच्छरीरस्य। तद्वीजात्संसृतिः आविवेकाच्च
प्रवर्तनमविशेषाणाम्। उपभोगादितरस्य। सम्प्रति परिमुक्तो द्वाभ्याम्।

10.10 (2.44) **sambhavet** (opt.3.sg.) it can happen **na** not **svataḥ** (svatas) of one's own self, of one's own accord **10.11** (2.45) **āpekṣikaḥ** relative **guṇa-pradhāna-bhāvaḥ** qualities – principal – relation **kriyā-viśeṣāt** (abl. according to) activity – particular (MW) **10.12** (2.46) **tat-karma-arjitatvāt** (abl. from) one's – karma – acquired – having been **tat-artham** one's – benefit **abhiceṣṭā** (inst.) efforts **lokavat** (vati appearing as) the world

10.13 (2.47) **samāna-karma-yoge** (loc. (whatever) is the case) equally, whatever – action – relevance **buddheḥ** (gen. belonging to) intellect **prādhānyam** (ṣyañ of pradhāna) principalness, the role of principal **lokavat** (vati appearing as) world **10.14** (3.1) **aviśeṣāt** (abl. coming from) undifferentiated **viśeṣa-ārambhāḥ** differentiated – origination, inception (*This compound has a genitive connection that is the referent for the genitive word in the following sutra.*) **10.15** (3.2) **tasmāt** from that **śarīrasya** (gen. that of) the body **10.16** (3.3) **tat-bijāt** (abl. arising from) its – seed **samsṛtiḥ** the course of life (3.4) **ā-vivekāṭ** (ā w/abl.; approaching, leading up to) distinguishing **ca** and **pravartanam** proceeding forth **aviśeṣāṇām** (gen. of) undifferentiated ones, the three guṇas **10.17** (3.5) **upabhogāt** (abl. for the sake of, "because" there is to be) experience **itarasya** (gen. that of) the other **10.18** (3.6) **samprati** (ind.) at the moment, immediate, now **pari-muktaḥ** utterly – free **dvābhyām** (abl. from) both

(The opponent:) **10.10 This (mind) cannot just happen of its own accord. 10.11 There is the relation of one's qualities to the principal (nature), which is relative according to one's particular activity, 10.12 One's interest is through his effort, having been acquired through his karma, appearing as the world.**

(The author:) **10.13 Whatever the karma, the role of principal belongs to intellect, appearing as the world. 10.14 The origination of the differentiated (powers) comes from the undifferentiated. 10.15 From that comes that (origination) of the body, 10.16 the course of life belonging to the undifferentiated ones (the guṇas) arising from its seed and proceeding forth for leading to distinguishing. 10.17 That (course) of the other (the body) is for experience. 10.18 That which is immediate (puruṣa) is utterly free from both.**

Again the opponent argues for an indifferent nature as principal, creating one's particular life circumstances in reaction to one's past karma, but the author claims intellect (mahat) as principal, from which arises the twofold purpose of life: realization and enjoyment. He states again that the human spirit transcends both progress and the experience of enjoyment or pain.

Chapter Eleven

The Body and the Fivefold Opposing View

मातापितृजं स्थूलं प्रायश इतरन्न तथा। पूर्वोत्पत्तेस्तत्कार्यत्वं भोगादेकस्य नेतरस्य।
सप्तदशैकं लिङ्गम्। व्यक्तिभेदः कर्मविशेषात्। तदधिष्ठानाश्रये देहे तद्वादात्तद्वादः। न
स्वातन्त्र्यात्तद्वदे छायावच्चित्रवच्च। मूर्तत्वेऽपि न संघातयोगात्तरणिवत्। अणुपरिमाणं
तत्कृतिश्रुतेः। तदन्नमयत्वश्रुतेश्च ।

11.1 (3.7) mātā-pitr̥-jam mother – father – born **sthūlam** the gross **prāyaśaḥ** (*prāyaśas*) as a rule / **itarat** (n. neut, see itara) another **na_tathā** not so, not that
11.2 (3.8) pūrva-utpatteḥ (abl. since) former – produced by **tat-kāryatvam** of it – being a product **bhogāt** (abl. for) enjoyment **ekasya** (gen. belonging to) the one **na** not **itarasya** (gen. belonging to) the other **11.3 (3.9) saptadaśa-ekam** consisting of seventeen parts – one whole **liṅgam** the sign, the visible proof of the unmanifest person (liṅgaśarīra or subtle body) **11.4 (3.10) vyakti-bhedaḥ** manifestation – division, variety **karma-viśeṣāt** (abl. by) action – difference

11.5 (3.11) **tat-adhiṣṭhāna-āśraye** (loc. as for) that – governance – seat **dehe** (loc. in) gross body **tat-vādāt** (abl. propagating from) it – saying **tat-vādah** **11.6** (3.12) **na** not **svātantryāt** (ind.) on its own **tat-ṛte** that – without **chāyavat** shadow – like **citratvat** variegation, picture, painting – like **ca** and, or **11.7** (3.13) **mūrtatve_āpi** (loc. w/api even though) embodiment, incarnation **na** not **saṁghāta-yogāt** compacting, concretion – resulting from **taraṇivat** like the sun (the "crosser over") **11.8** (3.14) **aṇu-parimāṇam** minute, a minute division, atom – measuring **tat-kṛti-śruteḥ** (abl. coming from) it – creation – hearing **11.9** (3.15) **tat-anna-mayatva-śruteḥ** (abl. from) it – food – being made of – hearing **ca** and

(The opponent:) **11.1** **The gross (body 10.15-17), as a rule, is born from a mother and a father (but) there is another that is not. 11.2 It belongs to the one (nature 10.11), not the other (intellect 10.13), since it is produced by the former, being a product of it for enjoyment. 11.3 It is the one whole consisting of seventeen parts, the indicator (the subtle body). 11.4 The variety in manifestation (of bodies) is by the difference in karma.**

(The author:) **11.5** **As for the notion of the seat of governance over that (intellect) being in the body, the saying of it propagates from the saying of it. 11.6 Like a shadow or a painting, it (the body) does not exist on its own without that (intellect), 11.7 which, like the sun, is not a result of concretion, even though there is incarnation. 11.8 It is (rather) the measuring in atoms that comes from (mere (compare with 8.12)) hearing about the creation of it 11.9 and from (mere) hearing about its being made of food (earth).**

The opponent sees the physical body as a gross representation of a seventeenfold subtle body or "liṅgaśarīra": the five airs, the ten indriyas, mind, and intellect, all produced by nature. The author argues that the governance of mahat as intellect works the other way around, and he gives an example. To become visible, a shadow and a painting both depend on a light source such as the sun. The shadow depends on the light being blocked and the painting depends on its not being blocked. Also, the shadow occurs naturally by simply becoming evident, while the painting is a produced object. (This use of two examples, one produced and the other natural, is similar to 1.10 with the white cloth and the seed.)

The term "like the sun" in 11.7 completes the analogy begun in 11.6. The sun "makes" both the painting and the shadow by making them evident (again, intellect is brightness). The author dismisses blind faith in the words of the scriptures without self-examination, and the literal translation "hearing", rather

than "scripture" with its connotation of authority, better conveys his intent, especially in the context of saying propagating from saying. (See also "it is said in that regard" VD 7.5.) His argument about intellect (as an aspect of mahat) being the cause and not the effect, corresponds very closely with Vaisheshika 7.4-9.

पुरुषार्थं संसृतिर्लिङ्गानां सूपकरवद्राज्ञः पाञ्चभौतिको देहः। चातुर्भौतिकमित्येके ॥ ऐकभौ-
तिकमित्यपरे ॥ न सांसिद्धिकं चैतन्यं प्रत्येकादृष्टेः। प्रपञ्चमरणाद्यभावश्च मदशक्तिवच्चेत्प्रत्ये-
कपरिदृष्टे सौक्ष्म्यात् (in Aniruddha's manuscript) सांहत्ये तदुद्भवः। ज्ञानान्मुक्तिः। बन्धो
विपर्ययात्। नियतकारणत्वान्न समुच्चयविकल्पौ। स्वप्नजागराभ्यामिव मायिकामायिका-
भ्यां नोभयोर्मुक्तिः पुरुषस्य। इतरस्यापि नात्यन्तिकम्। संकल्पितेऽप्येवम् ॥ displaced
text ॥ विपर्ययभेदाः पञ्च।

11.10 (3.16) **puruṣa-artham** people – for the sake of **saṁsṛtiḥ** MW course, revolution, (esp.) passage through successive states of existence **liṅgānām** (gen. pl. belonging to) subtle bodies **sūpakāravat** like the cooks **rājñah** (gen. s. of rājān) a king **11.11** (3.17) **pāñca-bhautikaḥ** consisting of five gross elements **dehaḥ** body (3.18) **cātur-bhautikam** consisting of four gross elements **iti_eke** according to some (3.19) [*eka-bhautikam iti apare It is said later (in 20.10) to consist of one gross element (earth).*] (interpolation)

11.12 (3.20) **na** not **sānsiddhikam** natural, innate, self-existent **caitanyam** consciousness, awareness **pratyeka-ādṛṣṭeḥ** (to be inferred from) individuals one by one (*see 8.13*) – seeing (3.24) **prapañca-maraṇa-ādi-abhāvaḥ** expansion, manifest form – death, passing away – beginning with – non-existence **ca** and **11.13** (3.22) **mada-śakti-vat** (vatup ind. having) rapture, the impaired judgment of intoxication – the power of **cet** if you think ... then / **pratyeka-paridṛṣṭe** (loc. in the case where) individuals one by one – seen all around **saukṣmyāt** (abl. arising from) minuteness, triviality **sāmhatye** (loc. if) being struck together **tat-udbhavaḥ** their – origination **11.14** (3.23) **jñānāt** (abl. through) subtle understanding **muktiḥ** the liberating (3.24) **bandhaḥ** bondage **viparyayāt** (abl. through) the opposite of it **11.15** (3.25) **niyata-kāraṇatvāt** (abl. from) the state of the cause being brought under control (*see 3.2*) **na** no **samuccaya-vikalpau** (nom. dual) aggregation – manifoldness **11.16** (3.26) **svapna-jāgarābhyām_iva** (inst. w/iva "like", "by the example of") sleeping – awake **māyika-amāyikābhyām** (inst. with) one having illusion – one not having illusion **na** no **ubhayoḥ** (loc. dual; in two) **muktiḥ**

liberating **puruṣasya** (gen. of) one person **11.17** (3.27) **itarasya** (gen. of) the other **api** moreover **na** no **ātyantikam** permanence (3.28) **saṅkalpīte** (loc. when) imagined, made up in the mind **api_evam** most definitely so (*For api evam see also 8.3 and 15.18.*) (3.29-36 have been restored to their original place in Chapters 22-23.) **11.18** (3.37) **viparyaya-bhedāḥ** opposing, misconception – division, breakdown, an enumerated set **pañca** five

(The opponent:) **11.10** **The course of life is for the sake of the (individual) people belonging to the indicators (bodies) like a king's cooks.** **11.11** **The body does consist of the five gross elements. According to some it consists of four gross elements.**

(The author:) **11.12** **It is not to be inferred from seeing those individuals one by one that there is a self-existent consciousness (in them), and non-existence of it beginning with the passing away of their manifest form.** **11.13** **If you think it (this view) is just (our) having the power of rapture (see 4.11), well in the case where individuals one by one are seen all around, if it is just a matter of (atoms) being struck together, the origination of that (consciousness) would arise from minuteness (not greatness).** **11.14** **The liberating (view) is through a higher understanding (jñāna VD 1.3), bondage through the opposite.** **11.15** **Coming from the state where the cause is checked, there is no such 1.) aggregation (of atoms) or 2.) manifoldness (of souls), 11.16 no 3.) liberating of one person in two, with one having illusion and one not having illusion, like someone who is asleep and someone who is awake.** **11.17** **Moreover, there is no 4.) permanence of the other, 5.) that when something is just made up in the mind, it is most definitely so.** **11.18** **Thus the divisions of this opposite (view) are fivefold.**

In Vaisheshika sutra 1.3 that author says that the unsurpassed good comes through understanding (jñāna), and here in sutra 11.14 this author makes the same statement, that liberation is realized through jñāna, using the same word.

When it comes to refuting the notion that consciousness is a product of the physical atomic body, these authors do not abstain from strong language. Here in sutra 11.13 our author implies that the idea is trivial or small-minded, by using the word *saukṣmya* for "minuteness", while the author of the Vaisheshika calls it ignorant and mindless (see VD 7.4-9).

Five beliefs of the opposing view are given in sutras 11.15-17 as follows:

- 1.) aggregation of atoms;
- 2.) manifoldness of souls;
- 3.) liberated and non-liberated souls;
- 4.) permanence or perpetuity;
- 5.) the preexisting world as definite and real, not imagined.

Chapter Twelve

The Vaisheshika System vs. Karma

अशक्तिरष्टविंशतिधा तु । तुष्टिर्नवधा । सिद्धिरष्टधा । अवान्तरभेदाः पूर्ववत् । एवमितर-
स्याः । आध्यात्मकादिभेदान्नवधा तुष्टिः । ऊहादिभिः सिद्धिः अष्टधा (Aniruddha) ।
नेतरादितरहानेन विना । दैवादिप्रभेदा । आब्रह्मस्तम्बपर्यन्तं तत्कृते सृष्टिरविवेकात् ।

12.1 (3.38) **aśaktiḥ** non-power **aṣṭaviṁśatidhā** twenty-eight **tu** but **12.2** (3.39) **tuṣṭiḥ** satisfaction, gratification, fulfillment **navadhā** ninefold **12.3** (3.40) **siddhiḥ** accomplishment **aṣṭadhā** eightfold **12.4** (3.41) **avāntara-bhedāḥ** intermediate, subdivisions (the eleven) **pūrvavat** as before **12.5** (3.42) **evam** just the same **itarasyāḥ** (gen. of) the other (fem. refers to aśakti) **12.6** (3.43) **ādhyātmika-ādi-bhedāt** (abl. because) individual-related (ātman + manas) – the others (diś, kala) – the set **navadhā** (ninefold) **tuṣṭiḥ** fulfillment **12.7** (3.44) **ūha-ādibhiḥ** (inst. with, including) marking, noting, considering, deliberating – the others **siddhiḥ** accomplishing **aṣṭadhā** eightfold **12.8** (3.45) **na** no **itarāt** (abl. coming from) the one/the other **itara-hāne** (inst. w/vinā) the one/the other – abandoning, letting go **na** is not so **vinā** without (3.46) **daiva-ādi-prabhedā** belonging to or coming from the gods – etc. – species, kind, sort

12.9 (3.47) **ā-brahma-stamba-paryantam** up to and including – Brahman – a tuft or clump of sod – entirely **tat_kṛte** (ind.) thus done **sṛṣṭiḥ** the creation **avivekāṭ** (abl. arising from) non-distinction

(The opponent:) **12.1** But the non-power (referring to the divisions outlined in the Vaisheshika) is twenty-eight-fold: **12.2** the fulfillment ninefold, **12.3** the accomplishing (of it) eightfold, **12.4** the divisions of the intermediate set as before (eleven). **12.5** (Yours) is just the same as that of the other (the non-power group, as follows:) **12.6** The fulfillment is ninefold because of the set of those related to the individual and the others, **12.7** and the accomplishing of it

is eightfold including deliberation and the others. 12.8 What comes from that one (view, Vaisheshika), cannot be (held) without abandoning the other, the one about the gods, etc. (see 9.10)

(The author:) **12.9 Thus done, creation arises from non-distinction, from Brahman to a clump of sod (see 15.18, 24.16).**

After the author assigns a number to his "opposite" view, the opponent, in turn, puts a number to his. He points out the similarity between the author's principles as described in Chapter Three and the principles of Vaisheshika (meaning "having to do with the particulars"), which counts only four subtle elements in its enumeration sutras (VD 1.4-6), but he addresses only the "non-power" principles. He says the Vaisheshika system is completely incompatible with his belief in gods, religious rites, karma, etc.

Mahat and Prakṛti are considered by the author to be containers. They are the ones to whom the abilities or "powers" of perception and action are attributed, whereas all the principles that are created or produced make up the non-power group. With certain additions to the five subtle elements and to the five gross elements the whole non-power group is counted as twenty-eight-fold: nine plus eight plus eleven.

The "fulfillment" set is the nine divisions of the physical (dravya) in the Vaisheshika system (VD 1.4). It starts with the five gross elements—earth (prithivi), water (apas), fire (tejas), air (vayu), and the ether (ākāśa)—and is increased to nine by the development of dimension and time (dīś and kāla) and then mind and the *individual* (manas and ātman). It is called "fulfillment" because the nine divisions are the components of concrete physical reality, which is the point of completion and fulfillment of the creative process, for the sake of enjoyment. The author also calls it the fruit of creation (see 5.15).

The "accomplishing" set, also drawn from Vaisheshika (VD 1.5), are the eight (not seventeen!) divisions of guṇa, which are the essential constituents that give rise to the dravya set. These guṇas from Vaisheshika begin with four subtle elements—touch, taste, smell, and form—and become eight by the addition of ūha and the rest. The word "ūha", meaning "deliberation", corresponds to "saṁkhyāḥ" (VD 1.5), which means reckonings, or deliberation, reasoning, reflection, etc. (see "Saṁ-khyā, f." MW p. 1128.) The three others, "the rest", are: 1.) measurings (parimāṇāni); 2.) a single unnamed set consisting of certain discernings (buddhayaḥ) and certain endeavors (prayatnāḥ), corresponding to mind; and finally

3.) the sense of individuality (prthaktvam). The intermediate set is elevenfold—the ten indriyas and mind. Mind is thus counted twice in this scheme, once as the "eleventh" of Sankhya (9.5) and again as the *physical* mind of Vaisheshika.

The author replies that these particulars are exactly how creation emerges when Brahman becomes excluded, as the feminine aspect, the prime originating force, begins to lose her balance and to reel into diversity, and as the masculine aspect, mahat, begins to forget his eternal nature and to fail in his ability to distinguish it from his creation.

ऊर्ध्वं सत्त्वविशाला। तमोविशाला मूलतः। मध्ये रजोविशाला। कर्मवैचित्र्यात्प्रधानचेष्टा
गर्भदासवत्। आवृत्तिस्तत्राप्युत्तरोत्तरयोनियोगाद्धेयः। समानं जरामरणादिजं दुःखम्। न
कारणलयात्कृतकृत्यता मग्नवदुत्थानात्। अकार्यत्वेऽपि तद्योगः पारवश्यात्। स हि सर्व-
वित्सर्वकर्ता। ईदृशेश्वरसिद्धिः सिद्धा (सिद्धी)। प्रधानसृष्टिः परार्थं स्वतोऽप्यभोक्तृत्वादुष्ट-
कुङ्कुमवहनवत् ।

12.10 (3.48) **ūrdhvam** above, on high **sattva-viśālā** sattva – abounding in
12.11 (3.49) **tamas-viśālā** tamas – abounding in **mūlatas** (ind.) at the root – in the
lower region **12.12** (3.50) **madhye** (loc. in) the middle **rajas-viśālā** rajas –
abounding **12.13** (3.51) **karma-vaicitryāt** (abl. through) action – diversity
pradhāna-ceṣṭā (for) the principal – exertion, endeavoring **garbha-dāsavat** (vati
like) womb-born – servant(s) **12.14** (3.52) **āvṛttiḥ** returning **tatra** there, to that **api**
even **uttara-uttara-yoni-yogāt** higher and higher – birth(s) – through **heyaḥ**
abandoned, given up (3.53) **samānam** the same with **jarā-maraṇa-ādi-jam** aging
– death – etc. – born of **duḥkham** suffering **12.15** (3.54) **na** no **kāraṇa-layāt** (abl.
because) cause – dissolution into, melting (*see* 6.3) **kṛta-kṛtyatā** accomplishment
(nāśa 6.3) – to be done – right, proper **magnavat** (vati like) sunk, submerged
utthānāt (abl. through) rising **12.16** (3.55) **akāryatve_ api** (loc. w/api even)
without what is to be done **tat-yogaḥ** his – connection **pāravaśyāt** (abl. through)
subject to another's will, servitude **12.17** (3.56) **sa** he **hi** because, for **sarvavit**
knowing all **sarvakartā** doing all (3.57) **īdṛśa-īśvara-siddhiḥ** one endowed with
such qualities – supreme governor – establishing **siddhī** (dual) two proofs. (*I
believe there was an ancient copying error on this word (see the devanagarī),
where siddhī, which fits perfectly, became siddhā, which doesn't work at all.*)

12.18 (3.58) **pradhāna-sṛṣṭiḥ** principal – the creation **para-artham** other – for the benefit of **svatas** for his own **api** really / **abhoktrtvāt** (ind. adv.) without being the enjoyer **uṣṭra-kuṅkuma-vahanavat** (vati like) oxcart – saffron – carrying

(The opponent:) **12.10 Abounding in goodness on high, 12.11 abounding in darkness beneath, 12.12 abounding in passion in the middle, 12.13 like those born to servitude; the exertion of the principal (nature) through the diversity of karma; 12.14 (all) that is given up (in the end), even the returning to that through higher and higher births, (and) the same with suffering born of aging and dying, and all that. 12.15 There is no accomplishment of what has to be done through (your) 'rising' (see VD 1.1), like someone who is sunk, because there is that (final) dissolution into the cause (see 6.11). 12.16 Even without what has to be done, his connection (see also "tat-yogaḥ" 2.1, 3.1) is through being subject to the will of another (see 2.5-7). 12.17 For *He* is the one who comprehends all and creates all, and these are the two proofs establishing that the one who is endowed with such qualities (Brahman 12.9), is that supreme governor (not mahat).**

(The author:) **12.18 The principal's (mahat's) creation for the benefit of something apart (from it) is really for his own (benefit). Without being the enjoyer, it would be like carrying saffron with an oxcart (see 23.9).**

Here the opponent describes the three planes of human existence that are associated with the doctrine of reincarnation or transmigration of souls according to the smṛtis. He says that there is no rising to the ultimate good through understanding as stated in the first sutra of the Vaisheshika, but that man is instead governed by and subject to the will of a higher power.

The author concludes this half of the Sankhya Darshana with an interesting analogy. In his world, saffron probably ranked highest among all commodities for value compared to weight, as opposed to dung or firewood, which would be much more suitable for transportation in a crude heavy oxcart. Saffron, prized as a yellow dye, also aptly represents the well-established theme of coloring of consciousness through experience, which will be developed later in this work (and in the Yoga). He says that life experience, beginning in sattva and the others (the saffron), is not contained in subservient individuals, each one borne about in a gross body (the oxcart) created by nature.

Chapter Thirteen

Cessation and Letting Go

अचेतनत्वेऽपि क्षीरवच्चेष्टितं प्रधानस्य। कर्मवद् दृष्टेर्वा कालादेः। स्वभावाच्चेष्टितमनभिसं-
धानाद् भृत्यवत्। कर्माकृष्टेर्वानादितः। विविक्तबोधात्सृष्टिनिवृत्तिः प्रधानस्य सुदवत्पाके।
इतर इतरवत्तद्दोषात्। द्वयोरेकतरस्य वौदासीन्यमपवर्गः। अन्यसृष्ट्युपरागेऽपि न विरज्यते
प्रबुद्धरज्जुत्त्वस्यैवोरगः। कर्मनिमित्तयोगाच्च नैरपेक्ष्येऽपि प्रकृत्युपकारेऽविवेको निमित्तम्
नर्तकीवत्प्रवृत्तस्यापि निवृत्तिश्चारितार्थ्यात्। दोषबोधेऽपि नोपसर्पणं प्रधानस्य कुलवधूवत्
। नैकान्ततो बन्धमोक्षौ पुरुषस्याविवेकादृते ।

13.1 (3.59) **acetanatve api** (loc. w/api even though, even that) without intelligence, design, or conscious intent – being, which is **kṣīravat** like milk **ceṣṭitam** (itac having) exertion, effort, behavior **pradhānasya** (gen. belonging to) principal **13.2** (3.60) **karmavat** (vatup having, in accordance with) karma **drṣṭeḥ** (abl. known from) seeing **vā** either, or **kāla-ādeḥ** (abl. coming from) time – etc. (the gross elements) (3-64) **svabhāvāt** (abl. due to) one's own innate disposition **ceṣṭitam** (itac having) effort (in life) **anabhisamdhānāt** (see abhisamdhāna MW) (abl. because of) absence of design **bhṛtyavat** (vati like) servant **13.3** (3.62) **karma-ākṣṣṭeḥ** (abl. known from) karman – the effect of drawing to oneself **vā** or **anāditaḥ** (tasil through) the beginningless, the preexisting

13.4 (3.63) **vivikta-bodhāt** (abl. known through) discriminative – consciousness **sṛṣṭi-nivṛtṭiḥ** creation – cessation **pradhānasya** (gen. of) principal **sūdavat** (vati as) cook(s) **pāke** (loc. regarding, with) the cooking (3-64) **itaraḥ** one **itaravat** like the other **tat-doṣāt** (abl. for) in those – fault **13.5** (3.65) **dvayoḥ ekatarasya vā** (see 5.1) **audāsīnyam** an abiding apart (from) (see the source word "udāsīna" MW) **apavargaḥ** completion, coming to a close **13.6** (3.66) **anya-sṛṣṭi-uparāge api** (loc. w/api even though) another – creating – coloring, influence **na** not **virajyate** (from virañj) to be dismissed **prabuddha-rajju-tattvasya** (gen. point of view "to") wake up, become aware of – rope – reality **iva** like, as (it appears) **uragaḥ** snake **13.7** (3.67) **karma-nimitta-yogāt** (abl. from) karma as instrumental cause – resulting from **ca** moreover (3-68) **nairapekṣye api** (ṣyañ of nirapekṣa) (loc. w/api even though) disinterestedness **prakṛti-upakāre** (loc. whenever) nature – assistance **avivekaḥ** without distinguishing **nimittam** cause

(3.69) **nartakīvat** (vati like) female dancer **pravṛttisya** (gen. of) activity **api** actually **nivṛtīḥ** cessation **cāritārthyāt** (ind.) the object being attained **13.8** (3.70) **doṣa-bodhe** (loc. when) fault – knowing, awareness **api** indeed **na** no **upasarpaṇam** approaching softly **pradhānasya** (gen. on the part of) principal **kula-vadhūvat** (vati likeness of) a refined woman **13.9** (3.71) **na ekāntataḥ** not at all **bandha-mokṣau** bondage and/or liberation **puruṣasya** (gen. of) the person **avivekāḥ** (abl.) non-distinguishing **ṛte** (w/abl.) without, but for

(The opponent:) **13.1 Having one's effort (in life), even that which, like (the flow of) milk (10.6), is without conscious intent, does belong to (our) principal (nature). 13.2 That one's effort, servant-like because of the absence of design, is due to one's innate disposition, is known either from seeing what comes from time and the others (the gross elements) in accordance with karma, 13.3 or from the drawing effect of karma, through the preexisting (world).**

(The author:) **13.4, Through discriminative consciousness, there is a cessation of the principal's creation, as (your) cooks (see 11.10) (finish) with the cooking, for there is fault in those (your proofs 13.2-3), the one and the other alike. 13.5 (but) alternatively to that (your view in 5.1) of the one in relation to the two, such a completion is (rather) an abiding apart from it (the creation) (see 3.18). 13.6 Even though there may be just the coloring influence (of imagination) creating another thing, it is not to be dismissed. It is like a deadly snake (on the road), as it appears to one who (then) becomes aware that the reality is (only) a rope. 13.7 Moreover, with karma being associated as the cause, whenever there is the assistance of nature, even though she is disinterested, such a cause is (known) without distinguishing. Like a dancing girl, there is actually cessation of her activity when its object is attained. 13.8 Indeed when there is awareness of that fault (see 13.4), there is not (even) a soft approach of (your) principal like a refined woman. 13.9 There is no bondage or liberation of a person at all, but for that non-distinguishing (13.7).**

The opponent has offered two proofs, both already denied by the author in 1.16-17. One is the infinite variety of things in nature's creation (13.2), and the other is the (wrongly) inferred connection of quality of life with an ongoing cyclic system of reward and punishment for right and wrong behavior (13.3). (Those two are the space-related and the time-related, respectively.)

His view of the relationship between the individual and his subtle senses and powers is that the former is proved by the latter. Alternatively, the author's view is that even when the latter are completely stilled, the self is still present (see 3.18).

This idea is presented in very much the same way as it is in the Yoga, that upon containment of the ways of thought there is abiding of the self in his own form (see YD 1.2).

The author refers to the story of a man who is filled with fear upon encountering a deadly snake on the road in the twilight, but when he looks closer he realizes that his frightening "reality" of the moment before was actually just a coil of rope lying there. His point is that in the liberating view both realities are valid in their time and both inevitably come to an end, so the snake experience with its fear is not to be dismissed as a mistake after the fact.

Sutras 13.7-9 are a development of the point made in 10.5, that there is cessation and not continuance. The female dancer illustrates the active role of nature. Whether it is like the lively rajasic performance of a servant dancer, or the gentle sattvic movement of a refined person, he says nature's activity ceases when the awareness of it ceases because awareness is the cause, not nature.

प्रकृतेराञ्जस्यात्ससङ्गत्वात्पशुवत्। रूपैः सप्तभिरात्मानं बध्नाति प्राधानं कोशकारवद्विमोच-
यत्येकरूपेण। निमित्तत्वमविवेकस्य न दृष्टहानिः। तत्त्वाभ्यासान्नेति नेतीति त्यागाद्विवेक-
सिद्धिः। अधिकारिप्रभेदान्न नियमः। बाधितानुवृत्त्या मध्यविवेकतोऽप्युपभोगः। जीवन्मु-
क्तश्च। उपदेश्योपदेष्टृत्वात्तत्सिद्धिः। श्रुतिश्च। इतरथान्धपरम्परा। चक्रभ्रमणवद् धृतशरीरः
। संस्कारलेशतस्तत्सिद्धिः। विवेकान्निःशेषदुःखनिवृत्तौ कृतकृत्यता नेतरात् (नेतरात्)।
(The repetition is artificial.)

13.10 (3.72) **prakṛteḥ** (gen. belong to) nature **āñjasyāt** (ind.) surely **sasaṅgatvāt** (abl. through) attachment **paśuvat** (vati like) domesticated animal

13.11 (3.73) **rūpaiḥ** (inst. pl.) ways **saptabhiḥ** (inst. in these ways) seven or "often used to express an indefinite plurality" (MW), "many" **ātmanam** himself **badhnāti** binds (reflexive ātmanepada) **pradhānam** principal **kośakāravat** (vati like) "case (cocoon) maker", silkworm **vimocayati** liberates himself **eka-rūpeṇa** one way **13.12** (3.74) **nimitta-tvam** cause – (this) being **avivekasya** (gen. of) non-distinguishing **na** not **dr̥ṣṭa-hāniḥ** learned knowledge – abandoning, letting go **13.13** (3.75) **tattva-abhyāsāt** principle, truth – discipline of repeated study, constant mindfulness **na iti na iti iti tyāgāt** (abl. through) "no" – "no" – thus – leaving, abandoning, forsaking, letting go **viveka-siddhiḥ** distinguishing – accomplishing, realizing **13.14** (3.76) **adhikāri-prabhedāt** (abl. from the

standpoint of) one of authority, governor – subdivision **na** no **niyamaḥ** rule, restriction **13.15** (3.77) **bādhita-anuvṛttyāḥ** (abl. arising from) that which has been excluded – return **madhya-vivekataḥ** (madhya + tasil) "out of the midst" in the midst – distinction **apī** even **upabhogaḥ** life experience (3.78) **jīvan-muktaḥ** living – liberated **ca** indeed, thus **13.16** (3.79) **upadeśya-upadeṣṭṛ-tvāt** (abl. through) taught – teacher – being **tat-siddhiḥ** his – achievement (3.80) **śrutiḥ** scripture **ca** in addition to **13.17** (3.81) **itarathā** otherwise **andha-paramparā** blind – tradition (3.82) **cakra-bhramaṇavat** (vati like) wheel – spinning **dhṛta-śarīraḥ** retaining a body, continuing to live, existing (3.83) **saṃskāra-leśataḥ** (tasil brought about through) mind construct – little **tat-siddhiḥ** his – achievement **13.18** (3.84) **vivekāt** (abl. through) distinguishing **niḥśeṣa-duḥkha-nivṛttau** (loc. upon) without remainder, complete – suffering – cessation **kṛta-kṛtya** – **tā** done – to be done – the having **na** not **itarāt** (abl. through) the other way

(The opponent:) **13.10** Surely, that (bondage) must belong to nature, through attachment, like a domesticated animal.

(The author:) **13.11** (More) like a silkworm, the principal liberates himself in one way, (though) he binds himself in seven (many) ways, **13.12** not letting go of the learned knowledge, this being the cause of his non-distinguishing. **13.13** It is through letting go, thus: "there is no ...", "there is no ..." (... aggregation, manifoldness, etc. see 11.15-17), that distinguishing is realized, (and) by constant mindfulness of the truth, **13.14** (but) for the *subdivision* of the governor (mahat), there is no such rule. **13.15** He is (thus) the living liberated one, his life experience arising from the return of what has been excluded (learned knowledge), even in the midst of distinguishing. **13.16** His achievement is through *being* teacher and taught in addition to scripture. **13.17** Otherwise there is just blind tradition, his achievement brought about through a little mind construct, maintaining a body like spinning the wheel (of reincarnation). **13.18** The having done that which is to be done happens upon the complete cessation of suffering through distinguishing, not through that other way.

Unlike a donkey or a cow in the opponent's example, the author's silkworm is bound by cords of his own making, and upon the realization of his true form he comes out of his bondage, not by atonement and redemption but simply by abandoning his confinement. For the inward-looking phase *only*, there is abandoning by affirmation of the liberating view and negation of the obstacles to liberation inherent in the living view.

The statement of exemption from this for the personal self, expressed in sutra 13.14, teaches an important point and serves as a caution. He is saying that the whole subject of establishing the state of distinguishing is for the *higher* self, the intellect, the seeker of truth, examining consciousness rather than the physical world. On the other hand, his "subdivision" of mahat, which is the gross personal identity and the body that functions in day to day life, continues to live according to the objective worldly view. It would be absurd and untrue to go about living your daily life in the physical world claiming that it is dissolved when you look away or that memory creates the past, or that other people don't have souls. Pondering and reflecting, even with the aid of a book (whether reading or writing), is a solitary practice, but once we start acting and speaking in the world, we are bound by the rules of ordinary life. Out of the two-fold purpose of life, spiritual realization on the one side and the experience of life on the other, the teaching of the liberating view applies to the former only. This is the domain of the great mahat alone, making the intellectual connection (yoga) with his manifest creation. Still, though the spiritual and the material views are opposite, they are not mutually exclusive, because when there is the development of comprehension of that inner aspect of truth that is *not* the taught and learned truth, the two opposites are found to complete one another.

Chapter Fourteen

The Stories

राजपुत्रवत्त्वोपदेशात्। पिशाचवदन्यार्थोपदेशोऽपि। आवृत्तिरसकृदुपदेशात्। पितापुत्र-
वदुभयोर्दृष्टत्वात्। श्येनवत्सुखदुःखी त्यागवियोगाभ्याम्। अहिनिर्ह्वयनीवत्। छिन्नहस्तव-
द्वा। असाधनानुचिन्तनं बन्धाय भरतवत्। बहुभिर्योगे विरोधो रागादिभिः कुमारीशङ्खवत्।
द्वाभ्यामपि तथैव। निराशः सुखी पिङ्गलावत्। अनारम्भेऽपि परगृहे सुखी सर्पवत्। बहुशा-
स्त्रगुरुपासनेऽपि सारादानं षडदवत्। इषुकारवन्नैकचित्तस्य समाधिहानिः। कृतनियमल-
ङ्घनादानार्थक्यं लोकवत्। तद्विस्मरणेऽपि भेकीवत् नोपदेशश्रवणेऽपि कृतकृत्यता परामर्शा-
दृते विरोचनवत् दृष्टस्तयोरिन्द्रस्य ।

14.1 (4.1) **rāja-putravat** (vati like) king – son (*not "king's son" or "kings for sons (Veda Vyasa)"*) **tattva-upadeśāt** (abl. from) truth – teaching (4.2) **piśācavat** (vati like) primitives **anya-artha-upadeśaḥ** other – purpose(s) – teaching **api** even

14.2 (4.3) **āvṛttiḥ** reversion, returning **asakṛt-upadeśāt** (abl. from) repeatedly – teaching (4.4) **pitā-putravat** (vati like) father – son **ubhayoḥ** (loc. in) both **dr̥ṣṭatvāt** (abl. because) being learned **14.3** (4.5) **śyenavat** (vati like) osprey (referring to "kurara" in MB 178) **sukha-duḥkhī** having pleasure or pain **tyāga-viyogābhyām** (abl. from) abandoning – separation (4.6) **ahi-nirvlayanivat** the shed skin of a snake (4.7) **chinna-hastavat** like cut-off hands **vā** or **14.4** (4.8) **asādhana-anucintanam** uncondusive to the goal – attitude **bandhāya** (dative tending to) bonding **bharatavat** like Bharata **14.5** (4.9) **bahubhiḥ** (inst. pl. with) many **yoge** (loc. in) association **virodhaḥ** hostility, clashing **rāga-ādibhiḥ** (inst. pl. through) passion, desire – etc. **kumārī-śaṅkha-vat** girl – shells – like (4.10) **dvābhyām** (inst. by) two **api** but even **tathā** in that way **eva** just so (4.11) **nirāśaḥ** (nir-āśa) without any hope or wish or desire **sukhī** happy **piṅgalāvat** like Piṅgalā **14.6** (4.12) **anārambhe** (loc. in the case of) without any undertaking **api** even **para-gr̥he** (loc. in) another – house **sukhī** (a sukhin) happy **sarpavat** like a snake **14.7** (4.13) **bahu-śāstra-guru-upāsane api** (loc. w/api even) many – lessons – master – attending **sāra-ādānam** taking the essence **ṣaṭpadavat** like a "six-foot" bee (*or "six-word" a subtle reference to Vaisheshika*) (4.14) **iṣu-karavat** (vati like) arrow – maker **na** not **eka-cittasya** (gen. point of view; for) single-minded, resolute **samādhi-hāniḥ** contemplation – abandoning **14.8** (4.15) **kṛta-niyama-laṅghanāt** established – rules, laws, ways – disregarding, transgression **ānarthakyam** uselessness, pointlessness **lokavat** (vati like) world (4.16) **tat-vismaraṇe api** (loc. w/api even if) (of) them – forgetting **bhekivat** (vati like) female frog **14.9** (4.17) **na** not **upadeśa-śravaṇe** (loc. upon) teaching – hearing **api** even, just **kṛta-kṛtyatā** (tā f. abstract) accomplished – task **para-āmarśāt-ṛte** (abl. w/ṛte without) grasping (the point) **virocanavat** like Virocana the asura (4.18) **dr̥ṣṭaḥ** seen **tayoḥ** (loc. dual; between) those two **indrasya** (gen.) by Indra

(The opponent:) **14.1** That comes from the *teaching* of truth, like the king and the son; even teaching for other (moral) purposes, like that of the Piśāca.

(The author:) **14.2** Like father to son, because of its being learned knowledge in both cases, what comes from such repeated teaching is the return (to suffering). **14.3** Like the osprey, having pleasure vs. displeasure from abandoning vs. separation (respectively), like a snake shedding its skin or like severed hands. **14.4** Like Bharata, an attitude toward bonding (to

another) is uncondusive of the goal; 14.5 (bonding) with many, there is clashing in the association, through desire, etc. like the girl's shells, but even with two it is just the same, like Piṅgalā, happy without any such desire, 14.6 even without any undertaking, happy in the house of another, like a snake. 14.7 For the single-minded, even with attendance at many lessons there is taking of the essence, like the bee, (or) like the arrow maker, not abandoning his contemplation; 14.8 (but) even if you forget them, like (in the story of) the frog princess, there is no point in disregarding established ways as in the world. 14.9 So it is *not* just on hearing the teaching, like Virocana, that what is to be done is done, not without grasping that (essential point) which is seen by Indra, between the two (Virocana and Indra).

The opponent disagrees with the author's last statement in sutra 13.16. He says that living liberation is not through being teacher and taught in one person, but rather in two persons. In the example from scripture, the king is Pravāhaṇa and the son involved is not his own, but rather Śvetaketu, the son of the sage Gautama (see Chandogya Upanishad V, 3, 1). The words spoken by that kshatrya to the brahmin Gautama, rather more religious than enlightening, are the lesson of the five agnis. The other reference, the stories and parables of the primitive tribes of ancient India referred to by the opponent as the Piśāca, have been translated into Sanskrit as "Kathā Sarit Sāgara", and subsequently into English in the last century.

Parents give their children repeated instruction in the ways of life, but this kind of instruction has nothing to do with liberation, and rightly so. Children and youth should not be taught this philosophy. In sutras 14.3-7, the author recites the six lessons of the ascetic rishi Bodhya (Mahābhārata XII, 178 Ganguli (171 Tokunaga/Smith)), embellished with references to other traditional stories. Like the lesson of Virocana and Indra from Chandogya Upanishad VIII, 8, they illustrate the difference between superficial and essential understanding. The stories teach three themes that correspond to the threefold suffering mentioned in 1.1, all from the ascetic's point of view. The first represents physical pleasure versus physical pain; the second, social pleasure versus social pain; and the third, the loss of self-focus.

Sutra 14.3 is about physical pleasure and pain, like gulls either waiting or fighting for scraps of food, or like one losing a body part either painlessly or painfully. The ascetic renounces indulgence in physical pleasure and pain. Sutras 14.4-6 are about company, like King Bharata who becomes so attached to his beloved pet deer that he neglects the duties of life; or like the girl hoping to remain

undiscovered as she provides food for company, taking off her shell bracelets to avoid the rattling noise; or like Piṅgalā who finally gives up the hope that her lover will come, renouncing the pain along with the hope; or like the solitary snake who avoids building a house of his own. Guests, lovers and households represent social pleasure and pain, and the ascetic is happy to have none. Sutra 14.7 is about maintaining clarity or focus by not succumbing to the scattering of thoughts. Grasping the essence of lessons requires such focus, like a bee who heads straight for the essential part of the flower, not distracted by other things, or like an arrow maker who remains attentive to the task before his eyes, not distracted by the passing by of a king and his entourage. In sutra 12.8 the author concludes by dismissing asceticism as a means of achieving liberation. Worldly life will suffice, even if one fails to observe all the rules and karmas; and one's cherished life will not revert to a lower form, as the Prince's lovely wife reverted to being a frog when he forgot the rule he had promised, not to show her water.

प्रणतिब्रह्मचर्योपसर्पणानि कृत्वा सिद्धिर्बहुकालात्तद्वत् । न कालनियमो वामदेववत् ।
 अध्यस्तरूपोपासनात्पारम्पर्येण यज्ञोपासकानामिव । इतरलाभेऽप्यावृत्तिः पञ्चाग््नियोगतो
 जन्मश्रुतेः । विरक्तस्य हेयहानमुपादेयोपादानं हंसक्षीरवत् । लब्धातशययोगाद्वा तद्वत् । न
 कामचारित्वं रागोपहते शुकवत् । गुणयोगाद्बद्धः शुकवत् । न भोगाद्रागशान्तिर्मुनिवत् ।
 दोषदर्शनादुभयोः । न मलिनचेतस्युपदेशबीजप्ररोहोऽजवत् । नाभासमात्रमपि मलिन-
 दर्पणवत् न तज्जस्यापि तद्रूपता पङ्कजवत् । न भूतियोगेऽपि कृतकृत्यतोपास्यसिद्धिवत्
 (उपास्यसिद्धिवत्) । (The repetition is artificial.)

14.10 (4.19) **praṇati-brahmacarya-upasarpaṇāni** acts of reverence – student life – service to the master **kṛtvā** (ind.part.) having done **siddhiḥ** accomplishment **bahu-kālāt** (adv.) for a long time **tadvat** like that, like him

14.11 (4.20) **na** no **kāla-niyamaḥ** time – rule **vāmadevavat** (vati like) Vāmadeva (see *Aitareya Upanishad IV "and Rig Veda IV, 27, 1*) **14.12** (4.21) **adhyasta-rūpa-upāsanāt** (abl. from) placed over, superimposed – form – worship **pāramparyeṇa** (inst. by) degrees **yajña-upāsakānām** (gen. on the part of) rite – worshippers **iva** as if (4.22) **itara-lābhe** (loc. upon) other – obtaining, attaining, finding **api** even **āvṛttiḥ** returning **pañca-agni-yogataḥ** (tasil) five – fires – according to **janma-śruteḥ** (abl. from) birth (janman), origin – scripture **14.13**

(4.23) **viraktasya** (gen. point of view; to) one free from passion **heya-hānam** to be left – leaving **upādeya-upādānam** to be taken – taking **haṁsa-kṣīravat** (vati like) swan – milk (4.24) **labdha-atīśaya-yogāt** having acquired – superiority – from **vā** or **tadvat** (vati like) him (Indra) **14.14** (4.25) **na** no **kāma-cāritvam** (according to) desire – acting, behavingness; hedonism **rāga-upahate** (loc. when) stricken with passion **śukavat** (vati like) Śuka, son of Vyasa (4.26) **guṇayogāt** by cords/prakṛti **baddhaḥ** bound **śukavat** (vati like) parrot **14.15** (4.27) **na** no **bhogāt** (abl. from) experience **rāga-śāntiḥ** passion – pacification **munivat** (vati like) the monk (4.28) **doṣa-darśanāt** (abl. from) degradation – seeing **ubhayoḥ** (loc. in) both **14.16** (4.29) **na** not **malina-cetasi** (loc. in) muddy – mind **upadeśa-bija-prarohaḥ** teaching – seed – germinating **ajavat** (vati like) King Aja (4.30) **na** not **ābhāsa-mātram** semblance – mere **api** even **malina-darpaṇavat** (vati like) muddy – mirror **14.17** (4.31) **na** not **tat-jasya** (gen. being of) that – born **api** in fact **tat-rūpatā** it – (ifc) formed of **pañkajavat** (vati like) lotus **14.18** (4.32) **na** not **bhūti-yoge** (loc. in the case of) prosperity – association **api** even **kṛta-kṛtyatā** have done – to be done **upāsya-siddhivat** (vati like) to be revered – accomplishments **upāsya-siddhivat**

(The opponent:) **14.10** Like him (Indra), there is accomplishment having done reverence, study, and service for a long time (101 years in Indra's case).

(The author:) **14.11** Like Vāmadeva, there is *no* rule as to time, **14.12** as if it were by degrees through worship of the superimposed forms (the gods), on the part of worshippers at the religious rite, returning even upon attaining the other (worlds), according to the five agnis from the scripture on origins. (Chandogya Up. V 4-8.) **14.13** To one who is free from passion, there is leaving what is to be left (and) taking what is to be taken, like the swan with milk; or like him (Indra), from having acquired *that* superiority (in understanding, as opposed to 5.5). **14.14** No hedonism when stricken with passion, like Śuka, bound by cords, like a parrot. **14.15** No pacification of passion through life experience, like the monk (Sobhari), because it comes from seeing the degradation in both (passion and experience). **14.16** There is no germination of the seed of teaching in a muddy mind, like (King) Aja; not even a mere semblance, like a muddy mirror. **14.17** In fact, like the lotus, being of what is *born* in that (mud, (that seed)), it (the teaching) does not take the form of that (mud). **14.18** The having done what is to be done is not like the accomplishments of those who are to be revered (the learned 14.1-2), even in the case of one associated with prosperity (the King 14.1).

Like the last section, these three scriptural references correspond to the threefold suffering mentioned in 1.1. Sutra 14.14 is about addiction to pleasure. "The man without attachments, no longer cherishing any desire for earning wealth, can sleep happily. Ho, it was well said by Śuka while going to the great forest from his father's abode, renouncing everything!" (Mahābhārata XII, 177 Ganguli). He uses a play on words here. The name Śuka means parrot, and parrots were captured with nets made of cords. The word for a cord or strand is *guṇa*, which of course also refers to the three *guṇas* of nature. Sutra 14.15 is about family. According to Vijñāna Bhikṣu, the monk could be Saubhari, who abandoned his solitude out of desire for the joys of a householder, only later to realize the futility of his perpetual desire for wealth and family (Viṣṇu Purāna IV, 2, 47). Sutra 14.16 is about shock. In the muddy state of grief, like King Aja after the death of his beloved wife, there is a loss of self-focus (Śvetāśvatara Upanishad IV, 5).

The three examples above illustrate a range of distractions from hedonism to family life and even grief, but in the end the author dismisses the renunciation of a normal life that would inevitably hold such distractions, whether it is the *rajas* of passion or the *tamas* of grief. He says that grasping the essential meaning is the means, and the goal is simply the absence of suffering, not necessarily renunciation *or* prosperity. He concludes this chapter by referring back to its beginning and by transforming the mud and seed metaphor of 14.16 into an illustration of the difference between essential understanding and learned knowledge.

Chapter Fifteen

Prayer

मङ्गलाचरणं शिष्टाचारात्फलदर्शनाच्छ्रुतितश्चेति। नेश्वराधिष्ठिते फलनिष्पत्तिः कर्मणा तत्सिद्धेः। स्वोपकारादधिष्ठानं लोकवत्। लौकिकेश्वरवदितरथा। पारिभाषिको वा। न रागादृते तत्सिद्धिः प्रतिनियतकारणत्वात्। तद्योगेऽपि न नित्यमुक्तः। प्रधानशक्तियो- गाच्चेत्सङ्गापत्तिः। सत्तामात्राच्चेत्सर्वैश्वर्यम्। प्रमाणाभावान्न तत्सिद्धिः। सम्बन्धाभावान्नानुमानम्॥ (restored text) पुत्रकर्मवदिति चेत्। नास्ति हि तत्र स्थिर एकात्मा यो गर्भाधानादिना संस्क्रियते ।

15.1 (5.1) **maṅgala-ācāraṇam** prayer or rite for happiness or good luck – performance, usage **śiṣṭa-ācārāt** (abl. because) cultured, learned, educated – traditional, customary usage **phala-darśanāt** (abl. because) fruit(s), result(s) – seeing **śrūtitaḥ** (tasil because) scripture **ca** and **iti** thus **15.2** (5.2) **na** not **iśvara-adhiṣṭhite** (loc. if) supreme governor – presided over, governed, superintended **phala-niṣpattiḥ** fruit, result – fruition **karmaṇā** (inst. through) action **tat-siddheḥ** (abl. because) it – accomplishing

15.3 (5.3) **sva-upakārāt** (abl. from) self – benefit, service **adhiṣṭhānam** governance **lokavat** as the world (5.4) **laukika-iśvaravat** (vati like, in the sense of) worldly – lord **itarathā** (with vā) rather than (5.5) **pāribhāṣikaḥ** conventional meaning **vā** alternatively **15.4** (5.6) **na** not **rāgāt-ṛte** without desire (for it) **tat-siddhiḥ** it – accomplishing **prati-niyata-kāraṇa-tvāt** (abl. because) counter-checked, overruled – cause – state **15.5** (5.7) **tat-yoge** (loc. in) that connection **api** however **na** not **nitya-muktaḥ** eternal – free **15.6** (5.8) **pradhāna-śakti-yogāt** (abl. for) principal – powers – in connection with **cet** if ... then **saṅga-āpattiḥ** sticking, clinging contact, attachment – happening, occurring **15.7** (5.9) **sattā-mātrāt** being that – simply **cet** if **sarva-iśvaryam** (over) all, everyone – being supreme ruler (5.10) **pramāṇa-abhāvāt** (abl. because) proof – absence **na** no **tat-siddhiḥ** it – establishing **15.8** (5.11) **sambandha-abhāvāt** (abl. because) connection (*same as pratibandha 5.1*) – absence **na** not **anumānam** inference **15.9** (1.32) (*These six sutras clearly belong here and not where they are found in manuscripts, because of the theme of prayer, the "if ... then" format of 15.9, which matches 15.6 and 15.7, and the proximity of the Buddhist doctrines of momentariness (15.10) and emptiness (16.1). Restoring them to their proper place also corrects both of the anomalies in the numeric structure.*) **putrakarmavat** like the ceremony for a son **iti** (quotes) **cet** if ... then (4.33) **na** not **asti** it is **hi** because **tatra** in that place **sthiraḥ** steady, constant, persevering **eka-ātmā** one, same – individual **yaḥ** the one who **garbhadhādinā** (inst. by) impregnation ceremony – etc. **saṃskriyate** to be blessed

(The opponent:) **15.1** Because it is the custom of the learned, because of seeing results, and because of scripture, *thus* is the performance of prayer. **15.2** There is no fruition of result if governed by (your) supreme one (mahat), because it is accomplished through karma.

(The author:) **15.3** Alternatively to the conventional meaning, which is like a *worldly* supreme governor (iśvara), governance comes rather from a *self-benefit*, appearing as the world. **15.4** It is not accomplished without the desire

for it, (simply) because that is the (desired) state where the cause (of bondage and suffering) is counter-checked. 15.5 It is not, however, the eternal free one in the connection with that (desire). 15.6 If you think it (governance) comes from a connection with the *power* of a principal; well, then there would be the occurrence of attachment. 15.7 If you think it comes from simply *being* that, being the supreme lord (īśvara) of all; well, (as you say in 5.6) there is no establishing that because of the absence of proof. 15.8 There is not (even) inference (as proof of that), because of the absence of a connection. 15.9 If you think that (seeing results 15.1) is like the "ceremony for a son", it is not, because the one who perseveres in that place, by the impregnation rite or whatever, is the very same individual who is to be blessed by it.

स्थिरकार्यासिद्धेः क्षणिकत्वम् । न प्रत्यभिज्ञाबाधात् । श्रुतिन्यायविरोधाच्च दृष्टान्तासिद्धेश्च ॥
श्रुतिरपि प्रधानकार्यत्वस्य । नाविद्याशक्तियोगो निःसङ्गस्य । तद्योगे तत्सिद्धावन्योन्याश्र-
यत्वम् । न बीजाङ्कुरवत्सादिसंसारश्रुतेः । विद्यातोऽन्यत्वे ब्रह्मबाधप्रसङ्गः । अबाधे नैश्फ-
त्यम् । विद्याबाध्यत्वे जगतोऽप्येवम् । तद्रूपत्वे सादित्वम् ।

15.10 (1.34) **sthira-kārya-asiddheḥ** (abl. because) persevering – result – not accomplished **kṣaṇikatvam** momentariness (4.35) **na** not **pratyabhijñā-bādhāt** (abl. to be inferred just because) direct recognition – excluded 15.11 (1.36) **śruti-nyāya-vira-ūdhāt** (abl. known from) scripture – reasoning – men – conclusions **ca** and 15.12 (1.37) **drṣṭānta-asiddheḥ** (abl. because) example – not (necessarily) established **ca** indeed 15.13 (5.12) **śrutiḥ** scripture **api** even **pradhāna-kāryatvasya** (gen. of) principal – product – being 15.14 (5.13) **na** no **avidyā-śakti-yogaḥ** (in the) lack of higher knowledge – power – connection **niḥsaṅgasya** (gen. for) indifferent 15.15 (5.14) **tat-yoge** (loc. if) that – connection **tat-siddhau** (loc. if) that – establishing **anyonyāśrayatvam** state of mutual dependence 15.16 (5.15) **na** not **bīja-aṅkuravat** (vati like) seed – sprout **sādi-samsāra-śruteḥ** (abl. understood from) having a beginning – the course of life, the world – scripture 15.17 (5.16) **vidyātas** (tasil as a result) higher knowledge **anya-tve** (loc. if) otherwise **brahma-bādha-prasaṅgaḥ** Brahman – excluded – it would happen (5.17) **abādhe** (loc. when) not excluded **naiṣphalyam** there being no fruition

15.18 (5.18) **vidyā-bādhya-tve** (loc. in) higher knowledge – excluded by – being **jagataḥ** (gen. of) living world **api evam** (see also 8.3, 16.7) indeed exactly (5.19) **tat-rūpa-tve** (loc. in) that – the very form **sāditvam** state of beginning

(The opponent:) **15.10 That there is momentariness, because a result is not accomplished by one who perseveres, is not to be inferred just because direct recognition (perception) of it (the relation between the perseverance and the result) is excluded. 15.11 It is known from the conclusions of men by (both) scripture (testimony) and reasoning (inference); 15.12 because indeed it doesn't have to be established by an example (perception). 15.13 There is even scripture on its (a result's) being a *product* of the principal (nature). 15.14 For the indifferent (nature) there is no connection between her power (14.6) and a lack of such higher knowledge (15.11). 15.15 If there were a connection with that (lack of higher knowledge, ignorance) in establishing that (power), there would be a state of mutual dependence. 15.16 That it is like seed and sprout is not to be understood from scripture on the world having a beginning. 15.17 If it were (your) other way, it would happen that *Brahman* would be excluded by our higher knowledge (15.11), there being no fruition when he is not excluded.**

(The author:) **15.18 That (fruition) of the living world is indeed exactly that, in his being excluded by (your) 'higher knowledge'. Its state of beginning is in the very form of that (exclusion).**

The principle of momentariness is consistent with the teaching of the Darshanas in that time is only a present moment construct of memory or anticipation. The opponent argues that a relationship of cause and effect between a Vedic rite and the result is known by the testimony of scripture and by inference from the examples seen in the range of quality in the lives of others, whereas a knowledge limited to direct self-recognition would exclude that relationship.

He cleverly says in 15.15 that if there were a claim to power in the ignorance of rejecting the external authority of scripture and that of the hierarchy of spiritual and intellectual leadership, then there would be ignorance in that claim to power. The author replies that life's very beginning is in the state of exclusion of Brahman, the state of losing the awareness of one's pure self as Brahman, being captured by the facts and explanations, affirming that they "really" exist. Otherwise there would be no life and no world, and that is impossible.

Chapter Sixteen

Dharma and Happiness

॥ (restored text) तदभावे तदभावाच्छून्यं तर्हि। शून्यं तत्त्वं भावो विनश्यति वस्तुधर्म-
त्वाद्विनाशस्य। अपवादमात्रमबुद्धानम्। उभयपक्षसमानक्षमत्वादयमपि। अपुरुषार्थत्वमु-
भयथा ॥ न धर्मापलापः प्रकृतिकार्यवैचित्र्यात्। श्रुतिलिङ्गादिभिस्तत्सिद्धिः। न नियमः
प्रमाणान्तरावकाशात्। उभयत्राभ्येवम्। अर्थात्सिद्धिश्चेत्समानमुभयोः अन्तःकरणधर्मत्वं
धर्मादीनाम्। गुणादीनां च नात्यन्तबाधः

16.1 (1.43) **tat-abhāve** (loc. upon) that – non-existence **tat-abhāvāt** (abl. inferred from) that – non-existence **śūnyam** emptiness **tarhi** then, in that case **16.2** (1.44) **śūnyam** emptiness **tattvam** reality / **bhāvaḥ** existence **vinaśyati** it passes away **vastu-dharma-tvāt** (abl. inferred from) real – the nature of – the notion that **vināśasya** (gen. of) passing away **16.3** (1.45) **apavāda-mātram** nay-saying – mere, nothing more than **abuddhānam** thoughtless **16.4** (1.46) **ubhaya-pakṣa-samāna-kṣematvāt** (abl. adv.) both – side – same – being or resting assured **ayam** this **api** in fact **16.5** (1.47) **a-puruṣa-arthatvam** not – human – purpose **ubhayathā** either way **16.6** (5.20) **na** no **dharma-apalāpaḥ** duty – denying **prakṛti-kārya-vaicitryāt** nature – effect(s) – manifoldness (5.21) **śruti-liṅga-ādibhiḥ** (inst. pl. through) scripture – indicators – etc. **tat-siddhiḥ** it – establishing

16.7 (5.22) **na** not (such) **niyamaḥ** defined **pramāṇa-antara-avakāśāt** (abl. by) means of proof – other – admitting (5.23) **ubhayatra** either way **api evam** exactly so **16.8** (5.24) **arthāt** (abl. because) purpose **siddhiḥ** establishing **cet** if thought to be **samānam** same **ubhayoḥ** (loc. in) both **16.9** (5.25) **antaḥ-karaṇa-dharmatvam** inner – creator – role – the very existence of **dharma-ādinām** (gen. pl. for all) duty – etc. (5.26) **guṇa-ādinām** (gen. pl. for all) qualities – beginning with **ca-na** and not just **atyanta-bādhah** ultimately – excluded

(The opponent:) **16.1** From the non-existence of that (living world) upon the non-existence of that (exclusion), one would infer emptiness in that case. **16.2** That reality is emptiness, that existence passes away, inferred from the notion that passing away is the nature of anything real, **16.3** is nothing more than thoughtless nay-saying, **16.4** *this* (speaker (the opponent)), in fact, being comfortable (in saying) that the two views ("emptiness" and the "separate

principle") are the same; 16.5 (but) either way, that is not the purpose of a human being. 16.6 There is no denying that it (the purpose of a human being) is his dharma, because there is the manifoldness of the effects of nature, the proof of it through scripture, indicators, etc.

(The author:) 16.7 Either way, that (dharma) is not defined exactly so by admitting those other means of proof. 16.8 It is the same in both, even if you think it is established because it is our purpose, 16.9 The very existence of a 'dharma' for the inner creator—(that is,) for all that begins with his dharma and not just for all that begins with the guṇas—is that he is ultimately excluded.

पञ्चावयवयोगात्सुखसंवित्तिः। न सकृद् ग्रहणात्सम्बन्धसिद्धिः। नियतधर्मसाहित्यमुभयो-
रेकतरस्य वा व्याप्तिः। न तत्त्वान्तरं वस्तुकल्पनाप्रसक्तेः। निजशक्त्युद्भवमित्याचार्याः।
आधेयशक्तियोग इति पञ्चशिखः। न स्वरूपशक्तिर्नियमः पुनर्वादप्रसक्तेः। विशेषणान-
र्थक्यप्रसक्तेः। पल्लवादिष्वनुपपत्तेश्च। आधेयशक्तिसिद्धौ निजशक्तियोगः समानन्यायात्।

16.10 (5.27) **pañcāvayava-yogāt** (abl. known through) five-membered – abl. ind. **sukha-saṁvittiḥ** happiness – sense, feeling, knowledge 16.11 (5.28) **na** not **sakṛt-grahaṇāt** (abl. from) "done together", at once, simultaneous, immediate – comprehension **sambandha-siddhiḥ** binding or joining together, inherent relation – establishing 16.12 (5.29) **niyata-dharma-sāhityam** rule – dharma – intimately connected, associated **ubhayoḥ** (loc. in relation to) the two **ekatarasya** (gen. of) one **vā** alternatively **vyāptiḥ** pervading 16.13 (5.30) **na** not **tattva-antaram** principle – separate **vastu-kalpanā-prasakteḥ** (abl. known through) reality – imagining – indulging in 16.14 (5.31) **nija-śakti-udbhavam** inborn – power – emergence, rising up, generation, manifestation **iti** according to **ācāryāḥ** teachers

16.15 (5.32) **ādheya-śakti-yogaḥ** (to be) contained, attributed – power, ability – connection, association **iti** according to **pañcaśikhaḥ** 16.16 (5.33) **na** not **svarūpa-śaktiḥ** own nature – power **niyamaḥ** rule **punar-vāda-prasakteḥ** (abl. because) tautology – occurrence (5.34) **viśeṣaṇa-ānarthakya-prasakteḥ** (abl. arising from) distinction – meaninglessness – occurrence 16.17 (5.35) **pallava-ādiṣu** (loc. plural; in regard to, with) shoot, sprout – etc. **anupapatteḥ** (abl. because) inconsistent **ca** and 16.18 (5.36) **ādheya-śakti-siddhau** (loc. upon) contained, attributed – power – establishing **nija-śakti-yogaḥ** inborn – power – association **samāna-nyāyāt** (abl. from) same – argument

(The opponent:) **16.10 A sense of happiness (through dharma/karma) is known through the five-membered (syllogism). 16.11 There is no establishing any such relation from an immediate comprehension. 16.12 Alternatively to that (your view (in 3.18 and 13.5)) of the one in relation to the two, it (happiness) pervades in association with the rule of dharma. 16.13 A separate principle is not known (just) through indulgence in imagining such a reality. 16.14 According to (us) teachers it is a manifestation of an *inborn* power.**

(The author:) **16.15 According to Pañcaśikha (the author) it is a connection with *contained* power. 16.16 The power (of happiness) being in one's (born) nature is not the rule because 1.) of the occurrence of tautology arising from the occurrence of meaninglessness of the distinction, 16.17 and because 2.) it is inconsistent with things beginning with the sprout. 16.18 Upon establishing it as a contained power, (however,) association with inborn power could follow from that same argument.**

The author points out that saying a person experiences happiness in some circumstance because he is happy by nature is a "tautology", which is a kind of redundancy, in this case an argument where there is no meaningful difference between the assertion and the reason, thus invalidating any inference and thus any proof. The life circumstances of another person can be seen directly but not his general level of happiness or any other aspect of his experience, so there is no proof that happiness is attained through performing karmas as one's dharma.

Chapter Seventeen

Veda and Testimony

वाच्यवाचकभावः सम्बन्धः शब्दार्थयोः। त्रिभिः सम्बन्धसिद्धिः। न कार्ये नियम उभयथा दर्शनात्। लोके व्युत्पन्नस्य वेदार्थप्रतीतिः। न त्रिभिरपौरुषेयत्वाद्देदस्य तदर्थस्यातीन्द्रियत्वात्। न यज्ञादेः स्वरूपतो धमत्वं वैशिष्ट्यात्। निजशक्तिर्व्युत्पत्त्या व्यवच्छिद्यते। योग्यायोग्येषु प्रतीतिजनकत्वात्तत्सिद्धिः। न नित्यत्वं वेदानां कार्यत्वश्रुतेः। न पौरुषेयत्वं तत्कर्तुः पुरुषस्याभावात्। मुक्तामुक्तयोरयोग्यत्वात्। नापौरुषेयत्वान्नित्यत्वमङ्कुरादिवत्। तेषामपि तद्योगे दृष्टबाद्धादिप्रसक्तिः। यस्मिन्नदृष्टेऽपि कृतबुद्धिरूपजायते तत्पौरुषेयम् निजशक्त्यभिव्यक्तेः स्वतः प्रामाण्यम्।

17.1 (5.37) **vācya-vācaka-bhāvaḥ** to be said – saying – relation **sambandhaḥ** inherent connection **śabda-arthayoḥ** (loc. dual; between) sound, word, oral tradition – (its) purpose, intent, meaning (5.38) **tribhiḥ** (inst. pl. by) three **sambandha-siddhiḥ** inherent connection – establishing, proof **17.2** (5.39) **na kārye** (loc. as to) effect, product, produced **niyamaḥ** rule **ubhayathā** in the two ways **darśanāt** (abl. because) seeing, observing (5.40) **loke** (loc. in) world **vyutpannasya** (gen. belonging to) learned, accomplished, versed in **veda-artha-pratītiḥ** Veda – meaning – understanding

17.3 (5.41) **na** not **tribhiḥ** (inst. known by) the three **apauruṣeyatvāt** (abl. because) not generated by people (ḍhak of puruṣa) – being **vedasya** (gen. of) the Veda **tat-arthasya** (gen. of) it – meaning **ati-indriyatvāt** (abl. because) super – sensoriness **17.4** (5.42) **na** no **yajña-ādeḥ** (gen. of) Vedic rites – etc. **svarūpataḥ** (tasil resulting from) own nature **dharmatvam** state of duty **vaiśiṣṭyāt** (ind.) clearly (5.43) **nija-śaktiḥ** inborn – power **vyutpattyā** (inst. by means of) scholarship, proficiency **vyavacchidyate** to be rejected **17.5** (5.44) **yogya-ayogyeṣu** (loc. pl. regarding, as for) qualified – not qualified **pratīti-janakatvāt** (abl. through) understanding – generation – there being **tat-siddhiḥ** that – proof **17.6** (5.45) **na** no **nityatvam** constant presence **vedānām** (gen. of) Vedas **kāryatvaśruteḥ** (abl. because) produced – being – scripture (5.46) **na** not **pauruṣeyatvam** generated by people **tat-kartuḥ** their – creator **puruṣasya** (gen. of) person **abhāvāt** (abl. because) non-existence **17.7** (5.47) **mukta-amuktayoḥ** (loc. if) liberated – unliberated **ayogyatvāt** (abl. because) inconsistency (5.48) **na apauruṣeya-tvāt** (abl. because) not – generated by people – being **nityatvam** constancy **aṅkura-ādivat** (vati like) sprout – etc. **17.8** (5.49) **teṣām** (gen. of) them **api** in fact **tat-yoge** (loc. in) to that – connection **drṣṭa-bādha-ādi-prasaktiḥ** learned knowledge – exclusion – etc., all the rest – occurrence **17.9** (5.50) **yasmin** (loc. in which case) **adrṣṭe** (loc.) without learned knowledge **api** or even **kṛta-buddhiḥ** made up, fixed – understanding **upajāyate** there arises **tat-pauruṣeyam** it – generated by people (5.51) **nija-śakti-abhivyaakteḥ** (abl. from) inborn power – manifestation **svataḥ** itself **prāmāṇyam** authoritativeness

(The opponent:) **17.1** The connection between speech and its meaning is the relation of saying and what is to be said, that connection which is established by the three (the threefold proof, *pramāṇa*). **17.2** Understanding of the meaning of the Veda belongs to the learned, in the *world*, (though) there is no rule that it is produced by them, because their seeing is (only) in those two ways (understanding and saying).

(The author:) 17.3 Because of the Veda's not being generated by people, because of the super-sensoriness of its meaning, it is not known by means of the three. 17.4 (The notion of) inborn power by means of Vedic scholarship is to be rejected, because it is clear that there is no state where the dharma of Vedic rites and all that results from one's (born) nature. 17.5 As for who is qualified versus who is unqualified, the proof of that is through there being the generation of understanding. 17.6 There is no constancy of the Vedas, for there is scripture on their being produced; nor are they generated by people, because of the non-existence of any person who could be the creator of them. 17.7 It is like the sprout, etc., not constancy, because of its not being generated by people, whether liberated or unliberated, because of that inconsistency. 17.8 In fact, in the connection of them (the Vedas) to that (being generated by people) there is the occurrence of the exclusion (of Brahman) through learned knowledge and all the rest; 17.9 or even without the learned knowledge, in which case there arises the belief that it *is* generated by people (the rishis), its authoritativeness itself coming from a manifestation of *their* inborn power.

नासतः ख्यानं नृशृङ्गवत्। न सतो बाधदर्शनात्। नानिर्वचनीयस्य तदभावात्। नान्यथा-
ख्यातिः स्ववचोव्याघातात्। सदसत्ख्यातिर्बाधाबाधात्। प्रतीत्यप्रतीतिभ्यां न स्फोटा-
त्मकः शब्दः। न शब्दनित्यत्वं कार्यताप्रतीतेः। पूर्वसिद्धसत्त्वस्याभिव्यक्तिर्दीपिनेव
घटस्य। सत्कार्यसिद्धान्तश्चेत्सिद्धसाधनम्।

17.10 (5.52) **na** no **asataḥ** (gen. of) untrue **khyānam** saying **nṛśṛṅgavat** (vati like) man – horn 17.11 (5.53) **na** nor **sataḥ** (gen. of) true **bādha-darśanāt** (abl. because) exclusion – seeing 17.12 (5.54) **na** nor **anirvacanīyasya** (gen. of) that which is indescribable, unsayable **tat-abhāvāt** (abl. because) it – non-existence 17.13 (5.55) **na** no **anyathā** (inst.) one way, the other way **khyātiḥ** saying **sva-vacas-vyāghātāt** (abl. because) own – declaration – contradiction

17.14 (5.56) **sat-asat-khyātiḥ** true – untrue – saying **bādha-abādhāt** (abl. adverbial) excluded – not excluded 17.15 (5.57) **pratīti-apratītibhyām** (inst. with, accompanied by) understanding – non-understanding **na** not **sphoṭa-ātmakaḥ** burst forth, unfurled (like a sprout), revealed, disclosed – having of the nature of **śabdaḥ** testimony, the word 17.16 (5.58) **na** not, nor **śabda-nityatvam** testimony – constancy **kāryatā-pratīteḥ** (abl. because) its being an effect – understanding 17.17 (5.59) **pūrva-siddha-sattvasya** (gen. of) previously – established – entity

abhivyaktiḥ manifestation, becoming evident **dīpena** (inst. with) light, lamp, lantern **iva** like **ghaṭasya** (gen. of) pot **17.18** (5.60) **sat-kārya-siddhāntaḥ** existent – effect – doctrine **cet** if ... then **siddha-sāadhanam** established – establishing

(The opponent:) **17.10** There is no saying of what is untrue, like horns on a man, **17.11** nor (you say), of what is true, because of seeing exclusion (in it), **17.12** nor of what cannot be described because of the non-existence of it (the saying), **17.13** (so) there is no saying it is that other way, because of the self-contradiction of your own declaration.

(The author:) **17.14** There is *saying* of true and untrue whether excluded or not excluded. **17.15** Testimony does not have the nature of something revealed, whether it is accompanied by understanding or non-understanding. **17.16** Nor is there constancy of testimony, because of the understanding of its being of the nature of an *effect*. **17.17** It is the manifestation of a previously established truth, like that of a pot with a lamp. **17.18** If you argue that it is the doctrine of existent effect, then you are just establishing something that is (already) established (i.e., you are absolutely right).

The opponent is referring to the word "exclusion" in the previous discussion. If true statements representing learned knowledge cause exclusion, and false statements are unfitting, then what's left? Is there justification for making any statement? The subject of sutra 17.10 is the first way, which would be called "the one way", and 17.11 is the anyathā, "the other way". Taken together these two statements would seem to argue against making any assertion at all, but 17.11 itself refers to a certain assertion on the part of the author, which according to these very rules would have to be seen as self-denying.

Chapter Eighteen

Individual Souls and Parts

नाद्वैतमात्मनो लिङ्गात्तद्भेदप्रतीतेः । नानात्मनापि प्रत्यक्षवाधात् । नोभाभ्यं तेनैव । अन्यपरत्वमविवेकानां तत्र । नात्माविद्या नोभायं जगदुपादानकारणं निःसङ्गत्वात् । नैकस्यानन्दचिद्रूपत्वे द्वयोर्भेदात् । दुःखनिवृत्तेर्गौणः । विमुक्तिप्रशंसा मन्दानाम् । न व्यापकत्वं मनसः करणत्वादिन्द्रियत्वाद्वा । सक्रियत्वाद्भ्रतिश्रुतेः । न निर्भागत्वं तद्योगाद्धटवत् । प्रकृतिपुरुषयोरन्यत्सर्वमनित्यम् ।

18.1 (5.61) **na** no **advaitam** non-duality **ātmanah** (gen. of) individual soul **liṅgāt** (abl. through) characteristic, mark, sign, indicator **tat-bheda-pratīteḥ** (abl. because) them – division, diversity – recognizing **18.2** (5.62) **na** nor **anātmanā** (inst. coming about through) not an individual soul **api** indeed **pratyakṣa-bādhāt** (abl. just because) perception (of it) – excluded **18.3** (5.63) **na** not **ubhābhyām** (inst. with) both **tena** (inst.) by that means **eva** the same **18.4** (5.64) **anya-paratvam** other(s) – separateness **avivekānām** (gen. to) non-discriminating ones **tatra** there, where, in which case **18.5** (5.65) **na** not **ātmā** individual soul **avidyā** ignorance **na** nor **ubhayam** either one **jagat-upādāna-kāraṇam** the living world – self-accepted, inclusive – cause **niḥsaṅga-tvāt** (abl. because) without attachment, indifferent (MW) – being

18.6 (5.66) **na** no **ekasya** (gen. for) the one **ānanda-cit-rūpa-tve** (loc. in) bliss – intelligence – form – state of **dvayoḥ** (loc. between) the two **bhedāt** (abl. because) difference (5.67) **duḥkha-nivṛtteḥ** (abl. of comparison; to) suffering – cessation **gauṇaḥ** subordinate, secondary (5.68) **vimukti-prasānsā** liberation – glory **mandānām** (gen. for) the dull ones **18.7** (5.69) **na** nor **vyāpakatvam** pervasiveness **manasaḥ** (gen. of, for) mind **kaṛaṇa-tvāt** (abl. because) doer – being **indriya-tvāt** (abl. adverbial) powers – being **vā** or, nor (5.70) **sakriyatvāt** (abl. because) its having activity **gati-śruteḥ** (abl.) (trans)migration – scripture **18.8** (5.71) **na** **nirbhāga-tvam** without – parts – being **tat-yogāt** (abl. because) them – connection **ghaṭavat** clay pots, jars – like **18.9** (5.72) **prakṛti-puruṣayoḥ** (loc. than) prime originator – human spirit **anyat** other than, different **sarvam** all of that **anityam** non-lasting

(The opponent:) **18.1** There is no non-duality of individual soul, because we recognize the diversity of them through (perception of) the indicator (body); **18.2** nor indeed does that (body) come about through something that is not an individual soul, just because (direct) perception of it (another soul) is excluded. **18.3** It (perception) is *not* by means of both the same (direct *and* object-based, see 19.7), **18.4** where it is (only) to the non-discriminating that there is separateness of the others (souls). **18.5** The individual soul (concept) is not ignorance, nor is either one the self-accepted cause of the living world, because of that (cause) being the indifferent (nature).

(The author:) **18.6** For the *one*, in the state of his bliss/intelligence form, there is no glory of liberation for dull ones (souls), secondary to the cessation of suffering, just because of your (supposed) difference between the two (the liberated and the dull). **18.7** Nor is there for his mind a pervasiveness (in other

souls) because of its (supposedly) having activity in accordance with the scripture on (trans)migration, just because of its being the doer (of karma), being (itself) that very power (of doing). 18.8 He (mahat, like the ether 7.13, 24.9) is not without parts, because there is his connection with them, like jars, 18.9 (but) all of that is non-lasting, something other than the prime originator or the human spirit.

न भागलाभोऽभागिनः निर्भागत्वश्रुतेः। नानन्दाभिव्यक्तिर्मुक्तिर्निर्धर्मत्वात्। न विशेषगुणोच्छित्तिस्तद्वत्। न विशेषगतिर्निष्क्रियस्य। नाकारोपरागोच्छित्तिः क्षणिकत्वादिदोषात्। न सर्वोच्छित्तिरपुरुषार्थत्वादिदोषात्। एवं शून्यमपि। संयोगाश्च वियोगान्ता इति न देशादिलाभोऽपि। न भागियोगो भागस्य। नाणिमादियोगोऽप्यवश्यम्भावित्वात्तदुच्छित्तेरितरयोगवत्। नेन्द्रादिपदयोगोऽपि तद्वत्।

18.10 (5.73) **na** not **bhāga-lābhaḥ** parts, components – obtained **abhāgīnaḥ** (abl. from) having no parts **nir-bhāgatva-śruteḥ** (abl. to be understood from) without – parts – scripture **18.11** (5.74) **na** not **ānanda-abhivyaṅktiḥ** bliss – showing **muktiḥ** liberating **nir-dharma-tvāt** (abl. adverbial) without – dharma – there being

18.12 (5.75) **na** neither **viśeṣa-guṇa-ucchittiḥ** various – qualities – elimination **tadvat** like that **18.13** (5.76) **na** nor **viśeṣa-gatiḥ** particular, certain – motion **niṣkriyasya** (gen. of) actionless **18.14** (5.77) **na** nor **ākāra-uparāga-ucchittiḥ** outer form, bodily aspect – influence – elimination **kṣaṇikatva-ādi-doṣāt** momentariness – etc. – fault **18.15** (5.78) **na** nor **sarva-ucchittiḥ** everything – elimination **a-puruṣa-arthatva-ādi-doṣāt** (abl. because) lacking – person – purpose – fault (5.79) **evam** thus **śūnyam** emptiness **api** or even **18.16** (5.80) **saṃyogāḥ** conjunctions **ca** (with na) neither **viyoga-antāḥ** disjunction – things ending **iti** just mentioned **deśa-ādi-lābhaḥ** place – etc. – acquiring **api** even (5.81) **na** neither (with the previous "ca") **bhāgi-yogaḥ** (to) a possessor – relation **bhāgasya** (gen. of) a part **18.17** (5.82) **na** not **aṇima-ādi-yogaḥ** aṇiman, minuteness – etc. – yoga (power) **api_avaśyam** most certainly **bhāvitvāt** (abl. for) real necessity **tat-ucchitteḥ** (gen. for) those – elimination **itara-yogavat** (vati like) the other – yogas **18.18** (5.83) **na** no **indra-ādi-pada-yogaḥ** Indra – and the others – status – connection **api** surely **tadvat** (indeclinable) like that, like

(The opponent:) **18.10** That there are parts (see 18.8) obtained from something that has no parts is not to be understood from scripture on being without parts. **18.11** A showing of bliss without dharma is not liberating.

(The author:) **18.12** Well, neither is 1.) the *elimination* of various qualities like that (bliss), **18.13** nor 2.) a certain (trans)migration (re-incarnation) of the actionless (soul), **18.14** nor 3.) elimination of the influence of the outward aspect (the incarnation) because of its fault of being momentary (temporary) and the rest, **18.15** nor even thus 4.) emptiness, the elimination of *all* that because of its fault of not being the purpose of a human being, and so on. **18.16** Neither are the *conjunctions* that *end* in those (four) disjunctions ("eliminations") just mentioned the relation of a part to its possessor, even acquiring place and the others (time and circumstance 1.12-14). **18.17** There is most certainly not any yoga of minuteness and the others (the eight so-called supernatural powers), for the real necessity is for the elimination of *those* (notions), like the other such yogas, **18.18** like that, there would surely be no yoga of (acquiring) the status of Indra and the others. (Compare 14.18).

Chapter Nineteen

The Separate Principle

न भूतप्रकृतित्वमिन्द्रियाणामाहङ्कारिकत्वश्रुतेः। न षडदार्थनियमस्तद्वोधान्मुक्तिः षोडशा-
दिष्वप्येवम्। नाणुनित्यता तत्कार्यत्वश्रुतेः। न निर्भागत्वं कार्यत्वात्। न रूपनिबन्धनात्प्र-
त्यक्षनियमः। न परिमाणचातुर्विध्यं द्वाभ्यां तद्योगात्। अनित्यत्वेऽपि स्थिरतायोगात्प्रत्य-
भिज्ञानं सामान्यस्य। न तदपलापस्तस्मात्।

19.1 (5.84) **na** not **bhūta-prakṛti-tvam** the gross elements – material origin – being **indriyāṇām** (gen.) sensory powers **āhaṅkārika-tva-śruteḥ** (abl. to be understood from) relating to the personal identity – scripture **19.2** (5.85) **na** nothing **ṣaṭ-pada-artha-niyamaḥ** six words – meaning – definition **tat-bodhāt** (abl. from, about) that (way) – comprehending **muktiḥ** liberating **19.3** (5.86) **ṣoḍaśa-ādiṣu** sixteen – etc. **api** or even **evam** exactly that way

19.4 (5.87) **na** not **aṇu-nityatā** (f. her) atoms – constancy **tat-kāryatva-śruteḥ** (abl. from) their – being produced – scripture **19.5** (5.88) **na** not **nirbhāgatvam** without parts – being **kāryatvāt** (abl. known from) produced – being **19.6** (5.89)

na no rūpa-nibandhanāt (abl. from) form – (ifc) based on **pratyakṣa-niyamaḥ** perception – definition **19.7** (5.90) **na** not **parimāṇa-cātur-vidhyam** assessment – fourfold **dvābhyam** (inst. by means of) two **tat-yogāt** (abl.) that – by reason of **19.8** (5.91) **anityatve** (loc.) no – constancy – there being **api** even **sthīratā-yogāt** steadfastness – because **pratyabhijñanam** self-recognition **sāmānyasya** (gen. of) universal **19.9** (5.92) **na** no **tat-apalāpaḥ** it – denial **tasmāt** for that reason

(The opponent:) **19.1** The indriyas' being the material origin (**prakṛti**) of the gross elements is not to be understood from the scripture on their relating to the personal identity. **19.2** There is nothing liberating about comprehending that way, its definition in the meaning of the six words (Vaisheshika), **19.3** or even in the sixteen (?) and the others.

(The author:) **19.4** Well, constancy of her (**prakṛti**'s) minute parts is not to be understood from the scripture on their being produced. **19.5** From (a thing's) being produced it is known that it is not without parts, **19.6** (but) there is no definition of *perception* that it must come from something based (only) on that (produced) form. **19.7** For that reason, it (perception) *is* by both means (direct and object-based 18.3), not just that fourfold assessment (indicator-based 18.12-16). **19.8** Even with there being no constancy (of the parts), there is recognition of the universal form, because of *its* steadfastness. **19.9** It is for *that* reason that there is no denial of it.

नान्यनिवृत्तिरूपत्वं भावप्रतीतेः। न तत्त्वान्तरं सादृश्यं प्रत्यक्षोपलब्धेः। निजशक्त्यभि-
क्तिर्वा वैशिष्ट्यात्तदुपलब्धेः। न संज्ञासंज्ञिसम्बन्धोऽपि। न सम्बन्धनित्यतोभयानित्यत्वात्।
नाजः सम्बन्धो धर्मिग्राहकमानबाधात्। न समवायोऽस्ति प्रमाणाभावात्। उभयत्राप्यन्य-
थासिद्धेर्न प्रत्यक्षमनुमानं वा। नानुमेयत्वमेव क्रियाया नेदिष्ठस्य तत्तद्वतोरेवापरोक्षप्रतीतेः।
न पाञ्चभौतिकं शरीरं बहूनामुपादानायोगात्।

19.10 (5.93) **na** not **anya-nivṛtti-rūpa-tvam** other(s) – cessation – form – there being **bhāva-pratīteḥ** (abl. known from) existence – certainty **19.11** (5.94) **na** no **tattva-antaram** separate principle **sādṛśyam** resembling **pratyakṣa-upalabdheḥ** (abl. known from) (ifc) immediate – observation **19.12** (5.95) **nija-śakti-abhivyaktiḥ** inborn – power – manifestation **vā** rather **vaiśiṣṭyāt** (abl. resulting from) distinguishing quality **tat-upalabdheḥ** (abl. because) such – observation (5.96) **na** not **saṃjñā-saṃjñi-sambandhaḥ** named – name – relation **api** even

19.13 (5.97) **na** no **sambandha-nityatā** (fem. her) (*see 18.15*) relationship – constancy **ubhaya-anityatvāt** (abl. because) both – lack of constancy – there being **19.14** (5.98) **na** not **a-jaḥ** without, other than – origination **sambandhaḥ** relationship **dharmi-grāhaka-māna-bādhāt** (abl. because) having characteristics – grasper, perceiver – evidence – exclusion **19.15** (5.99) **na** not **samavāyaḥ** perpetual co-inherence, relation of a whole to its parts (manas to indriyas) **asti** (as an indeclinable) existent **pramāṇa-abhāvāt** **19.16** (5.100) **ubhayatra** either way **api** indeed **anyathā-siddheḥ** (abl. because) by other means – establishing **na** neither **pratyakṣam** perception **anumānam** inference **vā** or, nor **19.17** (5.101) **na** no **anumeyatvam** inference to be made **eva** such **kriyāyāḥ** (gen. s. fem. of) activity **nediṣṭhasya** (gen. on the part of) someone standing near **tat-tadvatoḥ** (loc. in regard to) that, such a thing – the one whose it is **eva** such **aparokṣa-pratīteḥ** (abl. just from) not imperceptible – certainty **19.18** (5.102) **na** not **pāñca-bhautikam** composed of five elements **śarīram** body **bahūnām** (gen. pl. belonging to) the many **upādāna-ayogāt** (abl. because) accepting – inconsistent

(The opponent:) **19.10** There being a *form* where there is cessation of the others (the parts) is not known (just) from the certainty of its existence. **19.11** There is nothing resembling (your) separate principle (mahat) known (just) from an immediate observation. **19.12** There is not even a relationship of the name ("mahat") with anything to be named, because such observation must result from there being a distinguishing quality, which is rather a manifestation of *inborn* power.

(The author:) **19.13** There is no constancy (inherence) in that relationship because of there being a lack of constancy in both (inborn power and observation). **19.14** There is no relationship other than origination, because there would be exclusion of the evidence of the *perceiver* of what has the characteristics. **19.15** There is no inherence (of the parts), because of the absence of the (threefold) means of proof, **19.16** because indeed the establishing of it (inherence) is by the other (alone), which is neither perception (see 19.5) nor inference (see 19.4) either way, (but mere testimony). **19.17** There is no such inference to be made of (karmic) activity on the part of someone standing near, in regard to such a thing (inborn power), and the one whose it is, (just) from the certainty that he is not imperceptible. **19.18** The body is not composed of the five gross elements, belonging to the many, because that is inconsistent with accepting.

Chapter Twenty

Bodies, Perception, and Forms of Brahman

न स्थूलमिति नियम आतिवाहिकस्यापि विद्यमानत्वात्। नाप्राप्तप्रकाशकत्वमिन्द्रियाणाम-
प्राप्तेः सर्वप्राप्तेर्वा। न तेजोऽपसर्पणात्तैजसं चक्षुर्वृत्तितस्तत्सिद्धेः। प्राप्तार्थप्रकाशलिङ्गाद्
वृत्तिसिद्धिः। भागगुणाभ्यां तत्त्वान्तरं वृत्तिः सम्बन्धार्थं सर्पतीति। न द्रव्यनियमस्तद्यो-
गात्। न देशभेदेऽप्यन्योपादानतास्मदादिवन्नियमः। निमित्तव्यपदेशात्तद्व्यपदेशः। ऊष्म-
जाण्डजजरायुजोद्भिज्जसांकल्पिकसांसिद्धिकं चेति न नियमः।

20.1 (5.103) **na** not **sthūlam** gross **iti** called (quotes) **niyamaḥ** restriction, limitation **ātivāhikasya** (gen. of) "beyond-bearing", enduring **api** indeed **vidyamānatvāt** (abl. because) existence **20.2** (5.104) **na** no **aprāpta-prakāśakatvam** unfound – illumination **indriyāṅām** (gen. pl. on the part of) the powers of sense **aprāpteḥ** (abl. since) it would not be found **sarva-prāpteḥ** (abl. because) all – is found **vā** (like "iva"; see MW) like that (*The word "vā" has the same sense here as it does in "dvayoḥ ekatarasya vā" where again the subject is the indriyas. It means "or" in the sense of "alternatively" or "according to that alternative"*) **20.3** (5.105) **na** no such **tejas-apasarpaṇāt** (abl. because) light – gliding **taijasam** relating to light **caḥṣus** seeing, the faculty (indriya) of sight, the eye **vṛttitas** (tasil in consequence of, through) working, functioning **tat-siddheḥ** (abl. because) it, that – establishing **20.4** (5.106) **prāpta-artha-prakāśa-liṅgāt** (abl. because) found – thing – illuminating, showing – indicator, mark, sign **vṛtti-siddhiḥ** functioning – proof

20.5 (5.107) **bhāga-guṇābhyām** (abl. from) part – essential constituent **tattva-antaram** principle – separate **vṛttiḥ** functioning, working **sambandha-artham** relationship – purpose, meaning **sarpati** it glides **iti** saying **20.6** (5.108) **na** not **dravya-niyamaḥ** (*see 20.1*) the physical – restriction, limitation **tat-yogāt** (abl. because) them (bhāga and guṇa) – relation, connection **20.7** (5.109) **na** no **deśa-bhede** (loc. w/api; though) location – division **api** though **anya-upādānatā** (in) others – acceptingness **asmāt-ādivat** us and the rest – like **niyamaḥ** rule **20.8** (5.110) **nimitta-vyapadeśāt** (abl. because) instrumental cause – name, designation, representation **tat-vyapadeśaḥ** that – designation **20.9** (5.111) **ūṣmaja-aṇḍaja-jarāyuja-udbhijja-sāmkālpika-sāmsiddhikam** (singular) born of ("ja"): vapor, steam – egg – amnion – sprouting; – qualified to seek – qualified

for perfection (*see Manu Smṛti I, 43-6*) (*The last two members of this compound have prakīrṇaka hañ (ika) taddhita terminations, denoting worthiness or qualification.*) **ca** and, whereas **iti** thus, so **na** not **niyamaḥ** defined

(The opponent:) **20.1 It (the body) is not limited to what we call the "gross" one** (see 11.1) **because there is indeed the existence of an enduring one. 20.2 On the part of the indriyas, there is no illumination of anything not found (in the world), for it would not be found, because everything is found like that. 20.3 There is no such relation of the eye to light, because light glides (to the eye), for it is (only) proved through its functioning. 20.4 It is proved through the functioning because it is the indicator that shows the object that is found.**

(The author:) **20.5 The saying "it glides" (see VD 6.3) is the very meaning of the relationship, a principle separate from the part and its essential constituent (see VD 3.1-6). 20.6 It is not defined by the physicals (of Vaisheshika), because of that relation to them. 20.7 Though there is a division by location, there is no rule of acceptingness in others, like an 'us' and an 'everyone else'. 20.8 It is designated by that ("separate principle" (see VD 3.6)) because it is the designation of an instrumental cause, 20.9 whereas anything (bodies) born of steam (insects, etc.), born of egg (birds, etc.), born of amnion (mammals), sprouting (plants); or (even) one (an incarnation) qualified for aspiring (to final liberation), or (even) one qualified for the complete accomplishment, is not thus defined.**

सर्वेषु पृथिव्युपादानमसाधारण्यात्तद्व्यपदेशः पूर्ववत्। न देहारम्भकस्य प्राणत्वमिन्द्रियशक्तिस्तत्सिद्धेः। भोक्तुरधिष्ठानाद्भोगायतननिर्माणमन्यथा पूतिभावप्रसङ्गात्। भृत्यद्वारा स्वाम्यधिष्ठितिनैकान्तात्। समाधिसुषुप्तिमोक्षेषु ब्रह्मरूपता। द्वायोः सबीजमन्यत्र तद्धतिः। द्वयोरिव त्रयस्यापि दृष्टत्वान्न तु द्वौ। वासनयानर्थखापनं दोषयोगेऽपि न निमित्तस्य प्रधानवाधकत्वम्। एकः संस्कारः क्रियानिर्वर्तको न तु प्रतिक्रियं संस्कारभेदा बहुकल्पनाप्रसक्तेः

20.10 (5.112) **sarveṣu** (loc. in) all those things **pṛthivi-upādānam** earth – accepting, taking, incorporating **asādhāraṇyāt** (ind.) without universality **tat-vyapadeśaḥ** (=nimitta-vyapadeśa 5.110) it – designation **pūrvavat** (vati like, as) before **20.11** (5.113) **na** no, it is not the case **deha-ārambhakasya** (gen. of, for) body – originator **prāṇa-tvam** breath – to be **indriya-śaktitas** (tasil through) powers of sense – power, ability **tat-siddheḥ** (abl. by) of it – establishment (5.114)

bhoktuḥ (gen. belonging to) enjoyer **adhiṣṭhānāt** (abl. by) governance **20.12 bhoga-āyatana-nirmāṇam** enjoyment – house – formation, construction **anyathā** otherwise **pūti-bhāva-prasaṅgāt** (abl. because) smelly – become – would happen **20.13** (5.115) **bhṛtya-dvārā** (inst. of dvār) servant – means **svāmi-adhiṣṭhitīḥ** (of the) master – governing **na** not **ekāntāt** (ind.) on his own **20.14** (5.116) **samādhi-suṣupti-mokṣeṣu** (loc. pl.) contemplation – sleep – liberation, freedom **brahma-rūpa-tā** brahma – form(s) – state of being **20.15** (5.117) **dvayoḥ** (loc. in) two **sabījam** with seed **anyatra** (loc. in) the other **tat-hatīḥ** it – absence

20.16 (5.118) **dvayoḥ** (loc. in) two **iva** as if it were **trayasya** (gen. of) the three, a triad **apī** just **drṣṭatvāt** (abl. known from) learned – being, having been **na** not **tu** but **dvau** two **20.17** (5.119) **vāsanayā** (inst. fem. by the instrumentality of) vāsanā, imagination **anartha-khyāpanam** meaningless – statement **doṣa-yoge** (loc. if) fault – association **apī** even **na** not **nimittasya** (gen. belonging to, for) instrumental cause **pradhāna-bādhaka-tvam** principal – excluding – to be **20.18** (5.120) **ekaḥ** an individual **saṁskāraḥ** together-putting, (mental) construct **kriyā-nirvartakaḥ** action – performing **na** not **tu** but **prati-kriyam** counter – action **saṁskāra-bhedāḥ** (mental) construct(s) – sets **bahu-kalpanā-prasakteḥ** (abl. coming from) many – imagined, invented – occurrence, addiction, tendency

(The opponent:) **20.10** We 'accept' earth in all those things (as their material), (but) without the universality (of your 'accepting'), the designation of it as (you said) before (a cause 20.8). **20.11** For the originator of the body to be breath by establishing it through the ability of the powers of sense, because governance (supposedly) *belongs* to the enjoyer, is not the case. **20.12** There is construction of a *house* of enjoyment because otherwise *he* (the governor) would become that smelly (earthy) thing (the gross body). **20.13** The master's governing is through the expedient of a servant, not on his own; **20.14** contemplation, sleep, and liberation being those *forms* of Brahman, **20.15** with seed in two of them, which (seed) is removed in the other.

(The author:) **20.16** (To you) it is *as if* it were 'in two of the three', because of its having been learned (that way), but there are not (even) two (forms of Brahman). **20.17** It is a meaningless statement by way of fanciful thinking. Even if there were association (on his part) with such degradation, it is not for an instrumental cause to be excluding the principal. **20.18** There is the construct (saṁskāra) of an individual performing action but there is no counteraction, because (the notion of) *sets* of constructs comes (only) from the tendency of *imagining* the many.

Chapter Twenty-One

Individuals and Consequences

न बाह्यबुद्धिनियमो वृक्षगुल्मलतौषधिवनस्पतितृणविरुधादीनामपि। भोक्तृभोगायतनत्वं
पूर्ववत्। स्मृतेश्च। न देहमात्रतः कर्माधिकारित्वं वैशिष्ट्यश्रुतेः। त्रिधा त्रयाणां व्यवस्था
कर्मदेहोपभोगदेहोभयदेहाः। न किं चिदप्यनुशयिनः। न बुद्ध्यादिनित्यत्वमाश्रयविशेषेऽपि
वह्निवत्। आश्रयासिद्धेश्च। योगसिद्धयोऽप्यौषधादिसिद्धिवन्नापलपनीयाः। न भूतचैतन्यं
प्रत्येकादृष्टेः संहत्येऽपि च (संहत्येऽपि च)। (The repetition is artificial.)

21.1 (5.121) **na** no **bāhya-buddhi-niyamaḥ** of the external – intellect – rule **vṛkṣa-gulma-latā-oṣadhi-vanaspati-tṛṇa-vīrudha-ādinām** (gen. pl. belonging to) fruit trees – shrubs – vines – herbs, annuals – forest trees – grasses – creepers, etc. **api** of course **bhokṭṛ-bhoga-āyatanatvam** enjoyer – enjoyment – being the house **pūrvavat** (vati as) before **21.2** (5.122) **smṛteḥ** (abl. known from) the law books, "institutes" **ca** and **21.3** (5.123) **na** not **deha-mātrataḥ** (tasil resulting from) bodies – alone **karma-adhikāritvam** karman – competency **vaiśiṣṭya-śruteḥ** (abl. for) endowment with distinguishing quality – scripture **21.4** (5.124) **tridhā** threefold **trayaṇām** (gen. pl. of) three **vyavasthā** respective allotment **karma-deha-upabhoga-deha-ubhaya-dehāḥ** (plural) karma – body – experience – body – both – body

21.5 (5.125) **na** it is not the case **kiñcid api** (see *MW* under "ka") one or another of these **anuśayinaḥ** (gen. belonging to) an anuśayin, a person "after-lying", sustaining the consequences of previous acts **21.6** (5.126) **na** no **buddhi-ādi-nityatvam** intellect – etc. – constancy **āśraya-viśeṣe** (loc. in) site – particular **api** indeed **vahnivat** (vati like, just as with) fire **21.7** (5.127) **āśraya-asiddheḥ** (abl. because) sites – no establishing **ca** indeed **21.8** (5.128) **yoga-siddhayaḥ** things which establish a connection **api** however **auśadha-ādi-siddhivat** (vati like) herbs and the rest **na** not **apalāpanīyāḥ** (plural) suitable to be denied **21.9** (5.129) **na** no **bhūta-caitanyam** elemental (forms) – consciousness **pratyeka-adrṣṭeḥ** (abl. inferred from) individuals one by one – seeing **sāmhātye** (loc. in) thrown together **api** certainly **ca** and (with na, "also not") **sāmhātye api ca**

(The opponent:) **21.1** Of course, there is no rule that there is intellect belonging to the external (forms) of the fruit trees, shrubs, vines, annuals, forest trees, grasses, creepers, etc., their being the *house* of the enjoyer's enjoyment as (it was said) before (see 20.12), **21.2** and as it is known from the law texts (smṛti), **21.3** (but) competency for karma comes not from the bodies alone, for there is scripture on (their) being endowed with a distinguishing quality. **21.4** Of the three (forms of Brahman), the respective allotment (of such a quality) is threefold: the body for karma, the body for experience, and the body for both.

(The author:) **21.5** It is not the case that one or another of these must belong to someone sustaining consequences. **21.6** Just as with fire (and the other gross elements), there is indeed no constancy of intellect and the rest in any such particular site (see 21.4), **21.7** because indeed there is no establishing that there *are* sites (of intellect). **21.8** Instances of establishing by *connection* (yoga), however, like so establishing the herbs and the others (animals and people), need not be denied, **21.9** (but) there is no *consciousness* in those elemental forms to be inferred from seeing the individuals one by one, and certainly not in what is thrown together (from elements) (see 11.13).

अस्त्यात्मा नास्तित्वसाधनाभावात्। देहादिव्यतिरिक्तोऽसौ वैचित्र्यात्। षष्ठीव्यपदेशादपि।
न शिलापुत्रवद्धर्मिग्राहकमानवाधात्। अत्यन्तदुःखनिवृत्त्या कृतकृत्यता। यथा दुःखा-
त्क्लेशः पुरुशस्य न तथा सुखादभिलाषः कुत्रापि कोऽपि सुखीति। तदपि दुःखशबलमिति
दुःखपक्षे निःक्षिपन्ते विवेचकाः। सुखालाभाभावादपुरुषार्थत्वमिति चेन्न द्वैविध्यात्

21.10 (6.1) *asti* it exists *ātmā* individual soul *na-asti-tva-sāadhanā-abhāvāt* (abl. because) non-existent – being – means of progress – absence **21.11** (6.2) *deha-ādi-vyatiriktaḥ* body – etc. – separated *asau* that *vaicitryāt* (abl. because) diversity **21.12** (6.3) *ṣaṣṭhī-vyapadeśāt* (abl. because) sixth – referring to *api* and **21.13** (6.4) *na* not *śilā-putra-vat* (vati like) the small stone, the pestle *dharmi-grāhaka-māna-bādhāt* (abl. just because) characterized by, having a particular attribute – perceiver, subject – evidence – exclusion

21.14 (6.5) **atyanta-duḥkha-nivṛtṭyā** (inst. through) complete – suffering – cessation **kṛta-kṛtya-tā** done – to be done – that which is **21.15** (6.6) **yathā** as it is **duḥkhāt** (abl. from) suffering **kleśaḥ** affliction **puruṣasya** (gen. of) person **na** not **tathā** so much **sukhāt** (abl. because of) happiness **abhilāṣaḥ** desire **21.16** (6.7) **kutra** somewhere **api kaḥ** someone **api** indeed **sukhī** a happy person **iti** said to be (quotes) **21.17** (6.8) **tat api** actually **duḥkha-śabalam** suffering – mixed in **iti** saying **duḥkha-pakṣe** (loc. on) suffering – side **nikṣipante** they put it down **vivecakāḥ** the wise **21.18** (6.9) **sukha-lābha-a-bhāvāt** (abl. known from) happiness – finding – non-occurrence **a-puruṣa-artha-tvam** not a person's purpose **iti** said **cet** if **na** not so **dvaividhyāt** (abl. because) twofoldness

(The opponent:) **21.10** The individual soul must exist, because there would be the absence of any means of (spiritual) progress in its being non-existent. **21.11** It is separate from the body and the rest because of the diversity of (all) that **21.12** and because that is referred to by the sixth (genitive) case ("my body"), **21.13** (but) it is not like the case of a pestle just because of exclusion of the evidence of the *perceiver* of what has the characteristics (see 19.14).

(The author:) **21.14** What is to be done (spiritual progress 21.10) is done through the ultimate cessation of suffering. **21.15** A person's desire (for it) is not so much because of the happiness as it is the affliction by suffering. **21.16** There is (always) someone somewhere who is said to be "happy", **21.17** (but) the wise put it on the suffering side, saying it is actually mixed in along with the suffering (also see VD Chapters Six and Nine). **21.18** If you say that it is known from the absence of finding happiness that it (cessation of suffering) is not the purpose of a human being, it is not so, because of that twofoldness.

Chapter Twenty-Two

Dispelling the Bondage

निर्गुणत्वमात्मनोऽसङ्गत्वादिश्रुतेः। परधर्मत्वेऽपि तत्सिद्धिरविवेकात्। अनादिरविवेकोऽ-
न्यथा दोषद्वयप्रसक्तेः। न नित्यः स्यादात्मवदन्यथानुच्छित्तिः। प्रतिनियतकारणनाश-
त्वमस्य ध्वान्तवत्। अत्रापि प्रतिनियमोऽन्वयव्यतिरेकात्। प्रकारान्तरासम्भवादविवेक-
एव बन्धः न मुक्तस्य पुनर्बन्धयोगोऽप्यनावृत्तिश्रुतेः। अपुरुषार्थत्वमन्यथा। अविशेषाप-
त्तिरुभयोः। मुक्तिरन्तरायध्वस्तेर्न परः

22.1 (6.10) **nir-guṇa-tvam** qualitless – state **ātmanah** (gen. of) individual soul **a-saṅga-tva-ādi-śruteḥ** (abl. because) unattached-being – etc. – scripture

22.2 (6.11) **para-dharmatve** (loc. as) in other(s) – duty – being **api** yet **tat-siddhiḥ** that – establishing **avivekāṭ** (abl. coming from) non-distinguishing **22.3** (6.12) **anādiḥ** (see "an-ādau" 8.3) without beginning, preexisting **avivekaḥ** non-discriminating **anyathā** otherwise **doṣa-dvaya-prasakteḥ** (abl. because) fault(s) – two – stuck with **22.4** (6.13) **na no nityaḥ** (masc.) an eternal one **syāt** it may be, perhaps, possible **ātmavat** (vatup having) individual soul(s) **anythā** otherwise **anucchittiḥ** no dispelling **22.5** (6.14) **prati-niyata-kāraṇa-nāśya-tvam** counter-checked – cause – destroyed – being **asya** (gen. of) this **dhvāntavat** (vati like) darkness (6-15) **atra** in this case **api** rather **prati-niyamaḥ** counter-checking **anvaya-vyatirekāṭ** (abl. by) affirming – negating **22.6** (6.16) **prakāra-antara-asambhavāt** (abl. because of) way – other – impossibility **avivekaḥ** non-distinguishing **eva** just, nothing more than **bandhaḥ** bondage **22.7** (6.17) **na no muktasya** (gen. on the part of, for) liberated **punar-bandha-yogaḥ** further – bondage – connection **api** (strengthening sense) at all **an-āvṛtti-śruteḥ** (abl. for) non – recurrence – scripture **22.8** (6.18) **a-puruṣa-ārtha-tvam** lacking – soul – for the sake of – that which is **anyathā** otherwise (6-19) **aviśeṣa-āpattiḥ** no difference – implication **ubhayoḥ** (loc. between) the two **22.9** (6.20) **muktiḥ** liberation **antarāya-dhvasteḥ** (abl. coming from) obstacle – destruction **na paraḥ** none else

(The opponent:) **22.1** There is a qualitless state of the individual soul, for there is scripture on its being unattached and the rest.

(The author:) **22.2** Yet, establishing that (being unattached) as being the dharma of others, comes from non-distinguishing, **22.3** (and) the preexisting (8.3), non-distinguishing, because otherwise there is being stuck with the two faults (8.2 and 8.3). **22.4** There is no possibility of an eternal being (Brahman) having individual souls. Otherwise there is no dispelling, **22.5** which in this case is rather a counter-checking, by affirming and by negating of this (non-distinguishing), being what is destroyed by the cause being counter-checked, like darkness. **22.6** Bondage is nothing more than non-distinguishing, because of the impossibility of any other way. **22.7** For the liberated one there is no further connection with bondage at all, for there is scripture on non-recurrence. **22.8** Otherwise it is lacking what is for the sake of the soul, the implication (being) that there is no difference between the two (states). **22.9** Liberation comes from destruction of the obstacle, nothing else.

तत्राप्यविरोधः अधिकारित्रैविध्यान्न नियमः। दार्ढ्यार्थमुत्तरेषाम्। स्थिरस्सुखमासनमिति न नियमः। ध्यानं निर्विषयं मनः। उभयथाप्यविशेषश्चैत्रैवमुपरागनिरोधाद्विशेषः। निःसङ्गेऽप्युपरागोऽविवेकात्। जपास्फटिकयोरिव नोपरागः किं त्वभिमानः ॥ (restored text)

भावनोपचयाच्छुद्धस्य सर्वं प्रकृतिवत्। रागोपहतिर्ध्यानम्। वृत्तिनिरोधात्तत्सिद्धिः। धारणासनस्वकर्मणा तत्सिद्धिः। निरोधश्छर्दिविधारणभ्याम्। स्थिरसुखमासनम्

22.10 (6.21) **tatra** (loc. there) **api** indeed **avirodhaḥ** no disagreement (6.22) **adhikāri-trai-vidhyāt** (abl. because) competent, qualified – threefold – division **na** no such **niyamaḥ** definition

22.11 (6.23) **dārḍhya-artham** solidity – means **uttareṣām** (gen. of) subsequent **22.12** (6.24) **sthira-sukham** motionless – contentment **āsanam** sitting **iti** called **na** not **niyamaḥ** definition (6.25) **dhyānam** meditation **nir-viṣayam** without – sphere **manaḥ** mind **22.13** (6.26) **ubhayathā** either way **api** indeed **aviśeṣaḥ** non-difference **cet** if **na** no **evam** so **uparāga-nirodhāt** (abl. through) coloring – containment **viśeṣaḥ** difference **22.14** (6.27) **niḥsaṅge** (loc. when) non-attachment **api** even **uparāgaḥ** coloring **avivekāḥ** (abl. through) non-discriminating (6.28) **japā-sphaṭikayoḥ** (loc. in the case of) China rose – crystal **iva** like **na** no **uparāgaḥ** coloring **kim tu** but rather only **abhimānaḥ** imagining **22.15** (3.29) **bhāvanā** a mental notion **upacayāt** (abl. through) accumulation **śuddhasya** (gen. belonging to) the pure **sarvam** all of it **prakṛtivat** (vati appearing as) nature **22.16** (3.30) **rāga-upahatiḥ** interest – breaking apart **dhyānam** meditation **22.17** (3.31) **vṛtti-nirodhāt** (abl. through) functioning – containment **tat-siddhiḥ** it – accomplishing **22.18** (3.32) **dhāraṇa-āsana-śva-karmaṇā** (inst. by means of) maintaining – sitting – self – duty **tat-siddhiḥ** that – accomplishment (3.33) **nirodhaḥ** containment **chardi-vidhāraṇābhyām** (inst. including) outflowing – holding apart (3.34) **sthira-sukham** motionless – contentment **āsanam** sitting

(The opponent:) **22.10** Indeed, there is no disagreement there, (but) there is no such (22.5) definition of it, for there is (instead) the threefold division regarding who is qualified (to seek liberation) (see 20.14, 21.4).

(The author:) **22.11 That refers to the solidity of what is subsequent. 22.12 Mind without the sphere** (see "contemplation" 20.14) is "meditation", the **motionless contentment** (compare with "sleep" 20.14) is "posture", not that (your 22.10) definition. **22.13 Indeed, if you think there is no difference either way, ... well, no, there is a difference, through containment of coloring, 22.14 but rather not coloring, only imagining, like a China rose and a crystal, coloring by non-discriminating, even when there is non-attachment** (see "liberation" 20.14). **22.15 It is (merely) a mental notion that it comes from accumulation, all of it belonging to a pure one (Brahman), (appearing) as nature. 22.16 Meditation is the breaking apart of such coloring. 22.17 The accomplishment of it is through containment of the ways (YD 1.1), 22.18 which containment includes (both) the outflowing and the holding apart (YD 6.15-18), the achievement of it by means of a self-imposed karma of sitting and maintaining, that posture being the motionless contentment (not sleep).**

Motionless contentment undefined by action is the subtle body without its functioning of exertion. It is the body for karma without solidity. Mind without the sphere of experienced objects, or without being "defined" by its functioning of colored perception, represents the body for experience, without solidity. Both subtle body and mind have an uncolored state. "Either way" means mind with or without the sphere, and body with or without activity. In the living liberated person there is a tinge even in the midst of non-attachment and this represents the body for both, without solidity.

Sutra 22.18 confirms the definition of nirodha (containment; see YD 1.1) as a dual state that includes both outflowing and holding as described in YD 6.4-18, not as a state of exclusion or cessation.

Chapter Twenty-Three

The Opponent's Summation

स्वकर्म स्वाश्रमविहितकर्मानुष्ठानम्। वैराग्याद्भ्यासाच्च ॥ ध्यानधारणाभ्यासवैराग्यादिभि-
स्तन्निरोधः। लयविक्षेपयोर्व्यावृत्त्येत्याचार्याः। न स्थाननियमश्चित्तप्रसादात्। प्रकृतेरा-
द्योपादानतान्येषां कार्यत्वश्रुतेः। नित्यत्वेऽपि नात्मनो योग्यत्वाभावात्। श्रुतिविरोधान्न
कुतर्कापसदस्यात्मलाभः। पारम्पर्येऽपि प्रधानानुवृत्तिरणुवत्। सर्वत्र कार्यदर्शनाद्वि-

भुत्वम्। गतियोगेऽप्याद्यकारणताहानिरणुवत्। प्रसिद्धाधिक्यं प्रधानस्य न नियमः।

सत्त्वादीनामतद्धर्मत्वं तद्रूपत्वात्। अनुपभोगेऽपि पुमर्थं सृष्टिः प्रधानस्योष्ट्रुकुमुवहनवत्।

23.1 (3.35) **sva-karma** one's karma **sva-āśrama-vihita-karma-anuṣṭhānam** one's – stage in life – determined – course of action – undertaking (3.36) **vairāgyāt** (abl. through) dispassion **abhyāsāt** (abl. through) discipline **ca** and [(6.29) **dhyāna-dhāraṇa-abhyāsa-vairāgya-ādibhiḥ** (inst. pl. by means of) meditation – holding – discipline – dispassion – etc. **tat-nirodhaḥ** it – restraint, control *The restraint of it is by means of meditation, holding, discipline, dispassion, etc.*] (I do not consider this sutra to be authentic. It recites a list of the Yoga terms found nearby and it occurs at the juncture where 3.29-36 had been mistakenly displaced; it disrupts the logical flow of the surrounding material, whether it is placed before 3.29, or placed here, where it is not consistent with the tone or the thesis of the opponent.) (6.30) **laya-vikṣepayoḥ** (gen. of) lethargy – restlessness **vyāvṛtṭyā** (inst. by) turning away **iti** according to **ācāryāḥ** teachers **23.2** (6.31) **na** not **sthāna-niyamaḥ** station – defining **citta-prasādāt** (abl. by) thoughts – settled, settling (6.32) **prakṛteḥ** (gen. belonging to) nature **ādya-upādānatā** (fem.) primary – inclusiveness **anyeṣām** (gen. of) the others **kārya-tva-śruteḥ** (abl. known from) products – being – scripture **23.3** (6.33) **nityatve** (loc. w/api even though) constancy **api na** no **ātmanaḥ** (gen. belonging to) the individual **yogyatva-abhāvāt** (abl. because) qualification – doesn't exist, no such thing **23.4** (6.34) **śruti-virodhāt** (abl. because) scripture – misinterpretation **na** no **kutarka-apasadasya** (gen. in (belonging to)) bad reasoning, faulty speculation, nonsense – outcast, unorthodox (*metaphorically, an offspring of one of the six kinds of unfit marriage*) **ātma-lābhaḥ** individual soul – found **23.5** (6.35) **pāraparye** (loc. if) series **api** even **pradhāna-anuvṛtṭiḥ** following, subsequent to **aṇuvat** (vati as) atomic (6.36) **sarvatra-kārya-darśanāt** (abl. known by) everywhere – effect, product – seeing **vibhutam** omnipresence **23.6** (6.37) **gati-yoge** (loc. in) motion, migration – connection **api** even **ādya-kāraṇa-tā-ahāniḥ** primary – cause – being – no rejecting (*I am following Pandit Shriram Sharma in writing ahāniḥ instead of hāniḥ.*) **aṇuvat** (vati appearing as) atomic **23.7** (6.38) **prasiddha-ādhikyam** well-known, celebrated – superiority **pradhānasya** (gen. for) principal **na** not **niyamaḥ** restriction **23.8** (6.39) **sattva-ādinām** (gen. belonging to) sattva – and the others **a-tat-dharma-tvam** no – of – that – role – being **tat-rūpatvāt** (abl. because of) that – the (very) form – their being

23.9 (6.40) **anupabhoge** (loc. though) no – enjoying **api** even **pum-artha-sṛṣṭiḥ** men – for the sake of – creation **pradhānasya** (gen. on the part of) principal **uṣṭra-kumkuma-vahanavat** (vati like) oxcart – saffron – carrying

(The opponent:) **23.1** According to (us) teachers, one's karma (22.18) is through the turning away of lethargy and restlessness by dispassion and by discipline, undertaking a course of action (karma) determined by one's stage in life. **23.2** Primary inclusiveness belongs to nature, for there is scripture on the others' being her products, not the defining of their stations through settling of thoughts. **23.3** Even though there is constancy (for nature), it does not belong to an individual soul, because he has no such qualification. **23.4** Because of (your) misinterpretation of scripture, no individual soul is even found in this unorthodox nonsense. **23.5** By seeing the produced everywhere, its omnipresence as the atomic is known, even if it is as a series, (but) *subsequent* to the principal (nature). **23.6** Even in connection with (trans)migration, there is no rejecting of it (nature) being the primary cause, as the atomic. **23.7** For the principal, there is superiority to the well-known (guṇas of Vaisheshika (see Sinha, *The Samkhya Philosophy* 1915. p.541)), not restriction to them. **23.8** Being the dharma of that (principal) does not belong to sattva and the others because of their being the very form of that.

(The author:) **23.9** Creation for the sake of men, on the part of a principal, even though there is no enjoying, is like carrying saffron in an ox-cart (see 12.18).

कर्मवैचित्र्यात्सृष्टिवैचित्यम्। साम्यवैषम्याभ्यां कार्यद्वयम्। विमुक्तबोधान्न सृष्टिः प्रधानस्य लोकवत्। नान्योपसर्पणेऽपि मुक्तोपभोगो निमित्ताभावात्। पुरुषबहुत्वं व्यवस्थातः। उपाधिश्चेत्तत्सिद्धौ पुनर्द्वैतम्। द्वाभ्यामपि प्रमाणविरोधः। द्वाभ्यामप्यविरोधान्न पूर्वमुत्तरं च साधकाभावत्। प्रकाशतस्तत्सिद्धौ कर्मकर्तृविरोधः।

23.10 (6.41) **karma-vaicitryāt** (abl. from) karman – diversity **sṛṣṭi-vaicitryam** creation – diversity **23.11** (6.42) **sāmya-vaiṣamyābhyām** (abl. dual; known from) smoothness – roughness **kārya-dvayam** effect – twofold, two kinds of **23.12** (6.43) **vimukta-bodhāt** (abl. from, for) released – consciousness **na** no **sṛṣṭiḥ** creating **pradhānasya** (gen. on the part of) principal **lokavat** (vati like) world **23.13** (6.44) **na** no **anya-upasarpaṇe** (loc. when) others – approach **api** even **mukta-upabhogaḥ** liberated – experience **nimitta-abhāvāt** (abl. because)

instrumental cause – absence **23.14** (6.45) **puruṣa-bahutvam** souls – multiplicity **vyavasthātaḥ** (tasil from) allotment **23.15** (6.46) **upādhiḥ** representation (see 2.15) **cet** if (you say) **tat-siddhau** (loc. in) that – establishing **punar** again, still **dvaitam** duality **23.16** (6.47) **dvābhyām** (inst. with) two **api** indeed **pramāṇa-virodhaḥ** proof – inconsistency **23.17** (6.48) **dvābhyām** (inst. dual; with) the two **api** indeed **avirodhāt** (abl. because) no disagreement **na** no **pūrvam** former **uttaram** latter **ca** and **sādhaka-abhāvāt** (abl. because) progress – absence

23.18 (6.49) **prakāśatas** (tasil through) light **tat-siddhau** (loc. in) it – accomplished **karma-kartṛ-virodhaḥ** karman – performer – disagreement

(The opponent:) **23.10** The diversity of creation comes from the diversity of karma, **23.11** whose two kinds of effect are known from smoothness and roughness (in life), **23.12** (but) for the consciousness of the released there is no creating on the part of the principal, (appearing) as the world. **23.13** Even when there is (her) approach in others, there is no enjoyment (see 22.18) for the liberated because of the absence of that instrumental cause (desire, karma). **23.14** Multiplicity of souls is known from the allotment of life circumstances. **23.15** Even if you say it is a (mere) representation (see 7.13-14), in establishing *that*, there is still duality. **23.16** Indeed with those two (representations and mahat), there is inconsistency with the standard of proof, **23.17** because indeed with those two, because of the absence of (karmic) progress (see 1.8, 21.10), there can be no disagreement that they are not the former and the latter (effect and cause see Chapter Two).

(The author:) **23.18** In accomplishing that (progress) through the light, there is disagreement with (the doctrine of) karma and the performer.

Chapter Twenty-Four

A Review of the Two Views

जडव्यावृत्तो जडं प्रकाशयति चिद्रूपः। न श्रुतिविरोधो रागिणां वैराग्याय तत्सिद्धेः। जगत्सत्यत्वमदुष्टकारणजन्यत्वाद्वाधकाभावात्। प्रकारान्तरासम्भवात्सदुत्पत्तिः। अहंकारः कर्ता न पुरुषः चिदवसाना भुक्तिस्तत्कर्माजितत्वात्। चन्द्रादिलोकेऽप्यावृत्तिर्निमित्तसद्भावात्। लोकस्य नोपदेशात्सिद्धिः पूर्ववत्। पारम्पर्येण तत्सिद्धौ विमुक्तिश्रुतिः। गतिश्रुतेश्च व्यापकत्वेऽप्युपाधियोगाद्भोगदेशकाललाभो व्योमवत्।

24.1 (6.50) **jaḍa-vyāvṛttaḥ** dullness – rid **jaḍam** the dull **prakāśayati** he enlightens **cit-rūpaḥ** intelligence – paragon **24.2** (6.51) **na** no **śruti-virodhaḥ** scripture – disagreeing **rāgiṇām** (gen.) impassioned ones **vairāgyāya** (dat. for the sake) dispassion **tat-siddheḥ** it – establishment **24.3** (6.52) **jagat-satyatvam** world – reality **aduṣṭa-kāraṇa-janya-tvāt** (abl. known through) innocence – cause – arising – state **bādhaka-abhāvāt** (abl. through) excluding – absence **24.4** (6.53) **prakāra-antara-asambhavāt** (abl. from) ways – other – impossibility **sat-utpattiḥ** true – emergence **24.5** (6.54) **ahamkāraḥ** personal identity **kartā** performer **na** not **puruṣaḥ** person (6.55) **cit-avasānā** intelligence – stopping point **bhuktiḥ** enjoyment **tat-karma-ārjitavāt** (abl. coming from) its – (through) karman – earned – being **24.6** (6.56) **candra-ādi-loke** (loc. in) moon – etc. – world **api** even **āvṛttiḥ** return **nimitta-sat-bhāvāt** (abl. resulting from) instrumental cause – true – presence **24.7** (6.57) **lokasya** (gen. of) the world **na** not **upadesāt** (abl. by) instruction, lesson **siddhiḥ** establishment **pūrvavat** (vati as) before **24.8** (6.58) **pāram-paryeṇa** (inst. through) series **tat-siddhau** (loc. while) that – establishment **vimukti-śrutiḥ** release – scripture **24.9** (6.59) **gati-śruteḥ** (abl. known from) migration – scripture **ca** and **vyāpakatve** (loc. where) pervasiveness **api** even **upādhi-yogāt** (abl. because) representation – connection **bhoga-deśa-kāla-lābhaḥ** experience – place – time – acquiring **vyomavat** (vati like) sky, space

(The opponent:) **24.1** One who enlightens (referring to "light" 23.18) the dull is someone who has rid *himself* of dullness, a paragon of intelligence (a teacher). **24.2** There is no disagreeing with scripture, because the establishment of it is for the dispassion of those impassioned ones.

(The author:) **24.3** The true reality of the world is known through the state arising from innocence of the cause (of bondage) through the absence of its excluding (Brahman). **24.4** The emergence of the true (way) arises from the impossibility of the other ways.

(The opponent:) **24.5** The stopping point of intelligence is enjoyment, which comes from being earned through karma, the performer (being) the personal identity, not the human spirit. **24.6** His returning, even in the world of the moon, etc. (Chandogya Upanishad V) results from the presence of the true instrumental cause (karma).

(The author:) **24.7** There is no establishment of such a world by that lesson, as (it was said) before. **24.8** That is scripture about release (even) while there is establishment of that (world) through the series. **24.9** And from that

scripture on migration it is known that even while there is pervasiveness, because of his (mahat's) connection (yoga) with the representation, there is the acquisition of time, place, and experience, (but) *he* is like space (the ether).

अनधिष्ठितस्य पूतिभावप्रसङ्गान्न तत्सिद्धिः। अदृष्टद्वारा चेदसम्बद्धस्य तदसम्भवाज्जलादिवदङ्कुरे। निर्गुणत्वात्तदसम्भवादहंकारधर्मा ह्येते। विशिष्टस्य जीवत्वमन्वयव्यतिरेकात्। अहंकारकर्त्रधीना कार्यसिद्धिर्नेश्वराधीना प्रमाणाभावात्। अदृष्टोद्भूतिवत्समानत्वम्। महतोऽन्यत्। कर्मनिमित्तः प्रकृतेः स्वस्वामिभावोऽप्यनादिर्बीजाङ्कुरवत्। अविवेकनिमित्तो वा पञ्चशिखः। लिङ्गशरीरनिमित्तक इति सनन्दनाचार्यः। यदा तद्वा तदुच्छित्तिः पुरुषार्थस्तदुच्छित्तिः पुरुषार्थः

24.10 (6.60) **anadhiṣṭhitasya** (gen. on the part of) uncontrolled, non-supervised **pūti-bhāva-prasaṅgāt** smelly – existence – stuck with **na tat-siddhiḥ** that – establishing 24.11 (6.61) **adr̥ṣṭa-dvārā** (inst. through) unseen, unknown – instrumentality **cet** if you think **asambaddhasya** (gen. belonging to) unrelated **tat-asambhavāt** (abl. arising from) their – impossible condition **jala-ādivat** (vati like) water – etc. **ānkure** (loc. in the case of, concerning, with) sprout (6.62) **nirguṇatvāt** (abl. coming from) without – essential constituents – state **tat-asambhavāt** (abl. arising from) their – impossible condition **ahāṅkāra-dharmāḥ** personal identities – dharmas **hi** for **ete** these, all these 24.12 (6.63) **viśiṣṭasya** (gen. possessed of) distinction **jīva-tvam** living person – being **anvaya-vyatirekāṭ** (abl. through) affirmation – negation 24.13 (6.64) **ahaṅkāra-kartṛ-adhīnā** personal identity – (as) performer – dependent on **kārya-siddhiḥ** effect(s) accomplishing **na** not **īśvara-adhīnā** supreme governor – dependent **pramāṇa-abhāvāt** proof – non-existence, absence 24.14 (6.65) **adr̥ṣṭa-udbhūtivat** (vatup having) unseen – coming forth **samāna-tvam** same – to be (6.66) **mahataḥ** (gen. belonging to) mahat, the comprehensive one **anyat** (declined like tat) the other thing 24.15 (6.67) **karma-nimittaḥ** karma – instrumental cause **prakṛteḥ** (gen. belonging to) nature **sva-svāmi-bhāvaḥ** own – master, owner – relation **api** indeed **anādiḥ** beginningless, preexisting **bīja-āṅkuravat** (vati like) seed – sprout 24.16 (6.68) **aviveka-nimittaḥ** non-discriminating – as instrumental cause **vā** the alternative **pañcaśikhaḥ** 24.17 (6.69) **liṅga-śarīra-nimittaka** indicator – body – instrumental cause **iti** according to **sanandana-ācāryaḥ** Sanandana – teacher 24.18 (6.70) **yadvā – tadvā** one way or the other **tat-ucchittiḥ** of it – cutting

loose, breaking free **puruṣa-arthaḥ** person – desire, benefit, interest, purpose, aim
tat-ucchittiḥ puruṣa-arthaḥ

(The opponent:) **24.10 That (yoga) is not accomplished on the part of something ungoverned** (by an external governor 20.12), **because of being stuck with the existence of the smelly (body).**

(The author:) **24.11 If you think it is (accomplished) through the instrumentality of some unknown (governor (see 2.5)), then it would be like water, etc. with a sprout, for there would be all these dharmas of personal identities arising from the impossible condition of their coming from a state *without* the guṇas, arising from the impossible condition of their belonging to something unrelated. 24.12 Being a living person possessed of distinguishing, must be through the affirmation and negation.**

(The opponent:) **24.13 The accomplishing of effects *is* dependent on the personal identities (ahamkāra) as performers (of karma), not dependent on (your) supreme governor, because of the absence of proof.**

(The author:) **24.14 It is the other. It belongs to mahat to be that same (accomplisher of effects), having his manifestation arise from the unknown (potential).**

(The opponent:) **24.15 The own/owner relation belongs indeed to nature, karma (being) the instrumental cause. *That* is what is beginningless like the seed and sprout.**

(The author:) **24.16 It is the alternative of non-distinguishing as the instrumental cause, according to Pañcaśikha (the author). 24.17 It is the indicator-body as the instrumental cause, according to the teacher Sanandana (the opponent). 24.18 One way or the other, breaking free of it is the purpose of a human being.**

End of the Sankhya Darshana